RESOLUTION OF THE
RESOURCES AND DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE
$23^{\text {rd }}$ Navajo Nation Council--- Third Year, 2017

## AN ACTION


#### Abstract

RELATING TO RESOURCES AND DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE, CERTIFYING CHINLE CHAPTER'S COMMUNITY-BASED IAND USE PLAN UPDATE WHICH HAS REEVALUATED AND READJUSTED CHINLE CHAPTER'S PREVIOUS COMMUNITYBASED ILAND USE PLAN


## BE IT ENACTED:

## SECTION 1. AUTHORITY

A. The Resources and Development Committee, pursuant to 26 N.N.C. $\$ 2004(\mathrm{D})(2)$ shall certify community-based land use plans.
B. Pursuant to 26 N.N.C. S2004(D)(2), "Every five years the plan shall be reevaluated and readjusted to meet the needs of the changing community" and such readjustment is subject to the certification of the Resources and Development Committee of the Navajo Nation Council.

## SECTION 2. FINDINGS

A. Pursuant to 26 N.N.C. § 2004 (B), "Community Based Land Use Plan. The chapter, at a duly-called chapter meeting shall by resolution, vote to implement a community based land use plan, after the CLUPC has educated the community on the concepts, needs, and process for planning and implementing a community based land use plan. The community based land use plan shall project future community land needs, shown by location and extent, of areas identified for residential, commercial, industrial, and public purposes. The land use plan shall be based upon the guiding principles and vision as articulated by the community; along with information revealed in inventories and assessments of the natural, cultural, human resources, and community infrastructure; and, finally with consideration for the land-carrying capacity. Such a plan may also include the following: 1. An open space plan which preserves for the people certain areas to be retained in their natural state or developed for recreational purposes. 2. A
thoroughfare plan which provides information about the existing and proposed road network in relation to the land use of the surrounding area. 3. A community facilities plan which shows the location, type, capacity, and area served, of present and projected or required community facilities including, but not limited to, recreation areas, schools, libraries, and other public buildings. It will also show related public utilities and services and indicate how these services are associated with future land use."
B. The Chinle Chapter has submitted the Chinle Chapter Community-Based Land Use Planning Committee Five Year Land Use Plan Update. See Exhibit A.
C. The Chinle Chapter's Community Based Land Use Plan was last approved June, 2007. See Exhibit B.
D. Pursuant to the Chinle Land Use Planning Committee Resolution, attached as Exhibit C, the Chinle Chapter approved the Community-Based Land Use Plan Update by Resolution CHIN-JAN-17-008, which is attached as Exhibit D.
E. The Resources and Development Committee of the Navajo Nation Council finds it in the best interest of the Navajo Nation to certify the Chinle Chapter's Community-Based Land Use Plan Update which has been reevaluated and readjusted to meet the needs of the changing community.

## SECTION 3. Certification of Chinle Chapter's Reevaluated and Readjusted Community-Based Land Use Plan

A. The Resources and Development Committee of the Navajo Nation Council hereby certifies the reevaluated and readjusted Chinle Chapter's Community-Based Land Use Plan, attached hereto as Exhibit A.
B. Certification of this Community-Based Land Use Plan shall not delineate adjacent chapter boundaries. Any chapter disputes rest solely with the Courts of the Navajo Nation.

## CERTIFICATION

I, hereby, certify that the following resolution was duly considered by the Resources and Development Committee of the $23^{\mathrm{rd}}$ Navajo Nation Council at a duly called meeting at Chinle Chapter Chinle, (Navajo Nation) Arizona, at which quorum was present and that same was passed by a vote of 3 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstained this $14^{\text {th }}$ day of March, 2017.


Motion: Honorable Davis Filfred
Second: Honorable Leonard H. Pete


## CHINLE CHAPTER

## GOVERNMENT

December 2016


# COMPREHENSIVE LAND USE PLAN 

## Mission Statement

To inform community members of CLUPC activities and decisions through public education
and participation efforts and to establish a comprehensive land use plan including planning
for land use, community infrastructure, open space and recreation, community facilities, and public safety.

|  | 1 | I. Community Land Use Overview |  |
| :---: | :---: | :--- | :--- |
| Chinle Chapter <br> Government | 2 | II. Community Land Use Plan Elements |  |

## I. COMMUNITY LAND USE PLAN OVERVIEW

## A. INTRODUCTION

The Local Government Act (LGA) requires that Chapters wishing to administer land must develop a Community Based Plan, and that the Plan must:

1. Include projections of future community land needs, shown by location and extent.
2. Identify areas for residential, commercial, industrial and public purposes.
3. Be based upon the guiding principles and vision as articulated by the community.
4. Include information revealed in inventories and assessments of the natural, cultural, human resources, and community infrastructure as well as consideration for land-carrying capacity.

The Plan may also include the following:

1. A "Natural Resource Element" (open-space) plan which preserves for the people certain areas to be retained in their natural state or developed for recreational purposes
2. A "Iransportation Element" (thoroughfare) plan which provides information about the existing and proposed road networks in relation to land use in the surrounding area
3. A "Community Facilities Element" plan which shows the location, type, capacity, and area served, of present and projected or proposed community facilities.

## 1. Tribal Planning

Jojola (2008), stated that "tribal planning has long been based upon the principles of land tenure, management of resources, land stewardship, and sustainability" (p. 37), which, until recently, has been in direct conflict with the Western notion of land- use regulation as the primary tool in land use planning (Gromulat, 2012, p. 87).

The advancement of indigenous planning in the United States is dependent upon continuous evolution, the embracing of traditional cultural values, and innovative policy-making. Self-determination and self-governance are essential to the advancement of indigenous planning; ending the paternalistic approach that the federal government has taken in the past will hasten the flourishing tribal sovereignty that has grown stronger in recent years ( $\mathbf{p} .38$ ).

## 2. Commumity-Based Planning

Community-based planning is the current model used by the Chapters of the Navajo Nation at this point in time. Community based planning focuses on the involvement and empowerment of the community. Public participation is critical to cultural sustainability, embracing the sacred Navajo principles of nitsáhákees, nahatá, iiná and siih hasin (Gardner, Piawka \& Trevan, 2014, p. 40).

A land-use plan has to be "guided by community assessments including natural resources, cultural resources and should project future community land needs by location and extent of areas for residential, commercial, industrial and public purposes Nation was a first step in embracing the idea of community based planning" (Gardner, Piawka \& Trevan, 2014, p. 40).

## B. Chinle Chapter Government



The Chinle Chapter Government is a local government established as a Chapter under the Navajo Nation on February 14, 1956 and it is the $32^{\text {nd }}$ Navajo Chapter to be certified out of the 110 Navajo Nation Chapters. The chapter area is an approximately $114,655.60$ acres area located starting along the rim of the Canyon De Chelly National Monument at the edge of the Fort Defiance plateau and extending west to the Lohali Mesa and Bitter Water Basin at the foot of Black Mesa (2000, Chinle Service Unit Community Assessment, 23). On December $21^{\text {st }}$, 2010, the Chinle Chapter became a Local Governance Act (LGA) Certified Chapter, which is a milestone for any Navajo Nation Chapters to obtain. The Local Governance Act (LGA) was enacted by the Navajo Nation Council on April 20 ${ }^{\text {th }}, 1998$, signed into law by President Thomas Atcitty and codified into Title 26 of the Navajo Nation Code. The stated purpose of the LGA is "to recognize governance at the local level" ( 26 N.N.C. $\S 1(B)(1)$ ). The LGA intended that its implementation would "improve community decision making, ...[and allow chapters] to govern with responsibility and accountability to the local citizens" (2 N.N.C. § 1(B)(2). In cycle with the devolution of authority to local government, LGA requires accountability of government as demonstrated through internal controls. The exercise of power delegated by the LGA to governance-certified chapters require the central government to recognize the delegation rights and, in many instances, facility the actual delegation.

Chinle Chapter Government is one of the larger Chapters on the Navajo Nation with approximately 3,800 registered voters with a service area of Chinle, Arizona and smaller surrounding communities such as Del Muerto, Spider Rock, Valley Store, etc. Chinle is located
near the geographic center of the Navajo Nation reservation in northeastern Arizona, at an altitude of 5,082 feet, it is situated at the entrance to Canyon de Chelly National Monument that was once a Navajo stronghold during Colonel Kit Carson's Navajo Campaign. Chinle Chapter Government is located within Apache County and became a center for population growth and trade after 1868 when the United States signed a treaty with the Navajos. The first trading post was established in 1882, the first mission in 1904, and the first government school in 1910. Today, the community has been designated one of the major "growth centers" on the Navajo Nation by the tribal government and is an important trade, administrative, and educational center. It is an urban center within the Chinle Agency, one of five Bureau of Indian Affairs administrative jurisdictions on the reservation. Chinle continues to headquarter many federal and tribal agencies and state and local government offices.

According to the U.S. Census 2010 report, Chinle Chapter is home to approximately 8,005 residents, a slight decline from the 2000 Census of 8,294 . According to the 2006 CBLUP, approximately 4,883 residents lived in the canyon area, and the remaining population lives in what is referred to locally as the "City" of Chinle. According to Chinle Chapter staff interviews for the ASU's Recommendations for Updating the Community-Based Land Use Plans for the Navajo Nation, they reported that the Chinle Chapter Government is divided into these two areas, which are diametrically opposed in a number of ways. First of all, the "City" of Chinle has a much denser settlement pattern, with many homes built along Main Street. The geology of this region is not as rocky as the region near the Canyon, sits low near the creek, and floods often, according to local residents. It is clear to see that this area rests in the floodplain. The two areas also feature different economies. The Canyon economy is primarily one of subsistence through herding livestock, with a few of the Canyon dwellers utilizing the land for farming. The "Canyon Communities", as they are called locally, are primarily scattered homes, many without running water or electricity. The "city" dwellers, in contrast, are primarily involved in service sector or government employment for offices such as the Navajo Tribal Utility Authority (NTUA) or the local hospital.

The Chapter's certification comes as a result of its adoption of the "Five Management System" and a Community Based Land Use Plan (CBLUP) as defined in Title 26 (Local Governance Act of 1998) of the Navajo Nation Code. A precondition to governance certification is the adoption and operation of the Five Management System (FMS). The accountability process was established through the adoption of policies and procedures related to the FMS of accounting, personnel management, procurement procedures, property control, and records management. By resolution, governance-certified chapters may 1). Issue home, business and other site leases; 2). Acquire, sell or lease personal property of the Chapter house, enter into agreement for goods and services; 3). Enter into inter-chapter agreements; 4). Enter into intergovernmental agreements; 5). Enter into contracts/subcontracts with the Navajo Nation for federal, state, county and Navajo Nation general funds; 6). Acquire and appropriate funds and reallocate funds.

As part of its authority as a Certified Chapter, Chinle Chapter Government can opt to go one step further and proceed with the formation of an Alternative Form of Governance (or AFOG), according to interviews with Chapter staff (2/23/13). Chapter officials and Chapter staff
seemed to have different visions for the AFOG in Chinle. The AFOG allows the Chapter to operate in a fashion similar to a municipality by creating either a council-mayor form of government or a council- city manager form of government. The AFOG in Chinle has not yet made a decision about the form of government it wants for the Chapter, and the staff members are currently exploring the respective benefits and drawbacks of various governance structures. Staff expressed a need for change in Chapter-level planning. For example, Chapters in the nations currently view themselves are independent from each other and do not interact in the process of creating plans or even inventory the regional assets such as hospitals. Moving toward a regional approach for land use planning is supported. Another desired change is more direct communication with the Navajo Nation Government, which would enable quicker decision-making. This is one reason for the lengthy deliberation of the topic of an AFOG, which would enable stronger leadership at the Chapter government level, and provide solutions to these stated problems.

The LGA provides a number of options for the development of an AFOG for Chapters that have become certified by the Navajo Auditor General's office (Navajo Nation Code, Title 26). These options include a council style of governance, a township form of government (such as in Kayenta, which will be explored in another case study) and the formation of Chapter subunits. These forms of governance are an alternative to the Chapter form of governance that was developed in 1927 by BIA Superintendent John Hunter (Wilkins, 1999). The council form of government would grant the elected local council more authority in coming to decisions, whereas the Chapter form of governance provides the Chapter President broad authority over the agendas of the Chapter and decision- making authority over the issues that will be addressed during the Chapter meetings. The council form of government is also advantageous in that the council can move forward Chapter level legislation without the need for a 25 -person quorum, as is required without the AFOG (Hale, 2012).

If Chinle were to adopt the AFOG, this would allow the CLUPC to move forward with relative ease in the update process, especially in terms of the passage of ordinances to adopt the CBLUP. The AFOG also has benefits in empowering the local government to hasten decisionmaking, appoint CLUPC members, and more.

## C. Community Setting

Chinle Chapter Government (Chapter) is strategically centralized on the Navajo Nation and is the entrance to one of the Navajo national park which is Canyon De Chelly. This unique location has various commerce and tourist advantages and direct benefits. Canyon de Chelly, a geological and historical wonder is Chinle's greatest scenic attraction. Designated a National monument in 1931, the canyon was inhabited by Native Americans as early as 2,000 B.C., as evident by the artifacts and many prehistoric cliff

dwellings located along the beautiful red sandstone walls. The rock formations change colors from brilliant red-browns to orange, pink, and even purple changes in the angle of the sun throughout the day.

The Chapter and its community are geographically situated seventy miles west of Window Rock, Arizona along State Route 264 and US highways 191. This State Route is the main thoroughfare between Tuba City, Arizona and Window Rock, Arizona and on into New Mexico. The Chapter is within the Chinle Agency administrative area. The Chapter enjoys the unique status of being a Local Governance Certified Chapter pursuant to Title 26 of the Navajo Nation Code. The Governance Certified status became effective on December $21^{\text {st }}, 2010$.

The name Chinle translates literally as "flowing out" since the community naturally flows out of the Canyon and has become an economic center for the region, largely due to visitors who come to view and explore the Canyon and learn about Navajo culture. The Chapter, as a community, has accepted this stream of commerce and now welcome the opportunity to thoughtfully preserve our culture and share it with the world. The Chapter anticipates great opportunities for our residents and for the larger community. (Building Nations, 2013)
Chinle Chapter Government's community is a fascinating mixture of time-honored traditions and modern amenities of the Western world. Our local Diné artisans and entrepreneurs prominently display and market Navajo art and other native fare for tourists and other visitors. Luxurious, recreational motor homes move cautiously along Highway 191 amid the free grazing territory of cattle, sheep and horses. Added to that traffic are our busy residents going about their lives, as they haul water, buy feed for their livestock, take children to school, go to work and keep this busy economic center going. (Building Nations, 2013)

Surrounding this activity are the wind-swept vistas of red, pink, yellow and brown. This spectacular landscape provides continuity to our people that is unique. Its existence has nurtured and protected Navajo culture, tradition and our people, and affects the way in which we have done our planning.

The Chinle Land Use Plan Committee (CLUPC) chose to identify the "urbanized" area as the City of Chinle in order to differentiate it from the Chinle community. The Chinle community is used to mean all of the people residing in the Chapter Area or the entire Chapter. The Canyon Communities are defined as those Chapter areas within the Canyon de Chelly complex, along the Canyon rims and to the east of the Chinle and Nazlini Washes.

## DESCRIPTION OF THE THREE COMMUNITIES

Planning for the Chapter area was conducted for three separate areas: The Canyon del Muerto Community, the Spider Rock Community and the remainder of the Chapter. The Canyon del Muerto and Spider Rock Communities have been combined and are referred to at the Canyon Communities.

The Canyon Communities comprise all of the eastern sections of the Chapter area starting at a point near the mouth of the Canyon de Chelly complex. Included are the main canyons, and the smaller branch canyons off of them: De Chelly, Del Muerto, Three Turkey, and Sheep Dip to the north. The area also includes the canyon rims and the flatter areas and mesas that extend south and north of the canyons.

The Canyon del Muerto Community is considered to encompass the canyon, the cluster of homes and community buildings along the north rim and the flatlands extending north and including Sheep Dip Canyon and the Ram Pasture areas.

The Spider Rock Community includes Canyon de Chelly, the south rim, and areas around Three Turkey Canyon.

The remainder of the Chapter, including the urbanized area of Chinle, the Beautiful Valley and Nazlini Valley areas, the area along U. S. Highway 191 to Many Farms, Ventana Mesa and the Red Cliffs area are covered in the Chinle sections of the Plan.

## D. Community land Use Plan Overview

Chinle Chapter Government's Community Land Use Plan presents the desired future community \& economic development, enhancement, and local community-based and revitalization directions.

The Community Land Use Plan is the Chapter's "blue print" for land use and development, as well as conservation and preservation; it serves as the basis for rational decisions regarding the local community's long-term physical development and the protection of the Chinle community's natural and cultural resources. The Community Land Use Plan expresses the Chinle Chapter Government's development goals and embodies public policy relative to the distribution of future land uses, both public and private. The goals, policies, and programs of the Community Land Use Plan are intended to underlie most land use decisions. Preparing, adopting, implementing, and maintaining a Community Land Use Plan serves to:
$\rightarrow$ Identify the local community's land use, transportation, environmental, economic, and social goals and policies as they relate to land use and development.
$\rightarrow$ Provide a basis for decision-making, including decisions on development approvals.
$\rightarrow$ Provide local community members with opportunities to participate in the planning and decision making processes of the community.
$\rightarrow$ Inform local community members, developers, decision makers, and adjacent communities of the ground rules that govern development within the Chinle Chapter Government.

Community Land Use Plans typically have three (3) defining qualities. First, they are general in nature, providing general guidance for the future, particularly regarding growth and development. More precise direction is provided in implementation documents and plans, such as annexations, zoning codes and other ordinances, design regulations, annual budgets, and
capital improvements program (see discussion below). Second, Community Land Use Plans are comprehensive in scope, addressing a broad range of environmental, social, and economic factors that affect how communities change over time. These factors include land use and circulation, environment and natural resources, economic and fiscal conditions, as well as a host of others. These factors should be addressed in an interrelated and, wherever possible, consistent manner. Third, Community Land Use Plans address the long-range future of communities. While they may take immediate concerns into consideration, they focus primarily on the future.

## E. Sustainable Chapter...Planning for the Future

Through the course of preparing the Community Land Use Plan, the Chinle Chapter Government continued to focus on the theme of sustainability. There is widespread recognition in the local community that the Community Land Use Plan must establish a framework of sustainability to ensure that current and future generations can sustain the social, economic, and environmental health of the Chinle community. This will entail continuous review and evaluation to ensure that the actions taken in implementing this Plan are consistent with this intent, and that the pre-eminent focus of the Plan should always be on the needs of Community members, both now and in the future.

In 1998, the Navajo government passed the Local Governance Act (LGA) which permits Chapters to be "certified" resulting in greater autonomy in their financial and decision-making actions among other local matters. This legislation is transformative as it gives significant empowerment to local decision-making and a strong role of community members in governance. The legislation is also important to planning in that it provides authority to the Chapters to administer and manage the lands within their jurisdictions and produce community land use plans.

The LGA was promulgated in 1998 as a way to decentralize authority from the central government toward greater local control and decision-making based on local culture and traditions. The critical point for this study is that the LGA also instructed Chapters that these plans were to be updated every five years. The principal reason for this study is to examine the existing plans and identify problems and barriers to effective plan-making, in order to provide guidelines for updating plans.

## Certification and AFOG

Certification under the Local Governance Act of 1998 holds many advantages and should be pursued. Among these advantages are greater funding, more autonomy from the Navajo Nation government, the ability to appoint members to the CLUPC, and perhaps most importantly, the ability to form an Alternative Form of Government (AFOG). An AFOG can enable the Chapter government to form a stronger local governing structure and create policy without the need for a quorum of 25 Chapter members present for decision-making. Empowering the local government in this way will enable accelerated decision- making. (Gardner, Piawka \& Trevan, 2014, p. 19).

Since Chinle Chapter Government became certified under the Local Governance Act (LGA) on December 21, 2010 that provides it more autonomy and power. As part of its authority as a LGA certified chapter, Chinle has the opportunity to proceed with the formation of an Alternative Form of Governance (AFOG) that will allow the Chapter to operate in a fashion similar to a municipality by creating either a council-mayor form of government or a councilcity manager form of government. Although currently Chinle Chapter Government has not yet made a decision about the form of government it wants for its community and the administration and officials are currently exploring the respective benefits and drawbacks of various governance structures. Eventually the implementation of AFOG will enable stronger leadership at the Chinle Chapter Government's government level and provide alternative solutions to various barriers.

Although it is recommended that zoning and eminent domain be used at all times when land development for economic development or for housing is being initiated. According to the Arizona State University (2014), "it is interesting to note that many of the Chapters stated that they knew that eminent domain was available as a tool for enforcing the community's wishes, but that at this time it is not culturally embedded, and therefore not often used" (p. 19). Zoning early defines the proposed future land use on a certain site, for example, commercial zoning typically allows retail and office buildings, while residential allows only apartments or homes. When zoning is in place throughout a community, it is easier for all parties involved in the land development process to understand what the people of that the community have envisioned for the future.

This land use plan updates satisfies the land use certification process and forwards the Chinle Chapter Government to effectively and collaboratively managing and making future decisions regarding local matters pertaining to land uses. In addition the land use plan articulates that "the land use plan serves as a guide for future development and provides a foundation for zoning ordinances ... it also allows the Chapter to evaluate potential development projects while balancing the diverse needs of the community with concerns, cultural traditions and natural resources... a solid land development plan is needed" (Gardner, Piawka \& Trevan, 2014, p. 19).

## F. Methodology

## 1. Community Assessment (Socioeconomic \& Demographic Analysis)

As part of the community assessment, Chinle Chapter Government performed disparate levels of socioeconomic and demographic analysis. Socioeconomic and demographic analysis was conducted for the purpose of building a solid understanding of the Chinle community's core features and structures in addition to the social and economic features that is a combination of the body of the community assessment section.

The updating of Chinle Chapter Government's CLUP reviewed process started with a community assessment phase that summarizes the Chinle community's key social, demographic and economic conditions. Updated data on the number and size of households, population size,
gender distribution, age, workforce and other common identifiers are used to characterize the Chinle community.

The primary data are those derived from quantitative and qualitative analytics, such as Chinle CLUP's Community, Business, Mission and Tribal Program surveys. The CLUP includes community survey data including satisfaction, quality of life and other interview approaches techniques. The secondary data were derived from third-party sources; the most common example is U.S. Census data and Navajo Nation/Chinle research based studies, ie. feasibility or economic development reports.

Chinle Chapter Government's 2015 CLUP was evaluated for its individual merits and deficiencies within each "Eiement." Particular attention was paid to the approach or methodology provide within each Element. Content analysis was performed by comparing word usage, the amount of attention paid to particular subjects (such as NAHASDA, Navajo Nation's Overall Economic Development Strategies, Apache County's Chinle Economic Development Report), and the quality of analysis when compared with recommendations from the planning literature. The CLUP and its element were development and/or updated individually compared with literature from contemporary rural, tribal and urban planning and comprehensive planning, but also incorporated the "best practices" with the other land use plans, such as the Salt River Indian Community's General Plan. Triangulation of this knowledge with local CLUPC members, officials, and administration staff assisted the determination of various outcomes from the planning process, and identify strengths and weaknesses in these processes. Overall, updates and recommendations made the revised CLUP were based upon findings from the literature, the reviews of the CBLUPs, community surveys, CLUPC meetings/work sessions, focus groups and interviews conducted over a period of approximately six (6) months.

## 2. Survey Development \& Methodology

TPBCS and Chinle Chapter Government's Administrative staff and volunteers will conduct personal surveys to approximately 388 local Chinle and surrounding local residents/community members. The community survey included topics such as growth management, affordable housing, natural resources conservation, renewable energy, transportation, infrastructure development, agricultural and economic development. As part of the general land use plan updates, TPBCS proposed changes in existing land uses and planned land uses as allowed under the general Plan update, and consistency with tribal, federal and state plans and policies.

TPBCS's overall methodology approach included: first, TPBCS reviewed the technical requirements to simply understand the proposed requirements of the community land use plan. Secondly, TPBCS explored the proposed various urban, tribal and rural land use models after assessing the current land use need and the Chinle Chapter Government's CLUPC ability to revise and execute the plan.

TPBCS utilized primary research that is defined as "factual, firsthand accounts of the study written by a person who was part of the study. This is a scientific methods that is typically considered original research" (Kowalczyk, D., 2014, p. 2). The data collection
technique that was utilized through the development of the attached "Chinle Chapter Government's Community Survey" (including business, mission, and tribal program focused surveys) that were administered through personal interviews and by utilizing Constant Contact ${ }^{\text {TM's }}$ s online survey software program.

## 3. Conduct Literary Review (Secondary Research)

A literature review includes researching published information in a particular subject area within a certain time period and location. TPBCS researched and assessed topics such as land use planning, strategic land use plans, land use plan models, elements development, tribal planning, etc. Our literature review was more than just a simple summary of the sources, but was coordinated as an organizational pattern and combined both comprehensive summary and synthesis. The "references" documented in this CLUP are secondary research references, maps and related pertinent research that are relevant to updating Chinle Chapter Government's CLUP.

## G. Community Land Use Plan's Community Survey

The Chinle Chapter Government's Comprehensive Land Use Plan (CLUP) Community Survey had 388 respondents that filled out the comprehensive survey that indicated that the Chapter was in the process of updating the current Land Use Plan. The Chinle Land Use Planning Committee (CLUPC) proceeded to update the Land Use Plan Element of the Chinle CLUP to protect quality of life in the local community and ensure that it remains a community where residents choose to live, work, and play. Through the initiation of the "Community Survey" (Appendix D: Community Survey), the CLUP members and Chapter administration asked community members to provide feedback which were collected from the community survey that will aid the Chapter in understanding the priorities of its citizens and thus developing a future land use plan based on community needs.

The responses will assist the CLUPC create and update their plan for the community that will guides future development and responds to Chinle's residents' needs. The questions found in this community survey pertain to current and future land use in Chinle and aimed to gather input on issues, concerns, or aspirations regarding the comprehensive elements encompassed within land use. The survey was conducted TPBCS and two (2) community members from April 2015 to July 2015 and the results were inputted into the ConstantContact® online software for tabulation and assessments.
(1) A majority of the respondents regarding the importance of the Chinle Community to the local residents showed a majority $64 \%$ or 250 rated the "strong sense of community pride" as "most important" and followed closely as "somewhat important" with $26 \%$ or 102 respondents. Sixty-three percent (63\%) or 248 community members stated that "public participation in the community" was "most important" while "diversity among residents and neighbors" rated only forty-four percent ( $44 \%$ or 174 ) and "maintaining the community in its current state" was above average with a fifty-six percent ( $56 \%$ or 218 ) that indicated it was "most important." (2) Residents ranked the "quality of life" aspects such as healthy \& safe community as "most important" (76\% or 296); residents of housing for varying age \& income
level ranked "most important" (62\$ or 242); diversity in houses of worships pulled in the lowest amount of scores and percentages for the "most important" category ( $44 \%$ or 173); and increase in family time well overall had the highest combination ratings of "somewhat important" ( $28 \%$ or 110 ) and "important" ( $58 \%$ or 227 ).

Chinle Chapter Government's official planning for future development should concentrate and "strongly promote" farmland preservations ( $65 \%$ or 255 ); residential development ( $67 \%$ or 262 ); recreational facilities ( $70 \%$ or 274 ); employment opportunities ( $78 \%$ or 303); small business and/or economic development ( $72 \%$ or 280 ); educational institutional development ( $73 \%$ or 287 ); churches/religion purposed ( $72 \%$ or 279 ); youth recreational center/activities ( $75 \%$ or 293); and senior citizen center/program development ( $72 \%$ or 281 ).

Some of Chinle Chapter Government and community's major issues and concerns specified are first, the loss of farmland and/or agricultural activities ( $85.0 \%$ or 329 responses); second, the environmental degradation in the community (i.e., erosion, storm water run-off, etc.) $(72.6 \%$ or 281 responses); third, the lack of recreational opportunities ( $69.2 \%$ or 268 responses) and finally, the amount of development in the Chinle community as a whole ( $60.9 \%$ or 236 responses). Supplementary issues and concerns that were recommend included the establishment of animal shelters; recycling centers; upgrade road (develop a preventative road system); develop a preventative vodaphone improvement; shelters for [alcoholics] and strays; bigger grocery stores; and the encourage of Navajos investing in apartment [complexes]. (18) A majority of the respondents rated police services ( $24 \%$ or 95 ); fire services ( $29 \%$ or 115 ); ambulance services ( $30 \%$ or 119 ); electrical services ( $36 \%$ or 139 ); recycling ( $29 \%$ or 114 ); and emergency services ( $30 \%$ or 119 ) as "satisfactory" as public services within the Chinle community. However, cable services ( $31 \%$ or 120 ) and high speed internet and/or public wifi access were rated above "very satisfactory." Additional public service recommendations were potential projects such as animal's shelters, recycling centers, alcoholic rehabilitation center, invest in apartments, and upgrading areas to develop "preventative roads improvements.

A majority of the respondents rated police services (24\% or 95); fire services ( $29 \%$ or $115)$; ambulance services ( $30 \%$ or 119 ); electrical services ( $36 \%$ or 139 ); recycling ( $29 \%$ or 114 ); and emergency services ( $30 \%$ or 119 ) as "satisfactory" as public services within the Chinle community. However, cable services ( $31 \%$ or 120 ) and high speed internet and/or public wifi access were rated above "very satisfactory." Additional public service recommendations were potential projects such as animals shelters, recycling centers, alcoholic rehabilitation center, invest in apartments, and upgrading areas to develop "preventative roads improvements.

Nearly fifty percent ( $50 \%$ ) of the respondents preferred that business and/or economic development should remain in current or expired business site lease and thirty seven percent (37.1\%) stated that business should be located in the proposed and/or approved Chinle's business corridor or location. Approximately, twenty three percent ( $23.6 \%$ or 86 responses) specified that they have "no opinion" while another four (4.6\%) didn't want any further economic development endeavors in Chinle. Community member's comments included
everywhere (lots of land available); land that hasn't been used for over ten (10) years; and add new mixed town designs similar to urban settings.

The most important proposed project to be considered by the Chinle Chapter Government by 388 local residents were 1) new youth recreational facility (48\%); 2) new senior center (42\%); 3) irrigation systems improvements (45\%); 4) water line extensions (41\%), and 5) new pre-schools were rated most important proposed projects for Chinle. The least important project for the chapter to consider was the establishment of a new airport that ranked last with a $28 \%$ rating score. Additional proposed project suggested by community members included the establishment of an animal shelter (5); homeless shelters (3); car wash (4); new police station (1); paved flea market roads (1); restaurants (1); and retail outlets such as Wal-Mart and a Dollar Tree store.

The top three (3) actions that were recommended by 388 respondents for the Chapter Officials and/or Navajo Nation Programs to consider that will improve the Chinle community and considered "most important" were to work with the grazing permit holders (52\% or 201); work with other chapters on regional projects ( $47 \%$ or 184); and both with a strong rating of "important" were to develop zoning codes (33\%) and establish Range Management Units (RMU)(45\%). Other top actions items that were provided included developing employee housing and improve water system; establishing animal shelters; and addressing illegal dumping [sites].

The other top three (3) actions recommended by the 385 survey respondents that the individuals households and family can get involved in to improve the Chinle community are 1) respect and obey all tribal resources law ( $61 \%$ or 237 respondents); 2) take an active role in the Chinle Chapter Government (55\% or 214 respondents); 3) obey all permit regulations (51\% or 199 respondents); and with the less than importance rating percentage scores of $37 \%$ and $43 \%$ were to work with officials to maintain agriculture and regarding self-employment opportunities. Again the variance between a majority of the listed actions were very close between "most important" and "important" therefore all the potential actions would be considered as important and viable recommendations. Alternative top actions recommended by community members comprise of making sure all obey government rules; taking classes at local schools and higher education; work with community to have more say so in the chapter's new planning and updates; keep it clean; paved roads; in need of more JIMIs; and addressing [panhandlers] at Bashas.

Expressing the community members' own opinion regarding Chinle community development unanimously agreed on the following actions were essential 1) that Chinle community must work closely with the Chapter to reach community goals and objectives ( $60 \%$ or 234 respondents); 2) the Chinle Chapter Government takes the appropriate measures to preserve and protect open spaces, forestland, and recreational opportunities (58\% or 227 respondents); and 3 ) Chinle Chapter Government guides development in the appropriate areas
within the community ( $56 \%$ or 220 ); and 4) at $49 \%$ or 190 respondents, Chinle community has to maintain utilizing the prior comprehensive land use plan as guidance for land use decision.

Other general suggestions and/or opinions stated by the respondents included livestock (round-ups and on highways)(2); improve the quality of roads (paved) (6); establish human/animal shelters (3); recruit Wal-Mart (5); and address lack of homes (residents/professionals), water system, security for shoppers/reduce panhandlers, and acknowledging Chinle needs improvements.

## a) Community Participation \& Surveys

According to Gardner, Pijawka \& Trevan (2014), community participation procedures varied greatly throughout these plans and in some cases, CBLUPs only mentioned the process in passing; in others, a detailed community participation program was initiated (p. 126). Community education led to buy-in the planning process by community members, as they understood the importance of the process to themselves and individuals as well as the implications for the community in general; and finally, community education was cited as an inspiration for change. (Gardner, Pijawka \& Trevan, 2014, p. 126)

Part of Chinle Chapter Government's community assessment included developing and initiating a comprehensive "Comprehensive Land Use Plan Community Survey" in additional to other specific types of data are also analyzed during this process. "Primary data" are those derived from quantitative and qualitative analytics, often produced by the principal investigator contracted for the planning process. The plans included community survey data including satisfaction, quality of life and other interview approaches. "Secondary data" are derived from third-party sources; the most common example is U.S. Census data or the Navajo Nation Division of Economic Development's research in additional to governmental or research databases. The community assessment section can also include an analysis of the needs of the community over time based on projected population estimates.

Moreover, community surveys of Chinle Chapter Government's households provide data beyond what is typically found in demographic, housing, and economic Census databases and can enhance public input into needs identification and community goals. The comprehensive community surveys that included tribal programs, non-profit and mission were utilized to improve the validity of visioning and participatory processes particularly in the Chinle vicinity. In this case, four (4) separate surveys were developed along the lines of articulating preferences for developing Element goals and strategies for the land use plan.

Chinle Chapter Government used a survey approach to gain indigenous public opinions and information on the direction to take regarding program development, housing, community and economic development. For example, several questions targeted the kinds of development the Chinle Chapter Government should pursue and invest in; or if the community members felt there was enough land set aside for industrial, economic and/or commercial development; and, what infrastructure investments would improve economic development. These communitybased assessment surveys resulted in obtaining significant and widespread responses from community members that filled in the gaps in various transportation, infrastructure, economic
development, natural resources, preservation, agricultural, and community facilities elements. In contrast to these kinds of survey topics, the Chinle Chapter Government's surveys documented information about community members, living conditions, and sentiments to improve quality of life or address local self-sufficiency. The four (4) separate but pertinent surveys contained questions regarding demographic, educational levels, household annual income, household size and other socio - demographic factors; housing conditions/preference (i.e., scattered, clustered, etc.); problems with utilities including water delivery systems, internet services, electricity, sewer and gas systems; and information on grazing rights and business site leases.

## H. Community Vision and Values

At Arizona State University's CLUP training, the Chapter's administration, officials and CLUPC members revised the 2006 CLUP vision statement. When presented with the prior vision statement, many of the Chinle Chapter membership stated that this was no longer a relevant statement given the current conditions in 2013. When asked for relevant changes to the current version, Chinle community members offered the explanation that elderly members of the community are focused on traditional ways and preservation of their lifestyle through land, and the youth of the Chapter are often educated off of the reservation, and bring back ideas from their education that include a certain style of development and governance. Chinle community members explained the desire to find a balance between the two schools of thought.

Through the course of the outreach efforts conducted for the Chinle Chapter Government's Community Land Use Plan update, the local community identified a series of recurring themes or core values that exemplify the Chapter. These themes or values collectively constitute the Vision for the future.

> Chinle Chapter Government CLUPC's vision of the community is to improve and preserve the quality of life for its Dine community members. The ongoing commitment will include the promotion and preservation of self-determination and sovereignty, well-planned economic growth leading to financial security, a spiritually, and physically healthy environment and a dedication to education.

This vision includes the preservation of our values and traditions and the passing of our ancestors' wisdom to future generations. While clearly involved in many aspects of the Chinle community, our Navajo elders fulfill an especially important role regarding the preservation of values and traditions.

Community elders will tell us that in the Navajo culture planning is a foreign concept. As [the community] have wrestled with the need to plan and the need to honor tradition, we have chosen the tradition of the Wedding Basket to help community members identify with the concept of planning. Traditionally, the Wedding Basket is viewed as a map through which the Dine'--the Navajo people--chart their lives. This basket is then filled with the important and
necessary "tools" for an abundant and beautiful life. Our vision for Chinle is a vibrant, thriving community where the traditions of our fathers are maintained, while we continue to lead our people into economic prosperity and individual self-sufficiency. This plan is our basket filled with the blend of traditions, as well as new knowledge that will help us to remain true to our culture and responsible to future generations. (Apache County)

There are several challenges for Chinle as we look to the future. Most of those challenges are linked to tribal policies. The Navajo Nation's LGA (Local Governance Act) certification will allow the Chapter to move in a more autonomous direction, circumventing layers of bureaucracy. Moving forward the Chinle Chapter Government can respond to the needs of our community effectively.

## II. COMMUNITY LAND USE PLAN ELEMENTS

## A. Overview

The balance of this document consists of the Community Land Use Plan "elements," that are the Chinle Chapter Government's Chinle Land Use Planning Committee (CLUPC)'s endorsed statements of local community land use and development policy. These elements are as follows:

1. Land Use Element: Establishes the framework for orderly physical development and environmental protection
2. Transportation Element: Provides for an efficient community transportation system for the safe and efficient movement of the local community members, tourist and residents.
3. Housing Element: Promotes a mix of potential housing selections for local community residents/members while enhancing alternative housing opportunities.
4. Natural Resources Element: Outlines the local community's policy commitment to use the Chinle's natural resources for the long-term well-being of current and future community members.
5. Preservation Element: Provides direction to preserve and maintain the Chinle community's sacred and valued cultural resources.
6. Community/Economic Development Element: Provides guidance for developing and maintaining the Chinle community's potential commercial areas, particular the proposed business corridors. This element also presents strategies to expand the Chinle Chapter Government's economy to ensure sustainable development that promotes the standard of living and self-sufficiency for local community members.
7. Agricultural Development Element: Reinforces the Chinle's community's commitment to continued diversification and enhancement of agriculture and agri-business opportunities.
8. Infrastructure Development Element: Provides direction to ensure that adequate infrastructure is available to support current and future Chinle community members, enterprises and economic development initiatives.
9. Community Facilities Element: Provides direction for providing services and developing Chinle's community amenities and facilities that enhance the quality of life for local residents and community members.
10. Community Land Use Plan Administration: Describes how the Plan will be administered over time, including such issues as exceptions, amendments, and periodic reporting on the progress of the Plan's implementation.

The "elements" includes a series of goals that are related to key topics. Under each goal is a set of policies/strategies intended to guide the achievement of that goal. At the end of each element are several action/implementation measures that identify the actions necessary to effectively implement the Community Land Use Plan. The following definitions describe the nature of the statements of goals, policies, and the implementation measure as they are used in this Plan:
$\rightarrow$ Goal: The ultimate purpose of an effort stated in a way that is general in nature and immeasurable.
$\rightarrow$ Strategies/Actions: A specific statement in text or diagram guiding action and implying clear commitment. Strategies/Actions are nested under each goal and they correspond with their goal and the sequence of policies under that goal.

## 1. LAND USE PLAN ELEMENT

## A. Land Use Purpose Statement

The Land Use Element serves as the long-range planning guide for development within the Chinle community by indicating the location and extent of development to be allowed. More than any other element, the Land Use Element will have a major impact on the form and character of Chinle for the next five (5) years. The Land Use Element is the overall set of guiding principles for the Chinle Chapter Government's Community Land Use Plan. It's intended to establish a Collaborative Foundation for the orderly physical development and environmental protections of the Community where desired and protected areas the community members would like to see no development occur. It provides a complementary mix of uses to accommodate residents, public institutions, commerce, and traditional cultural activities.

The Land Use Element functions as a guide for Chinle Chapter Government's CLUPC members and officials (both elected and/or appointed), the general public, the development community, and other interested parties as to the ultimate pattern of development. The "Land Use Element" has the broadest scope of the elements and plays a central role in correlating all land use issues into a set of coherent development policies that relate directly to the other plan elements.

## B. Community Land Use Element Overview

The essential components of the Land Use Element are the Community Land Use Plan Map (Appendix 8: Chinle Overall Map) and the goals also policies that guide future development. While the Community Land Use Plan Map may be seen as the most essential component of the entire 2015-2020 Community Land Use Plan, it is basically a graphic representation of the policies expressed by all of the current Community Land Use Plan's elements. Users of this document are advised to refer the policies as well as the procedures when evaluating proposed Development and Capital improvement projects.

## C. Goals and Policies

Community Planning System

| Goal 1.1: To improve community planning capabilities and capacity within the Chinle Chapter |
| :---: | :--- |
| Government's community. |


| 1.1.2 | Coordinate the Chinle community's planning activities among departments, programs, and entitlements that are responsible for planning, improving, and maintaining the Chinle Chapter Government's community's infrastructure and facilities. |
| :---: | :---: |
| 1.1.3 | Maintain consistency between the Community Land Use Plan and the CLUP's Zoning Ordinance(s). |
| 1.1.4 | Maintain a current land use inventory including a listing of future roadway projects. |
| 1.1.5 | Promote involvement of the Chinle community members in the land use and development decision-making process by ensuring effective use of mechanisms that maximize opportunities for direct participation. |
| 1.1.6 | Monitor development along the Chinle Chapter Government's community boundary to ensure that encroachment from adjacent communities does not occur. |
| Strategies/Actions |  |
| 1 | Develop and update the Chinle Chapter Government's community zoning ordinances to ensure consistency with the Community Land Use Plan. |
| 2 | Enhance the Chinle Chapter Government's community "Capital Improvements Plan" (CIP) to identify needed infrastructure and facilities improvements and potential funding sources and programs and establish an implementation time-line. |
| 3 | Prepare and maintain an up-to-date land use inventory using the Chinle Chapter Government's community's GIS. |
| 4 | Develop a priority list of Bureau of Indian Affairs land that requires relinquishment. |
| Residential Development |  |
| Goal 1.2: To identify land suitable for residential development to accommodate the housing needs of the community members. |  |
| 1.2.1 | Designate sufficient land in appropriate locations to the development of housing to accommodate the needs of the Chinle Chapter Government's community members, including "life-cycle" opportunities ranging from starter homes, to multifamily housing, to large-lot rural housing, to congregate care facilities for the elderly. |
| 1.2.2 | Seeking opportunities to accommodate viable residential developments to accommodate the housing needs of local community members. |
| 1.2.3 | Plan for and develop infrastructure in appropriate areas of the community to promote quality residential housing development. |
| Strategies/Actions |  |
| 1 | Develop a strategy for prioritization of purchases of land from willing landowners and/or grazing permittees. |
| Environmentally Sensitive Areas |  |
| Goal 1.3: To protect environmentally sensitive areas in the community. |  |
| 1.3.1 | Ensure that new development does not damage or compromise the value of environmentally sensitive areas within the community. |
| 1.3.2 | Protect open space areas from development. |
| 1.3.3 | Require sand and gravel operations to leave excavation areas with slopes that can |


|  | be revegetated. |
| :---: | :---: |
| Strategies/Actions |  |
| 1 | Support and initiate the development of a "Master Plan" for the corridor areas. |
| 2 | Adopt and maintain preservation regulations to govern land use in areas designated as preserves and other culturally and environmentally sensitive areas. This should include consideration of appropriate levels of access to the community's preserved areas. |
| Culturally Sensitive Areas |  |
| Goal 1.4: To protect culturally sensitive areas in the community. |  |
| 1.4.1 | Ensure that new development does not damage or compromise the value of cultural significance in the community. |
| 1.4.2 | Engage community members, as appropriate, when there is potential development near sacred or historic areas in the community. |
| Land Use Compatibility |  |
| Goal 1.5: To avoid or mitigate incompatibility between land use in the Chinle community. |  |
| 1.5.1 | Ensure that use of effective buffering techniques adjacent to the landfill and sand and gravel mining operations to protect adjacent development and open space areas. |
| 1.5.2 | Ensure that existing residential areas are adequate protected from encroachment by incompatible uses. |
| 1.5.3 | Ensure that the visibility of existing commercial and industrial operations is not compromised by introduction of incompatible uses. |
| 1.5.4 | Encourage the orderly and efficient placement of home sites. |
|  | Strategies/Actions |
| 1 | Develop policy standards for commercial, industrial, and retail development to ensure compatibility with adjacent development and open space areas. |
| General Community Design |  |
| Goal 1.6: To ensure that the built environment is appealingly and compatible with the natural surrounding and the Diné cultural values. |  |
| 1.6.1 | Maintain development and design a guideline that ensures high quality design in all New and Renovated Development in the community. |
| 1.6.2 | Promote architectural themes and project site design that reflects Navajo and/or Native American cultural values and blend the built environment with natural surroundings. |
| 1.6.3 | Require new development projects to explore solutions that employ natural materials and prohibit designs that channelize watershed except where extreme threats to public safety would exist if the watershed were not channelized. |
| 1.6.4 | Requiring all development proposals depict an arrangement of and massing of buildings and/or arrangement of lots to minimize impacts on views from adjacent properties and streets and from properties and streets internal to the proposed project while providing privacy for residents. |
| 1.6.5 | Require that all development proposals employ design strategies that minimize |


|  |  |
| :---: | :--- |
| changes to existing topography and the disturbance of existing vegetation. |  |
| $\mathbf{1}$ | Develop a "Community's Development and Design Guidelines" that will include <br> design review procedures. |
| $\mathbf{2}$ | Prepare informational material that describes the Chinle Chapter Government's <br> culturally- based design expectations to prospective developers. |
| Environmentally Sensitive Design |  |$|$| Goal 1.7: To achieve environmentally stewardship in the design and construction of all public <br> and private projects. |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| 1.7 .1 | Incorporate the principles of Green Building to create environmentally responsible, <br> profitable, and healthy places to live and work. <br> This should include the following: <br> $\checkmark$ <br> $\checkmark$ <br> Sustainable sites (brownfields, site disturbance, storm water management) <br> $\checkmark$ <br> Water efficiency (efficient landscaping, use reduction) <br> Energy \& Atmosphere (energy performance, renewable energy, and green <br> power) <br> Materials \& Resources (building reuse, recyclable materials, local materials) |
| 1.7 .2 | Actively support the achievement of LEED (Leadership in Energy \& Environmental <br> Design) green building. |
| 1.7 .3 | Promote site planning and architectural design that reduces heating and cooling <br> demands. |
| $\mathbf{1}$ | Establish and/or adopt a "green building" program within the community <br> government to provide guidance to the development community concerning <br> sustainable design. |
| $\mathbf{2}$ | Organize and manage a community-based group to initiate and monitor <br> sustainability programs, regulations and to assist in educating community members <br> concerning such programs and regulations. |

## D. Chinle Overall Map



## 2. TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT

## A. Transportation Purpose Statement

The "Transportation Element" is intended to provide a multi-modal transportation system for a safe and efficient movement of the Chinle community members, employees, tourists, and visitors and to provide a safe and efficient multi-modal system. This element is to provide safe and efficient modes of transportation, and to improve transportation, identify transportation needs, and advocate for transportation issues of the Chinle community; to collaborate on issues between the Navajo Nation and transportation entities; and, to resolve problems concerning transportation issues among transportation entities.

The overall purpose of the Transportation Element is to plan for and provide a system of design for:
$\rightarrow$ Existing and proposed major streets;
$\rightarrow$ Distinguish between limited access, primary and secondary thoroughfares; and
$\rightarrow$ Relate major thoroughfares to the road network and land use of the surrounding area.

This plan will help the Chinle community make decisions regarding:
$\rightarrow$ Allocation of resources for road improvements and maintenance;
$\rightarrow$ Location of new facilities and buildings; and
$\rightarrow$ Emergency planning.

## B. Transportation Element Overview

As with the Land Use Element, the policy content of the Transportation Element is conveyed through a combination of mechanisms.

Overall, the purpose of the Transportation Element is to set forth a plan for future road improvements. In addition, the plan provides a system of and design for major streets/highway/roads, existing and proposed, distinguishing between limited access, primary and secondary thoroughfares, and relating major thoroughfares to the road network and land use of the surrounding area.

An understanding of land uses is important because land use influences travel patterns. Land use is integrated with transportation since land use decisions affect transportation systems and can increase viable options for people to access opportunities, goods,
services, and other resources to improve the quality of their lives. In turn, multi-modal transportation decisions may have effects on existing and future land use demand, choices, and patterns. Coordinating land use and transportation planning and development is imperative to "Smart Growth" and sustainable development of communities (Kimley-Horn \& Associates, 2012, p. 5).

This section provides an overview of existing and planned land use within the study planning area. Existing land uses are shown in the map below also includes enlargement insets of the Chinle Chapter Government growth areas.


Source: Navajo DOT

## C. Community Land Use Plan’s Community Survey

On the ranking of the community's "mobility and transportation" concerns; the "accessible to public transportation" and "safety for walking and biking" factors equally rated high in both "somewhat important" (66\% or 66) and "important" (76\% or 296). Linkage to
"regional and/or reservation-wide transportation opportunities" deemed "important" to the community members with a high ranking score of ( $70 \%$ or 271 ); although "maintaining the existing community roadways" was considered the forth "important" factor, it still pulled in a high raking score of ( $66 \%$ or 256 ) from community members.

Other general suggestions and/or opinions stated by the respondents included livestock (round-ups and on highways)(2); improve the quality of roads (paved) (6); establish human/animal shelters (3); recruit Wal-Mart (5); and address lack of homes (residents/professionals), water system, security for shoppers/reduce panhandlers, and acknowledging Chinle needs improvements.

## D. Goals and Policies

| Roadway Systems |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Goal 2.1: To maximize roadway safely and mobilize for community residents while enhancing the community's identity and provide access to the commercial vicinity. |  |
| 2.1.1 | Plan for and maintain a roadway network that links residents to their destinations within and beyond the boundaries of the community in a safe and efficient manner. |
| 2.1.2 | Support acquisition of right-of-ways sufficient to ensure development of a roadway network that provides for the safety and mobility of Community residents. |
| 2.1.3 | Cooperate with adjacent communities to ensure safe and secure access to commercial areas in the Community. |
| 2.1.4 | Address and prioritize the roadway system within the Chinle community that needs improvements such as pavement, etc. (ie N8095, N8091, Three Turkey Canyon Road, etc.) |
| 2.1.5 | Address bridge improvements to N8081 and N8095. |
| 2.1.6 | Address roadway upgrade of Chinle Cemetery Access Road by placement of aggregate material upon it and possibly the parking lot area. |
| 2.1.7 | Secondary routes to be improved upon and possibly have aggregate material placed upon them include roads N8095 and N8086. |
| Strategies/Actions |  |
| 1 | Study roadway design and traffic control strategies for mitigating cut- through traffic in the Community. |
| 2 | Continue to coordinate with adjacent communities and the Navajo Nation to ensure safe and efficient roadway linkages also, to ensure that Chinle Chapter Government benefits from its fair share of roadway funding. |
| 3 | Review the current process for acquiring and managing rights-of-way (R.O.W) to provide direction on securing, utilization, and provision of (R.O.W) needed. Based on this review, develop policies and regulations for effective (R.O.W) management. |
| 4 | Advocate for paved road on Sawmill Road (N7) between Chinle \& Sawmill. |
| 5 | Advocate for traffic and safety improvements on Hwy 191 within the urbanized area of Chinle such as fencing issues and roadside upkeep of foliage. |


| 6 | Address Hwy 191 (Chinle to Many Farms)'s inadequate for traffic load. |
| :---: | :---: |
| 7 | Address bridge construction to N8095 and N8081. |
| 8 | Support the install of culvert and graveling of Chinle Cemetery access road. |
| Transit Systems |  |
| Goal 2.2: To increase transit options and improve services for community members, employees, tourists and visitors. |  |
| 2.2.1 | Continue to operate and expand as necessary with a focus on providing services to the transit dependent (e.g., elders, disabled). |
| 2.2.2 | Work with the Navajo Nation Transit program to coordinate routes and improve connectivity, convenience and options. |
| 2.2.3 | Support privately-provided transit services to support the travel needs of employees and visitors, including shuttles connecting activity centers within and adjacent to the community (e.g., hotels, restaurants, bed and breakfasts, etc.) |
| 2.2.4 | Work with the Navajo DOT/Transit and adjacent jurisdictions to determine the demand for and feasibility of establishing additional transit services. |
| 2.2.5 | Provide a safer transportation system through the input of Apache County District 1, BIA and Navajo DOT. |
| 2.2.6 | Chinle Municipal Airport and following plans laid forth with the Master Site Plans with NDOT - Airport Division. |
| Strategies/Actions |  |
| 1 | Develop a "transit master plan" for the Chinle community and surrounding vicinity. |
| 2 | Transportation: <br> a) Provide better roads (improve dirt and paved roads). <br> b) Provide better pedestrian connections including all weather access routes and sidewalk |
| Non-Motorized Transportation |  |
| Goal 2.3: To ensure the development of safe facilities to accommodate non-motorized Transportation. |  |
| 2.3.1 | Encourage non-motorized travel opportunities within the Community, with an emphasis on accommodation of the needs of Community residents and employees. |
| 2.3.2 | Require the installation of bike lanes (where appropriate) as part of new road construction projects. |
| 2.3.3 | Where pavement width allows, designate bike lanes through striping. |
| 2.3.4 | Improve roadway shoulders to accommodate pedestrians and bicyclists where roadway width does not allow designated lanes. |
| 2.3.5 | Installing more streetlights to improve safety such as the illumination of N7 with Solar Street Lights from Junction of US Hwy 191/N7 to Holiday Inn, for length of 2.1 miles; A Pre-scoping was conducted by ADOT. |
| 2.3.6 | Create more recreational opportunities for Chinle community members, tourist and visitors to improve the health and quality of life of the community. |
| Strategies/Actions |  |
| 1 | Develop a "trails master plan" to connect activity areas for pedestrians, bicyclists, and equestrians within the Chinle community. |


| 2 | Supporting the sidewalk and bicycle land to promote walkability for pedestrian safety and healthy living. |
| :---: | :---: |
| 3 | $\rightarrow$ Identify potential areas for walking/running \& bike trails. <br> $\rightarrow$ Support and promote the establishment of a Fair Ground to include a new rodeo ground \& pow-wow facility. <br> $\rightarrow$ Support and promote the development of an RV park. |
| Transportation Plan \& Standards |  |
| Goal 2.4: Establish a long-term plan for roadway improvement and public transportation. |  |
| 2.4.1 | Members will work together and partner on transportation issues, share information about transportation programs, funding sources and network on the best approaches in dealing with transportation bureaucracies. |
| 2.4.2 | Continue to promote roadway improvement projects that have been funded and are in the process of being upgraded, proposed or developed. |
| 2.4.3 | Members need to research secondary transportations plans such as the ChinleMany Farms' Multimodal Long Range Transportation Study. |
| 2.4.4 | Develop a roadway inventory for all future developments: <br> $\rightarrow$ Truck bypass coming off N27 toward N7 where installation of truck bypass merging into the new Airport Road, N8094 and allowing large semis to travel off and back onto US Hwy 191. |
| 2.4.5 | The construction of future projects and the impact or bearing it will have on roadways such as the Navajo Division of Public Safety where the elongation of existing roadway N105 will be lengthened to accommodate heavy road traffic from N27 and this roadway will be merged into N7; Needs to be encompassed on the BIA Road Inventory and listed as a TTIP project for FY17 through NDOT. |
| 2.4.6 | Promote N7 consideration for paving beyond its current point and that roadway runs beyond the Three Turkey area and can provide an alternative path for traffic flow into Ft Defiance, AZ by way of Sawmill, AZ. |
| 2.4.7 | Support the development of encompassing of a fourth turning lane, west side, at the junction of US Hwy 191/N7 where development will bring about easier traffic flow from that spot and potential spot to the North of existing Burger King. |
| Strategies/Actions |  |
| 1 | To actively participate and seek federal, state, and local funding, technical assistance and training. |
| 2 | To promote safe and efficient modes of transportation. |
| 3 | To raise awareness of tribal transportation issues. |
| 4 | N64 will be upgraded with re-compaction, and resurfacing with magnesium chloride. |
| 5 | Chinle Valley Road (896) will be upgraded (re-compaction \& resurfacing with magnesium chloride) |
| 6 | Prairie Dog Road will be upgraded with re-compaction and resurfacing with magnesium chloride. |
| 7 | N27 is being paved from Chinle(N27/N7) to end of pavement at Nazlini. |
| 8 | N7 will be paved from Spider Rock to Sawmill Chapter boundary |


| 9 | Improvements to US Highway 191 are in the planning stages. |
| :---: | :--- |
| 10 | Support access road development to the community cemetery site in addition to and <br> laying of aggregate material upon NR8526. |
| 11 | Support the merging of N105 after County Road 464 was relinquished and given to add to <br> BIA inventory |
| 12 | Pursue the establishment of the Chapter Road Inventory listing/GIS Rural Address efforts <br> that will identify all roads within the Chinle community. |
| 13 | Support the N7 Solar Street Light Project. |
| 14 | N7 (N27 Road cosmetic for increased traffic flow along N27) Scheduled for 2016-17. |
| 15 | Centralized fencing along US Highway 191 in Chinle vicinity to prevent livestock access to <br> roadway. |
| 16 | Include additional bridges for roads N8081 and N8095 to be included within the TTIP for <br> NDOT listing and funding. |

## D. Chinle District Roadway Map

Chinle District Roadway Map


Developed by Antero Group 2016

## 3. HOUSING ELEMENT

## A. Housing Purpose Statement

"The Housing Element" is targeted at ensuring that Community members have access to a full range of housing opportunities.

## B. Housing Element Overview

The Housing Element's goal is to attain "Safe and Decent housing" for all members of the Chinle community through an analysis of available sites, and assistances to the development community, also, addressing local constraints, while conserving existing stock, and promoting equal opportunity.

According to Gardner, Pijawka \& Trevan (2014), the importance of population projections, demographic and socioeconomic (for public provided housing) analysis, and citizen preference, thought community-based surveys and community participation is vital to the development of appropriate housing options (p.222). An analysis of local housing needs were performed through investigation of recent NHA's housing reports, census data, collected socioeconomic data, projections, and identified preference of the community members from within the community meetings or requesting housing assistance from different housing programs on the Navajo Nation.

In recognition of the dire economic situation of residing on the Navajo Indian reservation, the overcrowded nature of Dine housing, the lack of solid waste management systems, indoor plumbing, homelessness, and an excessive poverty rates requires the Chinle Chapter Government to promote new housing opportunities; and to encourage rehabilitation and/or preservation of current community members' existing housing stock.

Scattered housing is preferred by many members of the Navajo Nation, stated to be closest to the traditional way-of-life, but this can be expensive to provide infrastructure to, especially utilities, such as waterlines and electricity. Clustered housing, generally based on clans of extended families, alleviates some of the cost-prohibitive features of scattered housing while still allowing for grazing to occur near home-sites, and is not susceptible to the social ills of subdivision style housing. Lastly, subdivision style housing, with curvilinear, planned streets and small lots in a concentrated pattern, is seen as a more efficient way to provide utilities, infrastructure, and housing, but has been associated with social ills such as gang activity and litter (Gardner, Pijawka \& Trevan, 2014, p. 222). Integrating housing with economic and/or community development is an "up most" important consideration.

## C. Community Land Use Plan's Community Survey

Those potential economic or housing development projects that community members think Chinle needs that were "allow but not encouraged" were similar to those people agreed on; for example: light/heavy industry \& manufacturing also, duplexes were in the thirty (30) percentage ranges. Additional housing needs such as mobile home parks; multi-family residence; single-family residences; and scattered homes were highly "agree" on by a majority of the respondents. Additional comments included assisted living programs; retail/shopping outlets; affordable homes for low-income residents; additional employment opportunities; tourism businesses; and overall better homes, improve transportation system, and an increases of local businesses.

Community members preferred for new Chinle housing development locations and/or sites in the following order, 1) Existing BIA locations; 2) Existing NHA locations; 3) Existing Indian Health Service locations; 4) Upgraded new mixture use of town design (commercial, office, residential); 5) "No opinion"; and 6) home site or scattered locations. Alternative responses included to locations such as south of Chinle; areas where "no one using their land for grazing"; "new area development" and "break ground elsewhere away from Churches Chicken".

According to the 380 community respondents, the "Most Important" Chapter specific housing_project was developing "New Subdivisions" with a high rating score of $48 \%$ or 183 ; secondly, with a rating percentage score of $36 \%$ or 137 respondents was "new clustered sites for housing" that followed by "scattered sites for housing" ( $33 \%$ or 126). However, in each category the neutral ratings followed closely to the most important ratings which indicated that a majority of the community members considered housing development within the community an important and worthy project for the Chapter to consider. Respondents' comments ranged from several BIA, NHA and alternative locations within Chinle and out of Chinle's vicinity.

## D. Goals and Policies

## New Housing

Goal 3.1: To promote new housing opportunities for Chinle Chapter Government community members (including Canyon Communities).

| 3.1.1 | Assist Chinle community members to address land ownership issues that make new <br> residential/housing development difficult. |
| :---: | :--- |
| 3.1.2 | Review and improve the homesite withdrawal process to encourage an increased <br> in home building and ownership. |
| 3.1.3 | Address Chinle's housing for special needs group (additional assisted living <br> facilities, shelter home, homeless shelter, group homes for youth/children, half way <br> house, elderly group homes, adult living community and nursing homes). |
| 3.1.4 | Increase affordable housing rental and long-term rentals for health workers and <br> other employees. |
| 3.1.5 | Increase efforts in identifying land for housing development by NHA, with sites to <br> be determined and whether these sites are clustered or possibly even clanship |


|  | pods |
| :---: | :--- |
| 3.1.6 | Promote housing development off N27. |
| Strategies/Actions |  |
| $\mathbf{1}$ | Encourage the development of scattered home plans that will allow for an efficient <br> and safe development pattern. (Scattered Housing, etc.) |
| $\mathbf{2}$ | Provide opportunities for housing programs that provide financial literacy programs <br> and financing opportunities. |
| $\mathbf{3}$ | Develop an education program and public service announcement to help homebuyers <br> purchase safe and well-conditioned homes including mobile homes. |
| $\mathbf{4}$ | Review and improve the home site leasing withdrawal process to encourage <br>  <br> other housing resources). |
| $\mathbf{5}$ | Encourage family clusters of homes i.e. mobile homes, houses, including Hogan's as <br> the preferred development patterns for homes on the reservation (in forms of one- <br> acre home-site sub-divisions). |
| $\mathbf{6}$ | Develop zoning ordinances that addresses development in open space areas. <br> (Housing Development) |
| $\mathbf{7}$ | Collaborate with housing service providers to establish housing projects within the <br> Chapter, such as Navajo Housing Services, Indigenous Community Enterprises, <br> Veterans Homes and others. |
| $\mathbf{8}$ | ldentify at least three (3) potential housing sites for Navajo Housing Authority <br> (NHA): <br> a) Recommend scattered homes such as clan pods, cluster, etc. |
| $\mathbf{9}$ | Assist and advocate for the proposed Chinle Public School teachers housing thirty- <br> six (36) acres to continue the partnership with Navajo Housing Authority (NHA). |
| $\mathbf{1 0}$ | Support new facilities consisting of Chinle Nursing Home for 120 bed care facilities.    <br> Housing Rehabilitation and Preservation    <br> Goal 3.2: To rehabilitate and/or preserve the Community's existing housing stock    <br> $\mathbf{3 . 2 . 1}$   Encourage Community members to invest in rehabilitation of substandard housing <br> and residential properties. |
| $\mathbf{3 . 2 . 2}$ | Promote sound housing investments on the part of Chinle Chapter Government's <br> community members. |
| $\mathbf{3 . 2 . 3}$ | Set up an annual Housing Fair for the community. |
| $\mathbf{1}$ | Update housing assessment to determine the needs for housing development and <br> improvements. |
| $\mathbf{2}$ | Develop a housing rehabilitation and preservation strategy that includes a menu of <br> financing vehicles for housing rehabilitation and home improvements and an <br> incentive program for housing rehabilitation for Chinle community members. |

## E. Chinle Housing Parcels



Developed by The Antero Group (2016)

## 4. NATURAL RESOURCES ELEMENT

## A. Natural Resources Purpose Statement

"The Natural Resource Element" is to promote the conservation and protection of natural resources and guide the acceptable use of resources. In additionally to protect and enhance the local natural resources for present and future generations.

## B. Natural Resources Element Overview

The majority of the land in the Chinle Chapter Government's community is currently considered "open space", and provides habitat, drainage, scenic views, and ecosystem processes that support recreational, commercial, and traditional cultural living. The community and the National Park Services maintains active programs to facilitate the regulatory reviews that are required to protect cultural and natural resources.

## C. Community Land Use Plan's Community Survey

Concerns regarding the community's "environment issues" such as "clean air" and "clean water". Both scored "most important" with a $82 \%$ or 321 number of respondents; "preservation of wildife habitat" recorded (Highly) important with a high percentage of 71\% (275); saving energy resources $69 \%$ or 268 considered it most important, as well. The last three (3) factors such as exploring alternative form of energy production; reduction of waste; and solar panel \& energy production marked an average percentage of $53 \%$ of approximately 208 respondents.

On Chinle's land development with [1] being the most important to [5] being the least important; a majority of the 384 respondents considered "natural beauty of the area" ( $68 \%$ or 264); "areas of traditional land historic importance" (51\% or 198); "agricultural land" ( $55 \%$ or 215); and "residence areas" ( $58 \%$ or 224); rated "very important." Current facilities at Chinle/surrounding community ( $42 \%$ or 163 ) and "highway corridors available for development" ( $43 \%$ or 169 ) respectfully were the least importance with a less than fifty percentile ( $50 \%$ ).

Some of Chinle Chapter Government and community's major issues and concerns specified are first, the loss of farmland and/or agricultural activities ( $85.0 \%$ or 329 responses); second, the environmental degradation in the community (i.e., erosion, storm water run-off, etc.) ( $72.6 \%$ or 281 responses); thirdly, the lack of recreational opportunities ( $69.2 \%$ or 268 responses) finally, the amount of development in the Chinle community as a whole ( $60.9 \%$ or 236 responses). Supplementary issues and concerns that were recommended including the establishment of animal shelters, also, recycling centers, foremost, the upgraded roads (develop a preventative road system). Develop a preventative "vodaphone" improvement; shelters for [alcoholics] and
strays; bigger grocery stores. All in all, encouragement of Dine people making investments towards apartments [complexes].

Expressing the community members' own opinion regarding Chinle community development unanimously agreed on the following actions to be considered were essential 1) that Chinle community must work closely with the Chapter to reach community goals and objectives ( $60 \%$ or 234 respondents); 2) The Chinle Chapter Government takes the appropriate measures to preserve and protect open spaces, forestland, and recreational opportunities ( $58 \%$ or 227 respondents); and 3) Chinle Chapter Government guides development in the appropriate areas within the community ( $56 \%$ or 220 ); and lastly, 4 ) at $49 \%$ or 190 respondents, Chinle community must maintain utilizing the prior comprehensive land use plan as guidance for land use decisions.

## D. Goals and Policies

## Balanced Uses

## Goal 4.1: To balance land uses and recreation activities with the continued integrity of ecological processes.

4.1.1 Protect scenic and recreation areas within the Chinle Chapter Government community.
4.1.2 Enforce appropriate levels of access to the Chinle Chapter Government community's environmentally and culturally sensitive areas.
4.1.3 Maintain an open space network to preserve native vegetation and provide adjoining wildlife corridors.
4.1.4 Re-vegetate disturbed areas with indigenous plant species.
4.1.5 Integrate developed area landscaping with open space areas.

Strategies/Actions
1 Develop an Integrated Resource Management Plan (Range Management Units). Chapter Grazing Official shall provide a recommendation for grazing and open space areas.
2 Identify the resources and coordination necessary for the Navajo Nation Rangers' program to include enforcement in environmentally and culturally sensitive lands.
3 Develop zoning ordinances that addresses developments in open space areas for new project development and to include looking into current developed areas to see if alignment can be done as well as make modifications to existing developed areas/sites.
4 Identify areas for potential development, not to be developed and restricted.
5 Projected Water Table information and what does Chinle currently operate on and how statistics on water wells within the Chinle Area including water collection sites and how they are used, whether for Construction Projects, Agriculture or Human and Livestock usage.
6 Obtaining information on BIA land as well as BIA leases and having these lands and leases turned over to the Navajo Nation for Trust Land Status so that the Chinle Chapter can determine its usage for future community development and
improvement. Also to have all leases made into Navajo Nation Business Site Leases with the intent that in the future the chapter will have the option of overseeing these leases, if they choose to venture that way.

## Water Resources

## Goal 4.2: To protect the Chinle Chapter Govermment's community water resources.

4.2.1 Protect surface water, groundwater and wellheads.
4.2.2 Promote strict compliance with pesticide use application procedures and ordinances while increasing awareness.
4.2.3 Improve storm water management.
4.2.4 Maintain natural drainage ways for potential water recharge areas, whenever feasible.
4.2.5 Preserve the Biological integrity and prevent any further degradation of Chinle Chapter Government's Ecosystem.
4.2.6 Other canyon systems located within the Chapter needs land restoration and preservation such as erosion and/or eradication.

## Strategies/Actions

1 Identify recharge areas and limit the type of development in those areas.
2 Identify potential areas for water wells, to include water testing and approximation of that water well's lifespan.
3 Identify priority areas along the "wash/river" for preservation.
4 Manage recreation and traditional uses that might affect the Chinle community's ecosystem through an adaptive management approach.
$5 \rightarrow$ Develop a plan for land restoration that includes and integrates the water shed study, 100/500 year flood study and joint management plan to analyze and implement studies for the Chinle Community.
$\rightarrow$ Identify the boundaries of the affected land preservation areas.

1. Contact the Navajo Nation Water Resources Department, Navajo Nation Land Department, Department of Agriculture, US Army Corps of Engineers, etc. for technical assistance and potential funding opportunities on land restoration and preservation efforts.
2. Research and obtain current plans and studies pertaining to the development of a land restoration and preservation plan.

## Range Management

Goal 4.3: To provide sustainable range management.
4.3.1 Sustain the viability of the Chinle Chapter Government community's range area for wild horses, cattle and sheep.
4.3.2 Protect forage and native plans in range areas through harmful weed management. (i.e. different kind of weeds through hay, etc.) Through NPCS identified mechanical control, biological control to be done on Navajo Nation. Has "not" been tested on Navajo Nation. Conduct \& continue to educate the public i.e. Workshops. BIA integrated Weed Management plan including other departments from Natural Resources.

Strategies/Actions

1 Support efforts to increase the public's understanding and stewardship of Wildlife, Natural Communities, and other natural resources through partnership with tribal/non-profit organizations.
2 Promote future developments that will occupy and re-use spaces between existing and pre-developed areas.
3 Work with Soil \& Water Conservation District, USDA, and other pertinent entities.
4. Revise \& review the Navajo Nation Resource \& Development Committee amend Canyon de Chelly's National Monument Joint Management Plan.
$4 \rightarrow$ Provide educational workshops on "preservation" efforts.
$\rightarrow$ Reseed rangeland with seeds and plants native to the area to help restore and conserve the land at the Badland location.
$\rightarrow$ Recommend to the Soil \& Water Conservation District to install spreader dikes along the washes to help increase the amount of water that seeps back into the local water table.
$\rightarrow$ Request assistance from USDA and the Navajo Nation Water Resources Department to help plan and implement land restoration.

## Wildlife Preservation and Protection

Goal 4.4: To support \& preserve the Chinle community's Wildlife habitat areas.
4.4.1 Where feasible, restore wildlife communities to their historic levels.
4.4.2 Encourage the usage of native plants in landscaping.
4.4.3 Ensure continued protection of the Community's wildlife.
4.4.4 Land preservation is needed in the bottom lands within the Canyon de Chelly's system.

## Strategies/Actions

1 Incorporate indigenous plant lists into the Chinle's community's development and design guidelines as developed by Diné College.
2 Develop an educational program for preserving these areas.
3 Continue to Collaborate with the Navajo Nation Park and Recreation Department, as well, other resources to plan and implement land restoration projects.
$\rightarrow$ Collaborate with Navajo Nation Park and Recreation Department.
$\rightarrow$ Encourage the development of a Farm Board (non-profit incorporated) for the Canyon areas from the Department of Natural Resources.
4 Rehabilitate of lands South of Navajo Route 102 and west of US Highway 191.
a) Restoration area for demonstration, restoration project through Soil and Water Conservation Districts and USDA.

## Solid Waste

Goal 4.5: To reduce Solid Waste to maximize use of existing solid waste facilities within the Chinle Chapter Government's community.
4.5.1 Promote recycling in Chinle Chapter Government operations and enterprises also to encourage Community residents to recycle.
4.5.2 Work towards eliminating illegal dumping within the Chinle community.
4.5.3 Determine community illegal dump site areas and begin to map and list these and secure funding to remediate these areas and offer public education on keeping these areas free of any future dumping.
4.5.4 Educate community members how to compost green waste.

## Strategies/Actions

1 Establish a recycling program for Tribal government and all enterprises.
2 Continue enforcement of the community's illegal dumping ordinance.
$3 \rightarrow$ Identify potential sites for small landfills for residential usage.
$\rightarrow$ Request assistance from Navajo Nation in remediating small landfills.
4 Identify illegal dump sites, such as:
a) West Mesa
b) Tse Da lina (Red Reservoir)
c) Nazlini Wash
d) Chinle Wash
e) End of Airport (gleesh haa geed)
5 Development and expansion of existing transfer station to become a recycling center and also to encompass fencing of up to two (2) acres of land for this effort.

## Pollution Control

Goal 4.6: Protect human and environmental health from the harmful effects of pollution.

### 4.6.1 Conscientious stewardship of Mother Earth's resources and reduce pollution. Strategies/Actions

1 Support alternative means of transportation such as carpooling, fixed route mass transportation programs, bicycle and pedestrian pathways, and other forms of lowfuel consumption transportation.
2 Encourage, without detriment to natural resources, the use of clean alternative energy sources and technologies, such as active and passive solar technology and wind turbines, to reduce or eliminate the input of Fossil Fuel Emissions into the Atmosphere and Conserve Energy.
3 Promote green, sustainable, building practices for public and tribal buildings by promoting Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) certification and other similar programs.
4 Support the renovation and expansion of the current transfer state into a recycling center for additional solid waste disposal.
5 Identification by OEH/NTUA/IHS on the capacity of existing sewer lagoons and determine feasibility site for future lagoon.
6 Inquire and develop plans for the water capacity within Chinle as determined NTUA on how well is the operation and future water well development in conjunction with Apache County.
7 Getting Navajo EPA as well as other entities dealing with Pollution to come to Chinle Chapter and present to the public at-large. Creating opportunities for the public to become educated and taking that information home and beginning their own efforts to be conscientious about pollution efforts.

## 5. PRESERVATION ELEMENT

## A. Preservation Element Purpose Statement

The Preservation Element provides direction for conserving, maintaining, and enhancing the cultural and historic values of the Chinle Chapter Government community.

## B. Preservation Element Overview

The Chinle Chapter Government's community is Rich in cultural and archaeological resource. The actual number and sensitivity of cultural and archaeological sites throughout the community is unknown. The specific discoveries often would accompany construction or other surface-disturbing activities. Chinle Chapter Government's community members [acknowledge that the] elderly members of the community are focused on "traditional ways and preservation" of their lifestyle through land. Although, the Youth of the Chapter are often educated off of the reservation, and bring back ideas from their education that include a certain style of Development and Governance (Gardener, Pijawka \& Trevan, 2014).

## C. Goals and Policies

| Historic \& Archaeological Resources |
| :---: | :---: |
| Goal 5.1: To balance land development with protection of historic properties and |
| archaeological sites. |$|$| 5.1.1 | ddentify, Evaluate, Preserve, and protect significant historic properties and <br> archaeological sites within the Chinle Chapter Government community. |
| :---: | :--- |
| 5.1.2 | Ensure all construction projects are in compliance with Federal and Tribal <br> preservation laws and policies. |
| 5.1 .3 | Require environmental, archaeological, and cultural review and clearance for all <br> development projects. |
| 5.1 .4 | Avoid or mitigate impacts of historic properties or archaeological sites when <br> development occurs. |
| 5.1.5 | Preserve and promote the historic character and archaeological significance of the <br> Chinle Chapter Government community. |
| 5.1 .6 | Protect traditional, sacred sites, and cultural areas within the Chinle Chapter <br> Government vicinity from damage or intrusion by growth and development. |
| 5.1 .7 | Address land Restoration need in the canyon bottom lands within the Canyon de <br> Chelly system. |


| Strategies/Actions |  |  |
| :---: | :--- | :---: |
| $\mathbf{1}$ | Identify and maintain a limited-access inventory of all historic properties and <br> archaeological sites within the Chinle Chapter Government community. |  |
| $\mathbf{2}$ | Assess and evaluate historic buildings, structures, districts, and archaeological <br> sites to determine their eligibility for inclusion on the National Register for <br> Historic Places/Navajo Nation Historic Preservation. |  |
| $\mathbf{3}$ | Collaborate with the National Park Services \& Navajo Nation Historic Preservation <br> administration to plan and implement land restoration projects. |  |
| $\mathbf{4}$ | Identify the Boundaries of the land preservation areas such as Red Cliffs (Red Rock <br> Rim). |  |
| Cultural Use |  |  |
| Goal 5.2:To preserve Unique cultural areas for continued and future use by cultural and <br> traditional practitioners. |  |  |
| $\mathbf{5 . 2 . 1}$ | Promote the identification of areas that are suitable venues for Traditional and <br> Cultural events and Activities. |  |
| $\mathbf{5 . 2 . 2}$ | Establish an effective approach to protecting sites by coordinating preservation <br> efforts with the Navajo Nation Division of Economic Development/Regional <br> Business Development Offices, Tourism, as appropriate. |  |
| $\mathbf{5 . 2 . 3}$ | Protect view sheds to and from significant sites to the extent practicable. <br> $\mathbf{5 . 2 . 4}$Preserve traditional and cultural sites within the Chinle Chapter Government.   <br> Strategies/Actions   <br> $\mathbf{1}$   <br> Continue to collaborate with Chapter Elders and Traditional Practitioners to <br> identify areas for preservation \& protection in order to stay up to date, add these <br> into the land use and open space plans, in addition to those sites identified with <br> Navajo Historic Preservation.   <br> $\mathbf{2}$  Enforce buffer zones (as identified by the Nation Park Services) around these sites <br> and maintain land use planning to protect them. |  |

## 6. COMMUNITY \& ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ELEMENT

## A. Purpose Statement

"The Community \& Economic Development Element" provides general direction for initiatives to expand the Chinle community's economy by encouraging sustainable economic, industrial and micro-enterprise development and to raise the standards of living for members.

## B. Community \& Economic Development Element Overview

The Arizona Department of Commerce has published a Community Profile for Chinle which highlights its employment structure, labor force data, growth indicators, population, weather and economic activities. Chinle, located near the geographic center of the Navajo Indian Reservation in Northeastern Arizona, is situated at the entrance to Canyon de Chelly National Monument. Chinle became a center for population growth and trade after 1868 when the United States signed a Treaty with the Navajos. The first trading post at that time was established in 1862, the first mission in 1904, and the first government school in 1910. Today the community has been designated one of the major "growth centers" on the Navajo Reservation by the tribal government and is an important trade, administrative, and educational center. Chinle, is reported to be an Urban center within the Chinle Chapter (a local government unit) and is Headquarters for the Chinle Agency "one of the five Bureau of Indian Affairs administrative Jurisdictions on the reservation". As such, Chinle is headquarters for many Federal and Tribal agencies and State and local government offices.

The Navajo Nation and Chinle Chapter Government's long-term economic goal is to achieve tribal self-sufficiency and thereby to improve the overall quality of life of every Navajo member by creating a Diversified, job-generating private sector capable of supporting and increasing new job creation efforts every year. This Economic initiative is to be accomplished by fostering the Development of both Navajo and non-Navajo businesses and industries on the reservation. The major objective in meeting with this goal is to massage the local economy by enhancing or establishing a local and regional economic base and that encourages Navajo people to invest their dollars in their people and the local economy. By developing such a private sector, the Navajo Nation will be able to eventually reduce its support on the Federal Government.

Chinle Chapter Government's objective will be to encourage, foster, and support private business within and surround the Chinle community that are owned and operated by community members, and to plan for and encourage private land development owned by tribal members. This includes the recruitment of outside businesses to establish operations within the community while offering local employment opportunities to community members. The
local business and economic development program should be designed to foster education, Entrepreneurship and leadership development growth in rural small business and economic development ventures. The current administration and officials can develop a dynamic program to rekindle dormant visions, refresh current leadership and empower emerging Navajo entrepreneurs and leaders to create avenues for Native Americans to learn business development techniques to either promote or start their own small businesses. This proposed program will be designed for the Chinle residents and other reservation-based tribal community members who wish to "own and operate" their own business within the community.

## C. Economic Development \& Capacity Building

The Economic Data are also imperative for the development of policies and programs to address the economic needs of the community within the region. Understanding the base of the economy is necessary in order to grow the local or regional economy, and comparison of basic and non-basic sectors in an economy is important in determining the necessary businesses for the growth of the economy. (Gardner, Pijawka \& Trevan, 2014, p. 129).

Integrating housing with economic development is an important consideration, as well. as it stands, housing is the sole focus of many [CLUPs], often to the detriment of other types of development. Planning for whole communities, with services, housing, infrastructure, and community facilities is vital to the success of comprehensive land use planning in the Navajo Nation.

Economic and commercial development is vital to the resilience of a region, and must be made a priority in the updated [CLUPs]. A vibrant mix of businesses and employment are essential to a functioning economy and create a tax base that is less vulnerable to economic shocks. Unemployment on reservations is "more than double" or more than the rest of America, and high unemployment will persist along with a welfare-dependent population if diverse employment and education opportunities are not developed. Linking economic and commercial development to land use planning is vital to the success of economic development in the Navajo Nation. The heightened importance of this nexus is due to the "trusted relationships" that the Navajo Nation has with the federal government-land withdrawal is essential to the feasibility of economic development projects.

The CLUPC is also required to establish processes for (public education, community principles and concepts, identification of needs, and general planning). Certified Chapters are provided the authority to approve and plan for business as well as home site leases, yet the LGA stipulates approved departmental processes at the Nation.

## D. Chapter's Business/Enterprise Community Facilities Survey

"The Chinle Chapter Government's Community Facilities Survey" for Businesses/Enterprises was conducted from May to September 2015, see Appendix E for survey and survey results. The purpose of the business/enterprise survey was to obtain input from
local business owners to determine their future business and/or tribal enterprise's future expansion requirements.

Chinle Chapter Government obtained from the Navajo Nation's Division of Economic Development's Chinle Regional Business Development Office a listing of all business site leases owners. Therefore, over 34 business surveys were distributed, only seven (7) surveys were returned and inputted online via constant contact survey software. The facility and businesses listed were identical and the responses are as follows:

1) Office Rental
2) RISE
3) Chinle Convenience Store
4) Hi-Tech Windshields
5) Chinle Burger Kining
6) Speedy Septic Services

The type of services or products ranged from lease to rental office and commercials; providing support services to individuals with disabilities through group homes, D.T.A and in home; convenience store/gas, oil and grocery, glass repairs/replace, automobiles, commercial and residential; hamburger and chicken sandwiches with french fries and a carbonated beverage; Lease/rentals: such as offices and commercials; and septic tank/grease trap/ lint trap pumping, install waterlines and sewer lines, septic installation, playgrounds, fencing, portapotties rental, and backhoe services.

The number of clients/customers ranged from 5 to more than 500 people throughout the Navajo Nation. Current facility's description of acres and/or footage started from 5,310 square feet to 1.67 acres. A majority of businesses have handicapped accessibility for their clients/customers. Fifty ( $50 \%$ ) percent of those businesses that responded indicated that their payments are graveled and the other half is not graveled. Again, fifty ( $50 \%$ ) percent indicated that their parking lots were unimproved.

Overall, most businesses stated that their current facility, staffing and programs were adequate and met their current program needs. However, a high percentage do expect their business to expand in the next (5) years that directly resulted in an expansion of their services, programs and facility needs. A majority of the respondents indicated that they have a current business site lease and that their business either lease office or rental space.

In last year's "Chinle Community Economic Impact" survey was conducted indicated that the top three most important economic development goals were: 1) Tourism; 2) Commercial Development; and 3) Industrial Development, while overall the Chapter envisioned commercial development for the long term economic strategy. This survey indicated a high number of local home-based businesses within the Chinle community for Navajo artisans; construction; food vendors; and ranch/livestock.

## E. Community Land Use Plan's Community Survey

Nearly fifty percent $(50 \%)$ of the respondents preferred that business and/or economic development should remain in current or expired business site lease and thirty seven percent (37.1\%) stated that business should be located in the proposed and/or approved Chinle's business corridor or location. Approximately, twenty three percent ( $23.6 \%$ or 86 responses) specified that they have "No Opinion" while another four (4.6\%) didn't want any further economic development endeavors in Chinle. Community member's comments included everywhere (lots of land available). Land that hasn't been used for over ten (10) years became add new mixed town designs similar to urban settings.

Artist vendor/training ( $60 \%$ or 231), small business and/or economic development ( $72 \%$ or 280 ) educational institute development ( $73 \%$ or 287 ), commercial development ( $62 \%$ or 243 ), when tourism ( $56 \%$ or 219), were encouraged to be "Strongly Promoted" that resulted with an average approval rating score of 1.53/5.0. Respondents were likely not in favor of "industrial development" projects since it rated 1.8 or ( $50 \%$ or 195 ) and approval rating were the lowest in this category. Comments included "need better residential housing and more businesses" and "there should be more churches [i.e. Chinle Potter House] and more food places."

Community's response on the "Economy" revealed overall a high importance on the variety of local businesses ( $75 \%$ or 294), local employment opportunities ( $69 \%$ or 268), incorporating commercial development into the appropriate community design ( $59 \%$ or 229); and having access to and the usage of advancements' of technology ( $60 \%$ or 234 ). Each component collectively scored very high as being most important to the Chinle Economy followed by "somewhat important."

Chinle Chapter Government's future population growth will have an increase in a number of land-use decision resulting from the number of economic or business development initiatives that overwhelming participants "agree[d]." Community members strongly "agree" that there are a need for convenience stores ( $81 \%$ or 317 ); shopping centers or other retails ( $81 \%$ or 318 ); office parks ( $71 \%$ or 276 ); agricultural-related businesses ( $81 \%$ or 317 ); family/community farms ( $80 \%$ or 311 ); large corporate livestock farms ( $72 \%$ or 280 ) and recreational facilities ( $83 \%$ or 325 ).

Overall, Chinle community members agreed that light Industry \& manufacturing (58\% or 277); heavy industry \& manufacturing (59\% or 229); mineral extraction (59\% or 229), and condominiums \& duplex development ( $61 \%$ or 236 ). Those potential economic or housing development projects that community members think Chinle needs that were "allow but not encouraged" were similar to those people agreed on. For example: light/heavy industry \& manufacturing and duplexes were in the 30 percentage range. Additional housing such as mobile home parks, and multi-family residences, plus single-family residences, also scattered homes was highly "Agree" on by a majority of the respondents. Additional comments including assisted living programs; retail/shopping outlets; affordable homes for low-income residents; additional employments opportunities; tourism businesses, and overall improve transportation system, and more locally own Navajo Nation businesses.

Chinle Chapter Government's official planning for future development should concentrate to "strongly promote" farmland preservations (65\% or 255); residential development ( $67 \%$ or 262); recreational facilities ( $70 \%$ or 274 ); employment opportunities ( $78 \%$ or 303 ); small business and/or economic development ( $72 \%$ or 280 ); educational institutional development ( $73 \%$ or 287 ); churches/religion purposed ( $72 \%$ or 279 ); youth recreational center/activities (75\% or 293); foremost, Senior Citizen center/program development ( $72 \%$ or 281).

## F. Goals and Policies

## Economic Development Planning

Goal 6.1: To balance economic development in the Chinle community with the culture, economic, and environmental well-being of the community.

| $\mathbf{6 . 1 . 1}$ | $\begin{array}{l}\text { Foster micro-enterprise and economic diversification that increases revenu } \\ \text { promotes industries that is vital to the local community. }\end{array}$ |
| :---: | :--- |
| $\mathbf{6 . 1 . 2}$ | $\begin{array}{l}\text { Balance the desire to generate the highest possible return in land owners w } \\ \text { Cultural, Economic, and Environmental sustainability. }\end{array}$ |
| $\mathbf{6 . 1 . 3}$ | $\begin{array}{l}\text { Emphasize opportunities to generate revenue that would improve services } \\ \text { provide job opportunities within the Chinle community and vicinity. }\end{array}$ |
| $\mathbf{6 . 1 . 4}$ | $\begin{array}{l}\text { Provide adequate Infrastructure to accommodate and stimulate economic } \\ \text { growth. }\end{array}$ |
| $\mathbf{6 . 1 5}$ | Par |

6.1.5 Encourage an industrial development that supports sound development of local resources while reducing the regulation impact on the environment.

| 6.1.6 | Incorporate the Marketing Plan and recent Master Plan for Economic and Tourist <br> Development (Antero Group) for Chinle plans that highlight keys areas of Chinle <br> and ways to improve upon economic efforts locally and aboard. |
| :--- | :--- |

## Strategies/Actions

| 1 | Support and implement the Chinle Chapter Government's community-based marketing and feasibility study \& Apache Country economic strategies report. |
| :---: | :---: |
| 2 | Explore the creation of other enterprises build within the community assets, such as agriculture, green (environmentally friendly) development, tourism (create partnership between local businesses), farmers market, park services, and/or recreation. |
| 3 | Follow up on the status of contaminated business sites: <br> $\rightarrow$ Contaminated information for each site <br> $\rightarrow$ Maps for each location <br> $\rightarrow$ Former Old Paul Tso's Underground Storage Tank <br> $\rightarrow$ Baldwin's Business Site Underground Storage Tank |
| 4 | Encourage businesses that are committed to the principles of sustainability to locate with the community/corridor/industrial park. |
| 5 | Identify 75 to 100 acres business site. (Along major roadways, U.S highways (North/South) 191 - N7.) <br> a) Navajo Nation Shopping Centers, Inc. |


|  | b) Land withdrawal along both side of airport road. <br> c) Land withdrawal along N7. <br> d) New industrial park identification. <br> e) Identify land for Vendor Village. |
| :---: | :---: |
| 6 | Support land withdrawal/business development for CIP. |
| 7 | Infrastructure Development: <br> a) Study and develop a street grid system that also incorporates development and expansion of infrastructure. <br> b) Develop standards for building and expanding infrastructure. <br> c) Identify a location for developing a Waste Treatment Facility/Water Treatment Plant is currently being developed and listed in (CIP). <br> d) Enhance communications (land lines, cell towers, and internet capabilities). <br> e) Explore getting business sites "infrastructure ready " to attract businesses. <br> f) Seek funding for Infrastructure development. |
| 8 | Industrial Development: <br> a) Analyze the economic, social and environmental impacts of a trash facility. <br> b) Analyze the economic, social and environmental impacts of a waste treatment. |
| Development |  |
| Goal 6.2: To encourage sustainable micro-enterprise, industrial, tourism and economic development. |  |
| 6.2.1 | Encourage the development of diverse micro-enterprise, industrial, tourism and economic opportunities within the Chinle community. |
| 6.2.2 | Increase the economic self-sufficiency and self-governance of the Chinle community. |
| 6.2.3 | Continue working with the Navajo Nation Division of Economic Development (DED)'s Project Development \& Navajo Nation Shopping Centers, Inc. on identifying land for the development of a shopping center. |
| 6.2.4 | Continue working with Navajo Park Services, Navajo Nation Parks \& Recreation, and other tribal departments/programs on the development of the Chinle Vendor Village project. <br> $\rightarrow$ Pursuit and creation of Vendor Village within the NPS location to accommodate tourists, local vendors and tour guide operators for tourist and economic development. |
| 6.2.5 | Encourage and nurture startup businesses, business growth and business retention, than expansion. |
| 6.2.6 | Sustain and enhance the economic utilization of Chinle's natural resources for Tourism development. |
| 6.2.7 | Support the development of the Navajo Division of Public Safety Training Academy that will be built on approximately 143 acres of land for encompassing a training academy that will house, train and educate service responders across the Navajo Nation. |
| 6.2.8 | Support the replacement of Church's Chicken due to old outdated building and infrastructure upgrade. |
| 6.2.9 | Support the development of a new hotel for immediate area for growing expansion |


|  | and visitation of tourists on a yearly basis. |
| :---: | :---: |
| Strategies/Actions |  |
| 1 | Recruit and promote desired businesses and/or enterprises. |
| 2 | Business Development: <br> $\rightarrow$ Provide access to resources that will help those who wish to develop and /or grow their own businesses. <br> $\rightarrow$ Support current business activities that are compatible with existing uses in the community and that produce income and/or contribute to the economy. <br> $\rightarrow$ Encourage and support family businesses. <br> $\rightarrow$ Support the sheep and livestock business. <br> $\rightarrow$ Encourage and support entrepreneurship. |
| 3 | Tourism Development: <br> a) Explore and develop innovative tourist activities that preserve and enhance the unique qualities of the community. <br> b) Support the development of businesses that offer services to tourists and encourage businesses to be environmentally friendly (e.g. bed and breakfast near Spider Rock, Restaurant overlooking Chinle and /or Canyon De Chelly, \& campground. <br> c) Reference of Canyon de Chelly as the only National Park where local residents are allowed to reside within its confines and continue to live. |
| Community Economic Development |  |
| Goal 6.3: To encourage the development of diverse economic opportunities within the Community. |  |
| 6.3.1 | Support Community member business development, expansion and sustainability. |
| 6.3.2 | Work with members, permitee(s) and developers to develop economically viable commercial projects for lease income and benefits to the Chinle community such as tax revenues, jobs and business opportunities. |
| 6.3.3 | Promote college education as a means of expanding employment opportunities for community members and enhancing the attractiveness of the local community as a location for businesses that rely on a college educated workforce. |
| 6.3.4 | Create a diverse business environment that provides commerce for the local community, region and visitors. |
| 6.3.5 | Promote the development of at least five (5) business sites within the corridors of N7 and US Hwy 191. |
| 6.3.6 | Advocate large commercial development of up to possibly 50-100 acres of land for shopping center initiative. |
| Strategies/Actions |  |
| 1 | Expand services and opportunities for the Chinle community member owned businesses through the Regional Business Development Office, Navajo Technical University, Dine College, \& Navajo Housing Authority to include classes, individual coaching, lending and savings programs, homeownership and financial literacy. |
| 2 | Utilize the local economic development and tourism plans (Corridor-US Route 191Junction). |


| 3 | Commercial Development: <br> $\rightarrow$ Support the development of retail businesses. <br> $\rightarrow$ Support regional commercial development. <br> $\rightarrow$ Create a historic business district at the old BIA compound complete with walking trails and vendor village. <br> $\rightarrow$ Support the development of a professional office park. <br> $\rightarrow$ Support the development of a medical office park. <br> $\rightarrow$ Develop an entertainment corridor. <br> $\rightarrow$ Support the development of a business district near the airport and provide a link to the town of Chinle. <br> $\rightarrow$ ACE True Value Hardware Store. |
| :---: | :---: |
| Goal 6.4: Create and expand businesses to create benefits for the Chinle community. |  |
| 6.4.1 | Support the development of local services in developed and growing areas within the Chinle community. |
| Zoning |  |
| Goal 6.5: Establish and enforce commercial zones and ordinance for potential business and economic development ventures. |  |
| 6.5.1 | Conduct other research to identify other possible options for land acquisitions |
| 6.5.2 | Establish business and commercial zoning map and ordinances that will guide any future development of business and commercial industries. |
| 6.5.3 | Provide incentives so current land use permit holders in exchange for land or economic development projects. |
| 6.5.4 | Continue working on the BIA tract relinquishment (need to establish development sites and zones) located on the eastern side of Chinle (bridge to Park Services boundaries). |
| Strategies/Actions |  |
| 1 | Develop and adopt local development regulations and design procedures to assist potential businesses \& developers. |
| 2 | Encourage leveraging to support and/or identify additional funding, grants or loans to develop infrastructure to accommodate future development. |

## G. Chinle Business Sites



Developed by The Antero Group (2016)

# 7. AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT ELEMENT 

## A. Agricultural Development Purpose Statement <br> "The Agricultural Development Element" will provide strategies to enhance agri-business opportunities and maintain the Chinle Chapter Government's community's rural character.

## B. Agricultural Element Overview

Some of the existing land uses could be used for agricultural, which is the most common use besides open space. Abundant flat, Irrigated land is available throughout the half of the Chinle Chapter Government's community, and past plans and zoning have supported a strongly agricultural, low-density land use pattern. In addition, agriculture is a strong cultural tradition, and is viewed as a contributor to economic development efforts to provide sustainable revenue and employment within the Community.


## C. Community Land Use Plan's Community Survey

Chinle Chapter Government's official planning for future development should concentrate and "strongly promote" farmland preservations ( $65 \%$ or 255 ); residential development ( $67 \%$ or 262 ); recreational facilities ( $70 \%$ or 274 ); employment opportunities ( $78 \%$ or 303); small business and/or economic development ( $72 \%$ or 280 ); educational institutional development ( $73 \%$ or 287 ); churches/religion purposed ( $72 \%$ or 279 ); youth recreational center/activities ( $75 \%$ or 293); and senior citizen center/program development ( $72 \%$ or 281).

In regards to land use, farming or housing permits and leases; fifty-five percent ( $55.4 \%$ or 102) surveyed indicated they had a grazing permit; twenty-five percent ( 25.0 or 46 ) stated they had an agriculture land use perment; and fifty-two percent ( $52.7 \%$ or 97 ) specified they had a housing lease within the Chinle community. None of 184 respondents indicated they had a business site lease.

Some of Chinle Chapter Government and community's major issues and concerns specified are first, the loss of farmland and/or agricultural activities ( $85.0 \%$ or 329 responses); second, the Environmental Degradation in the community (i.e., erosion, storm water run-off,
etc.) $(72.6 \%$ or 281 responses); third, the lack of Recreational opportunities $(69.2 \%$ or 268 responses) and finally, the amount of development in the Chinle community as a whole ( $60.9 \%$ or 236 responses). Supplementary issues and concerns that were recommend included the establishment of Animal shelters; Recycling centers; and upgrade road (develop a preventative road system); develop a preventative vodaphone improvement; shelters for [alcoholics] and strays; bigger grocery stores; and the encouragement of Navajos investing in apartment [complexes].

The most important proposed project to be considered by the Chinle Chapter Government by 388 local residents were 1) New Youth recreational facility (48\%); 2) New senior center ( $42 \%$ ); 3) irrigation systems improvements ( $45 \%$ ); 4) water line extensions ( $41 \%$ ), and 5) new pre-schools were rated "most important proposed projects" for Chinle. The least important project for the chapter to consider was the establishment of a new airport that ranked last with a $28 \%$ rating score. Additional proposed project suggested by community members included the establishment of an animal shelter (1); homeless shelters (2); car wash (3); new police station (4); paved flea market roads (5); restaurants (6); and retail outlets such as Wal-Mart or a Dollar Tree store.

The top three (3) actions that were recommended by 388 respondents for the Chapter Officials and/or Navajo Nation Programs that will improve the Chinle community and considered the "most important" were to work with the grazing permit holders ( $52 \%$ or 201); work with other chapters on regional projects ( $47 \%$ or 184); and both with a strong rating of "important" were to develop zoning codes (33\%) and establish Range Management Units (RMU)(45\%). Other top actions items that were provided included developing employee housing and improve water system; establishing animal shelters; and addressing illegal dumping [sites].

Other general suggestions and/or opinions stated by the respondents included livestock (round-ups and on highways)(2); Improve the quality of roads (paved) (6); Establish human/animal shelters (3); Recruit Wal-Mart (5); and address lack of homes (residents/professionals), water system, security for shoppers/reduce panhandlers, and acknowledging Chinle needs improvements.

## D. Goals and Policies

## Agricultural Land Uses

## Goal 7.1: To maintain and expand the Chinle Chapter Government's community's Agricultural base.

7.1.1 Ensure that rural community character is maintained through balanced land uses and Quality development.
7.1.2 Consider the effects of land use planning and development on the viability of existing agricultural operations.
7.1.3 Encourage reintroduction of agricultural activities on land that is not currently farmed.
7.1.4 Determine agribusiness enterprise opportunities as part of an overall economic development strategy.
7.1.5 Support the development of a local farm board (non-profit). Strategies/Actions
1 | Inventory all active agricultural lands and current ownership.
2 Continue to expand the Community Garden initiative.
3 Contact landowners who have agricultural land not in use to determine the viability of reintroducing agricultural activities.
4 Determine the availability of additional water resources to support expanded agricultural activities.
$5 \quad$ Invite agricultural entities such as New Dawn, Navajo Nation Department of Agriculture, etc. to provide community members presentations and conduct demonstrations on farming, etc.


## 8. INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENT ELEMENT

## A. Infrastructure Purpose Statement

The purpose of the Infrastructure Development Element is to provide directions for making improvements to the Chinle Chapter Government's community's basic infrastructure to improve public health and safety and enhance economic development opportunities. This includes the plans for any future expansion of utility lines and services to meet current unmet needs and future growth expansions requirements. Utilities considered include the following:
$\checkmark$ Domestic (potable) water
$\checkmark$ Agricultural and Livestock
$\checkmark$ Waste Water
$\checkmark$ Electrical Power
$\checkmark$ Natural Gas
$\checkmark$ Solid Waste Management

## B. Infrastructure Element Overview



The timely expansion of Agricultural, Livestock, Portable water and Wastewater protection Facilities and Services will enable growth to occur in a well-planned manner. The Chinle's community is intent on promoting a quality environment for its residents, workers, and visitors also, in doing so, recognizes the needs to work with local and regional partners. The Chinle Chapter Government's community also understands the precious commodity of water, practicing sound water management. This plan will assist the community make decision regarding:
$\checkmark$ Allocation of resources for utility extensions and maintenance.
$\checkmark$ Location of new facilities related to utilities and buildings.
$\checkmark$ Planning for new building projects and community growth.

## WATER SUPPLY AND DISTRIBUTION

The water resources mix for the Chinle community includes surface water, groundwater, and reclaimed water. The mix is evolving as a result of growth, development, and arsenic treatment needs, and the availability of various facilities located within or in close to the Community.

## C. Goals and Policies

| Water and Wastewater |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Goal 8.1: To properly manage water, wastewater, and reclaimed water within the Chinle community. |  |
| 8.1.1 | Address the Canyon Area's lack of adequate domestic water systems that's included in Black Rock, Canyon floor, Del Muerto, and South Rim also, Spider Rock areas. |
| 8.1.2 | Extend the existing sewer system to serve the Beautiful Valley \& Chinle Valley areas. |
| 8.1.3 | Investigate and select small scale water-waste treatment systems for the remote areas of the Chapter. |
| 8.1 .4 | Explore other water sources for homes that are located far away from the water to obtain services. |
| 8.1.5 | Address and support the Water Treatment Plan slated for construction in 2017. |
| Strategies/Actions |  |
| 1 | Include funding for service expansion in the proposal for waste water treatment plant. |
| 2 | Research, select and seek funding for small water-waste treatment systems. |
| 3 | Support and/or advocate for the development of a community water system for the North Rim and Spider Rock areas. |
| 4 | Support and/or advocate for the development of additional wells at the canyon floor. |
| 5 | $\rightarrow$ Identify an existing well that might be used for the water supply. <br> $\rightarrow$ Have water in the well tested. <br> $\rightarrow$ Coordinate Chinle community water system with the Indian Health Services. <br> $\rightarrow$ Seek funding to repair broken wells. |
| 6 | Utilization of reclaimed water for construction usage from sewer lagoon. <br> $\rightarrow$ Creation of $4^{\text {th }}$ cell holding area |
| 7 | Support the assessment of Water Reserves within Chinle community: <br> a) Status of Earthen Dams/Water Spreader <br> b) Status and Utilization of Windmills <br> c) Chinle Community Water Treatment Plant <br> d) Identify other water waste treatment |
| 8 | Review and implement recommended strategies within the Flood Study (US Army Corps); Badland Feasibility Study; and Chinle Water Well Study by USACOE. |
| Drainage and Storm Water Management |  |
| Goal 8.2: To capture and convey storm water drainage in a safe and aesthetic manner. |  |
| 8.2.1 | Coordinate with NRCS to plan and implement storm water improvements to protect life and property in the community. |
| 8.2.2 | Follow up on proposed bridge south of Chinle Unified School District schools with Navajo Department of Transportation and BIA. |

## Electricity

Goal 8.3: To coordinate with NTUA for electrical requirements/system to assure that the community, residents and commercial needs continues to advance due to growth.

| 8.3.1 | Seek from NTUA updated information on a periodic basis, such as surveys of <br> current NTUA right-of-way, system maps, aerial photographs, and annuals reports. |
| :---: | :--- |
| $\mathbf{8 . 3 . 2}$ | Participate actively in coordinating economic development projects with NTUA. |
| $\mathbf{8 . 3 . 3}$ | Electrical service may not be adequate for new growth in the Chinle vicinity. |
| Strategies/Actions |  |

## 9. COMMUNITY FACILITIES ELEMENT

## A. Community Facilities Purpose Statement

"The Community Facilities Element" provides direction for developing basic Infrastructure and Amenities that will add to the quality of like for the community members that will show the location, type, capacity, and area served of:

- Present,
- Projected, and
- Required community facilities.


## B. Community Facilities Element Overview

The Chinle community provides community services and facilities which include Health \& Human services, Public safety, Education \& Employment, public works (utilities) and Recreation. The Community provides several services including Community health, Social support, Youth services and Senior citizen services.

## Recreation

The Navajo Nation Parks \& Recreation Services allows picnicking, camping and horseback tours into Canyon De Chelly. The park's visitor center features a park store, Orientation video and activity schedule. The scenic drives on the two paved rim drives to the overlooks which provides excellent views of the canyon below. The Nation Park also provides self-guided tours and hiking on the one public trail starting at the White House Overlook on the South Rim. Other services include:
$\checkmark$ RANGER LED PROGRAMS: The program including hikes and talks from Memorial Day through Labor Day.
$\checkmark$ CANYON TOURS: Private companies can provide tours into the canyon by hiking, horseback or vehicle. Tours require a backcountry permit and hiring an authorized guide.
$\checkmark$ CAMPING: Fee required to camp at the Cottonwood Campground with sites available "first-come, first-serve". No showers or hookups.

## Police



Navajo Police Department - Chinle District enforces Tribal, Federal and State law with the primary responsibility in the areas of traffic safety, criminal interdiction, narcotics, organized crime, auto theft, and specific Navajo Nation law enforcement functions.

Services include Homeland security, Criminal intelligence, Emergency first care, criminal information systems, Training, and public safety. Operational and technical assistance is provided to tribal and state agencies and other components of the criminal justice and civilian community.

## Fire

Navajo Nation Department of Fire and Rescue Services Station \#50 Chinle Fire Department is a cultural feature (building) in Apache County. The primary coordinates for Navajo Nation Department of Fire and Rescue Services Station \#50 Chinle Fire Department places it within the Arizona, 86503, delivery area.

## Education

Education within the Chinle community ranges from early childhood programs though higher education opportunities such as Northern Arizona University, Dine College and Navajo Technical University.

## C. Community Priorities for Community Facilities

Specific community priorities relating to Community Facilities are shown below. Additional community service and facility needs are listed in the table summarizing the results of the Community Facilities Survey.

The facilities and services listed below were determined to be community priorities by the Chapter Members.

## D. Community Land Use Plan's Community \& Facility Survey

A majority of the respondents rated police services ( $24 \%$ or 95 ), Fire services ( $29 \%$ or 115), Ambulance services ( $30 \%$ or 119), Electrical services ( $36 \%$ or 139), Recycling ( $29 \%$ or 114), and Emergency services ( $30 \%$ or 119) as "Satisfactory" as public services within the Chinle community. However, cable services ( $31 \%$ or 120 ) and high speed internet and/or public Wi-Fi access were rated above "very satisfactory." Additional public service recommendations were potential projects such as animal's shelters, recycling centers, alcoholic rehabilitation centers; investments in apartments, and upgrading areas to develop "Preventative Roads Improvements".

According to the 385 respondents, the "most important" Chapter land improvement was "public service facilities" (Hospital, Police/Fire stations, etc.) with the highest percentage rating score of $52 \%$ or 188 respondents. Developing more home-sites ( $41 \%$ or 161 ) and housing (scattered or clustered) ( $44 \%$ or 173 ) were the second most important improvement to be considered for the Chapter's land area. Developing a better utility system and commercial, economic or industrial development were rated as "Neutral" but had a strong "most important" percentage close behind to the initial rating. Only one (1) comment provided was for housing such as scattered or clustered should be reserved for employees.

## E. Goals and Policies

## Recreation \& Youth

Goal 9.1: To provide adequate youth and recreation facilities for community residents.
9.1.1 Preserve areas designated on the Land Use Map for Parks \& Recreational and Youth facilities.
9.1.2 Assist in land identification, acquisition and development process for the youthrelated facility to address children in crisis situation, consolidating youth health services and provide a positive place to go after school and/or weekends.
9.1.3 Develop and/or designate a systematic funding source for parks, recreation and youth facilities development.
9.1.4 Support the development of a youth rehabilitation home and a library center. Strategies/Actions
1 Support the development of a comprehensive Parks, Recreation \& Youth Master Plan for the community.

## Health \& Child Care

Goal 9.2: To ensure that community members have access to high quality heaith and child care facilities and services.
9.2.1 Promote the development of a full service hospital for the community.
9.2.2 Support the provision of health care services to serve community residents, including clinics and mobile services.
9.2.3 Support the development of home-based child care services.

Strategies/Actions
1 Promote child care training workshops on laws and regulations.
Community Public Facilities/Government
Goal 9.3: To ensure that community government facilities and services keep pace with demand.
9.3.1 Promote the development of a full service multi-purpose/administrative complex.
9.3.2 Support the on-going expansion, renovation and replacement of the community's government building, as necessary and funding availability.
9.3.3 Support the development of a new Public Safety facility (Training Academy).
9.3.4 Increase adequate office space for government services (Government Office Complex).
9.3.5 Promote and maintain a safe community.

## Strategies/Actions

1 Develop a full service multi-purpose and/or administration complex.
2 Chapter tract re-survey and work with BIA to have land reverted back to Chapter.
3 Identify a site for the Public Safety Facility that includes housing.
4 Identify and secure an "office complex" site (near former Catholic Church tract).
5 Safety:
a) Develop emergency response capabilities (police, fire station, EMS)
b) Develop better traffic controls, especially near schools.
c) Develop a night watch program that includes a reward system.

## Telecommunication

Goal 9.4: Improve telecommunication and internet communications systems.
9.4.1 Continue to support efforts to provide telecommunications services to community residents, including both telephone, cellular and internet services.

## Energy

Goal 9.5: To improve the energy and recycling resources of the Chinle community.
9.5.1 Research and search for ways to develop alternative sources of energy to serve development within the Chinle community for the future.
9.5.2 Continue to work with Ferrell Gas, NTUA, and natural gas for provisions of utilities in the community.
9.5.3 Support alternative energy options for the future and consider developing an industrial/management facility for recycling.

## Strategies/Actions

1 Collaborate with utility partners/agencies to improve energy resources include the promotion/development of alternative energy sources.
2 Request for a comprehensive energy audit of the community/facilities.

## Education

Goal 9.6: To support the continued expansion and improvement of educational opportunities within the Chinle community.
9.6.1 Support the provision of education facilities to provide high-quality programs.
9.6.2 Plan for education facilities to meet the future needs of a growing community population.

## Strategies/Actions

1 Recommend and support the update of the community's master education plan.
2 Support Del Muerto Headstart Land Improvement Project.

## F. Chinle Government Facilities



Developed by The Antero Group (2016)

## III. INVENTORY DATA ASSESSMENT

## A. Purpose

The purpose of the "data assessment" is to determine if there are conditions which will affect the future use of the land. The report looks at conditions related to Land, Water, Air and WildLife. Then how people have resided on the land is evaluated and finally recommendations are made as to how the land can be best protected and used.

This assessment will help the community make decisions regarding:
$\checkmark$ Areas of land that require special protection;
$\checkmark$ Environmental problems which need to be addressed;
$\checkmark$ The use of land within the Chapter area;
$\checkmark$ Whether a certain site is good for a proposed land use, lease land withdrawal; and
$\checkmark$ Where it would be good to place different land uses.

For the Chinle Chapter, the Evaluation was based on the following sources of information:
$\checkmark$ Chapter Images: 1996;
$\checkmark$ Navajo Historic Preservation Department maps and review;
$\checkmark$ Navajo Department of Water Resources data and materials;
$\checkmark$ Navajo Department of Fish and Wildlife recommendations;
$\checkmark$ Navajo Forestry Department materials; and
$\checkmark$ Other available resources.

## B. Natural Resources Inventory \& Assessment

## 1. LAND RESOURCES

Major features of the Chapter area are the Deep canyons of the Canyon de Chelly complex along the east; the relatively flat and gently sloping plateau of the ${ }^{8}$ Nazlini and Chinle Washes in the middle section; and the rolling terrain of Ventana and Carson Mesas, Red Rock Rim, Bitter Water Basin and Lohali Mesa on the western side.


The elevations range from 5360 feet above sea level near Many Farms to around 7400 feet at the top of the escarpment of Lohali Mesa.


Inventory Data Assessment: Page | 2

The Chapter area is located in the South-central portion of the Colorado Plateau physiographic province. The chapter lies from the Western side of the Defiance Uplift into the central section of the Black Mesa Basin. Sedimentary rocks in the area are primarily of the Mesa Verde group.

No mineral resources in terms of Oil, Uranium, or Coal have been commercially developed in the area. Coal is being commercially extracted at the Peabody Mine in the Northwestern section of Black Mesa. There have been proposals made to open commercial Coal mines in the Black Mountain area. There is also abandoned Uranium mine at Forest Lake in Black Mesa. Mineral resources for the Navajo Nation are shown on the map below:


## 2. WATER RESOURCES

The primary drainage system for the Chapter area consists of the Nazlini Wash system which Northward from the Beautiful Valley into the Chinle Wash North of the Chinle Kin łání. Both the Nazlini and Chinle washes contain water most of the year.

The Chinle Wash, with its tributaries from the canyon branches of the Canyon de Chelly complex, is the primary drainage for the greater part of the Eastern side of the Chapter area.

The Southeastern sector is drained by Tiis Ndiitsool Wash, which originates in the Little White House Canyon, and Tse Deeshzhaai Wash, which originates in Three Turkey Canyon. Both of these washes flow into the Nazlini Wash South of the urbanized area.

The Southwestern corner of the Chapter area is drained by the Cottonwood Wash system. Both Balaki Wash (flowing north-south) and Tse Ba Ni Zi Ni Wash (flowing northeast) intersect with Cottonwood Wash. This system joins the Nazlini Wash about a mile southeast of the intersection of U.S. Highway 1911 and Navajo Nation Route 64.

The Water Resources Development Strategy for the Navajo Nation, prepared by the Navajo Nation Department of Water Resources in 2000, gives the following description of the Coconino Aquifer.

## 3. C or Coconino Aquifer

The C-Aquifer underlies most of the reservation in the Little Colorado River Basin. It is recharged from outcrops on the Defiance Plateau, the Mongollon Rim and the San Francisco Mountains. The communities of Cameron, Leupp, Ganado and Chinle, among others, depend on the C

Aquifer for much of their municipal water supply. It is also a major source of industrial water for non-Indian communities in the Little Colorado River Basin. (This aquifer is at great depth in the Black Mesa area and is of relatively poor quality in this area as well.)

The development strategy notes that overall, estimated total storage for the Coconino Aquifer is 413 million acre-feet of water according to Arizona Department of Water Resources data for 1989.

Water Table Areas in Navajo Country ${ }^{19}$


There are not any known point sources of groundwater pollution in the general region. However, individual well sites can be contaminated through septic systems which are located too close to the well or through contamination found in the piping system connected to the well.

The Water Resource Development Strategy for the Navajo Nation includes the following objectives:
$\rightarrow$ Establish a water resource development task force, which will coordinate technical and fiscal resources of the Navajo Nation and Federal Agencies.
$\rightarrow$ Prepare a reservation-wide needs assessment and prioritizing projects.
$\rightarrow$ Develop regional water supply projects.
$\rightarrow$ Develop and rehabilitate local water supply and distribution systems.
$\rightarrow$ Complete NIIP and continue to address deficiencies in water storage facilities.

Chinle Chapter area Woodlands Inventory by crown density class.
Map from the Navajo Forestry Department.


## C. Cultural \& Community Inventory \& Assessments

A comprehensive Chinle Chapter Government's background and history are well documented and report in the 2006 Chinle Chapter's Community Based Comprehensive Land Use Plan as developed by Takahashi Associates pages 30 to 44.

## D. Human Resources

Community Demographics
The Chinle population assessment uses U.S. Census Bureau 2010 data was obtained from the U.S. Census Bureau. The 2010 US Census, Chinle Chapter Government is the second largest population within on the Navajo Indian Reservation. According to the Chinle Chapter Economic Land Use and Strategic Plan (2006), despite the Chapter's year of successful planning, Chinie citizens continue to strive for a future of increased economic growth through the creation of wealth and generation of marketable goods and services (p. 2).

According to the U.S. Census 2010 report, Chinle Chapter is home to approximately 8,005 residents, a slight decline from the 2000 Census of 8,294 . According to the 2006 (CBLUP), approximately 4,883 residents lived in the canyon area, and the remaining population lives in what is referred to locally as the "City" of Chinle. According to Chinle Chapter staff interviews for the ASU's Recommendations for Updating the Community-Based Land Use Plans for the Navajo Nation, they reported that the Chinle Chapter Government is divided into these two areas, which are diametrically opposed in a number of ways. First of all, the "City" of Chinle has a much denser settlement pattern, with many homes built along Main Street. The Geology of this region is not as rocky as the region near the Canyon, sits low near the creek, and floods often, according to local residents. It is clear to see that this area rests in the floodplain. The two areas also feature different economies. The Canyon economy is primarily one of subsistence through herding livestock, with a few of the Canyon dwellers utilizing the land for farming. The "Canyon Communities", as they are called locally, are primarily scattered homes, many without running water or electricity. The "city" dwellers, in contrast, are primarily involved in service sector or government employment for offices such as the Navajo Tribal Utility Authority (NTUA) or the local hospital.

## E. Chinle/Navajo Nation Community Profile

The Arizona Department of Commerce has published a Community Profile for Chinle which highlights its employment structure, labor force data, growth indicators, population, weather and economic activities. Chinle, located near the geographic center of the Navajo Indian Reservation in northeastern Arizona, is situated at the entrance to Canyon de Chelly National Monument. Chinle became a center for population growth and trade after 1868 when the United States signed a treaty with the Navajos. The first trading post at that time was
established in 1862, the first mission in 1904, and the first government school in 1910. Today the community has been designated one of the major "Growth Centers" on the Navajo Reservation by the Tribal government and is an important trade, administrative, and educational center. Chinle, is reported to be an urban center within the Chinle Chapter (a local government unit) and is headquarters for the Chinle Agency "one of the five" Bureau of Indian Affairs administrative jurisdictions on the reservation. As such, Chinle is headquarters for many Federal and Tribal agencies and State and local government offices.

## F. Economic and Community Development Goals

The Navajo Nation and Chinle Chapter Government's long-term economic goal is to achieve tribal self-sufficiency and thereby to improve the overall quality of life of every Navajo member by creating a Diversified, job-generating private sector capable of supporting and increasing new job creation efforts every year. This economic initiative is to be accomplished by fostering the development of both Navajo and non-Navajo businesses and industries on the reservation. The major objective in meeting with this goal is to massage the local economy by enhancing or establishing a local and regional economic base and that encourages Navajo people to invest their dollars in their people and the local economy. By developing such a private sector, the Navajo Nation will be able to eventually reduce its support on the federal government.

Chinle Chapter Government's objective will be to Encourage, Foster, and Support private business within and surround the Chinle community that are owned and operated by community members, and to plan for and encourage private land development owned by tribal members. The local business and economic development program should be designed to foster education, entrepreneurship and leadership development growth in rural small business and economic development ventures. The current administration and officials can develop a dynamic program to rekindle dormant visions, refresh current leadership and empower emerging Navajo entrepreneurs and leaders to create avenues for Native Americans to learn business development techniques to either promote or start their own small businesses. This proposed program will be designed for the Chinle residents and other reservation-based tribal community members who wish to own and operate their own business

## G. Community Land Use Plan's Community Survey

Under the "Community Values" section, we obtained input from the community members on the best way to accommodate the future growth of Chinle, Arizona. A majority of the respondents ( $30.1 \%$ or 117 individuals) resided within the Chinle community more than 25 years. Seventeen percent ( $17.3 \%$ ) or 63 interviewed recorded their residency with the Chinle vicinity for over twenty one ( $21+$ ) years. Seventy ( 70 or $19 \%$ ) surveyed stated that they resided within the community for at least $6+$ years with a low average of $2.1 \%$ that specified that they were present in this community for less than one (1) year.

Largely a very high percentage of eighty percent (80.4\%) or 293 community members indicated that they were "Registered voters of the Chinle Chapter Government." Sixty two ( $62.3 \%$ ) or 227 respondents indicated their gender was "male" while one hundred-thirty six (136) stated they were "female." The highest percentage of 53.8 or 196 individuals were between the age range of 25 to 44 years of age and the second highest percentage of $39 \%$ or 145 community members listed they were in the 45 to $64+$ age category. Based on the survey question on 2014 household gross income, forty two (42) or $11.6 \%$ indicated their income was $\$ 10,000$ or less; one hundred (100) or $27.6 \%$ of the household recorded an income ranged of $\$ 10,001$ to $\$ 34,999$; fifty nine percent ( $59.6 \%$ ) or 215 household marked their gross income ranged from $\$ 35,000$ to $\$ 99,999$. Eleven percent ( $11.9 \%$ ) or forty three (43) community household had an excess gross income of over $\$ 100,000$. Overall, a majority of the household within the Chinle Chapter Community are well above the 2010 Census' average household gross income and there were a low percentage that were either unemployed and participating Federal or Tribal assistance programs.

The level of education attained within the Chinle Chapter Government's household listed that $26.9 \%$ or 98 members had less than a high school education and/or didn't graduate, $18.4 \%$ or 67 individuals had some college education; a high percentage ( $40.1 \%$ ) stated that graduated with a college degree; $14.8 \%$ or 54 household members had obtained their high school GED; $31.0 \%$ or 113 household members obtained their Associate and/or Technical Degree(s); while $18.7 \%$ or 68 community members graduated with some post graduate work and/or degree.

Chinle community members ranked their satisfaction residing within the Chinle/vicinity as "satisfied" ( $31.1 \%$ response ratio or 113 responses); "somewhat satisfied" ( $35.9 \%$ response ratio or 131 responses; "somewhat dissatisfied" ( $26.3 \%$ response ratio or 96 responses); and "dissatisfied" (5.7\% response ratio or 21 responses). Although a majority of respondents listed Chinle as a "satisfied or somewhere satisfied" place to reside, there are approximately $32.0 \%$ or a third of the respondents that deemed Chinle as either "somewhat dissatisfied or dissatisfied."

Chinle Chapter Government's future population growth will have an increase in a number of land-use decision resulting from the number of Economic or Business development initiatives that overwhelming participants "agree[d\}." Community members strongly "agree" that there are a need for convenience stores ( $81 \%$ or 317 ); shopping centers or other retails ( $81 \%$ or 318 ); office parks ( $71 \%$ or 276); agricultural-related businesses ( $81 \%$ or 317 ); family/community farms ( $80 \%$ or 311 ); large corporate livestock farms ( $72 \%$ or 280 ) and recreational facilities ( $83 \%$ or 325 ).

Overall, Chinle community members agreed that light industry \& manufacturing (58\% or 277); heavy industry \& manufacturing (59\% or 229); mineral extraction (59\% or 229), and condominiums \& duplex development $(61 \%$ or 236 ). Those potential economic or housing development projects that community members think Chinle needs that were "allow but not encouraged" were similar to those people agreed on; For Example: light/heavy industry \&
manufacturing and duplexes were in the 30 percentage ranges. Additional housing needs such as mobile home parks, multi-family residences, single-family residences, and scattered homes were highly "agree" on by a majority of the respondents. Additional comments included assisted living programs; retail/shopping outlets; affordable homes for low-income residents; additional employment opportunities; tourism businesses; and overall better homes, improve transportation system, and just more locally own businesses.

A majority ( $31.4 \%$ or 114 respondents) indicated they reside at the Valley Store towards Many Farms location; $19.0 \%$ or 69 members specified they reside downtown Chinle area; 13.5\% or 49 individuals stated they live from Chinle's airport toward Pinon Junction; $13.2 \%$ or 48 people resides within the T-Bird vicinity (Del Muerto, Spider Rock \& Canyon De Chelly); and an approximately $12.9 \%$ or 47 respondents recorded they live around the Pork Chop Hills location that includes (CUSD) Administration, Beverly Hills \& BIA. There were a low percentage of respondents that indicated that they lived within another chapter vicinity but were registered members of the Chinle Chapter
 Government and only $8.0 \%$ or 29 respondents stated they live within the jurisdiction of another chapter, city, town, or state. Thirty six (36) commented they resided in Many Farms (5); TselaniCottonwood (7); Rough Rock/Round Rock (5); Lukachukai/Wheatfields/Tsaile (8); and had respondents from Gallup. NM and Flagstaff, AZ.

A high percentage of Chinle community members ( $83.2 \%$ or 322 members) indicated they were employed while only $8.2 \%$ or 32 residents specified they were unemployed. A majority ( $82.4 \%$ or 296 responses) employed respondents indicated that they work within the Chinle community while $14.2 \%$ or 51 employees work outside of Chinle but within a 20 miles radius of the chapter. Approximately $4.1 \%$ or 15 surveyed stated they resided within another chapter jurisdiction, city, or town/state other than Chinle. Alternative residency included the State of Washington; Arizona/Phoenix; Oklahoma City, OK; Dine College; Chandler, AZ and various worksites.

Six percent ( $6.3 \%$ or 23 respondents) stated they were self-employed and/or owned their own business that includes home-based businesses. Out of the 363 respondents, three (3) community members indicated they were students and four percent (4.4\%) or 16 respondents indicated they were retired.

# IV. COMMUNITY LAND USE PLAN (CLUP) ADMINISTRATION 

## A. Purpose

Chinle Chapter Government's Community Land Use Plan is a "General Expression" of the local community's vision and is focused on "planning for generations." The Chapter's Community Land Use Plan should be used as a policy guide for the Chinle Chapter Government, (CLUPC) members, Chapter officials/staff, community members, tribal entities/programs and potential economic or business developers. As a locally developed policy document, the Community Land Use Plan will be used when reviewing and making decisions about development projects within the Chinle Chapter Government's community. All proposals will be reviewed to ensure that they are "compatible" with the Plan's vision, goals, and policies as well as with the Land Use Map.

It is important to note that the nature of planning must recognize the ever-evolving nature of the environment and local community members' desires. Therefore, the Community Land Use Plan should be reviewed and updated regularly to reflect desired changes. But it is important that the Plan's focus on the "Planning for Future Generations" is not compromised by the demands of current development trends.

## B. Community Land Use Plan Consistency Defined

The following is a list of criteria for determining if a proposal is consistent with the Chinle Chapter Government's Community Land Use Plan.
$\rightarrow$ Directly mirror the Community Land Use Plan;
$\rightarrow$ Reflects the local community's adopted vision;
$\rightarrow$ Addresses the plan's goals;
$\rightarrow$ Proposal considers the long-term sustainability that fits within the "Planning for
Generations" ideal; and
$\rightarrow$ Would be supported by local community members.

## C. Community Land Use Plan Amendments

Frequent changes to the Chinle Chapter Government's Community Land Use Plan are not recommended. There will, however, be cases where the "elements" content of the Plan is determined to be outdated or inconsistent with the evolving needs of the Chinle community. In such cases, the Chinle Chapter Government's Community Land Use Plan may need to be amended. Since considerable local community involvement contributed to the creation of the

Community Land Use Plan, any and all major updates to the Plan should be accompanied by opportunities for local community involvement.

## D. Comprehensive Community Land Use Plan Review

A formal Community Land Use Plan Review will occur five (5) years after the revised Chinle Chapter Government's Community Land Use Plan is approved and re-certified by the Navajo Nation Council's Resource and Development Committee (RDC). The Community Land Use Plan Review is an opportunity to make changes to the plan by evaluating the success of the Community Land Use Plan in meeting its goals and objectives. Changes to the Community Land Use Plan and maps should be expected, as the Navajo Nation and the Chapter administration will be monitoring land use information and issues throughout the life of the Plan. Land use planning is a continuing cycle where up-to-date information and issues are considered in the process on an on-going basis.

The original Chinle Chapter's Community Based Comprehensive Land Use Plan (CLUP) was prepared in 2006 by Takahashi Associates and has been developed in accordance to the Navajo Nation Local Governance Act of 1998 (Navajo Nation Code, Title 26). The Local Governance Act (LGA) delegates certain governmental authorities from the central government to local governments, providing the local governments can prepare management systems that are in compliance to the audits as reviewed by the Navajo Nation Office of Attorney General. In accordance to the Navajo Nation Code, Title 26 § 101 (B), it states "Chapters wanting to administer land, pursuant to this Act, are required to develop a community based land use plan based upon results of a community assessment." Although the (LGA) does not require chapters to adopt a CLUP but it does grant the authority to administer land at the local level only to those chapters that develops a CLUP.

## E. Chinle Community Participation Goals \& Objectives

Chinle Chapter Government's set of goals and objectives for the public education and participation plan are a combination of the goals developed for Chinle's local community. They are presented in the chart below:

## Community Participation

Goal/Purpose

1. Land use and comprehensive planning will be community driven.

## Community Participation Objective/Action

$\rightarrow$ The CLUPC can make decisions but community members need to have input and review prior to decisions being made for all actions or proposed developments.
$\rightarrow$ The community's interest has to be held in high regards by the CLUPC.
$\rightarrow$ Community hearings will be held before major decisions are made by the CLUPC and send to the Chapter.
$\rightarrow$ CLUPC meetings and hearing will be held at a location what is convenient to residents from the Chapter area which will be affected
2. Involve the community in CLUPC $\rightarrow$ All CLUPC meetings will be held as open public meetings. meetings.
3. Inform community members about $\rightarrow$ Designate 2-3 CLUPC members to contact key community (CLUPC) hearings. members on a regular basis about meetings and other CLUPC activities.
$\rightarrow$ Make flyers for distribution to businesses, churches and school.
$\rightarrow$ Make public radio announcements about meetings.
$\rightarrow$ Use and place marquee, bulletin boards, and billboards announcements at the Chapter House.
4. Provide adequate amount of time
$\rightarrow$ The CLUPC will meet once a month. One meeting will address planning issues and the other optional meeting will address for CLUPC members to conduct current community issues and projects.
5.

Involve Iocal government officials $\rightarrow$ Request that the Chapter Officials \& Delegates attend critical including: Chapter Officials, Council Delegates, Local Grazing CLUPC meetings and hearings.

> Officials and Community Services Coordinator in the planning process
$\rightarrow$ The CLUPC will conduct at least one joint meeting with the Chapter Officials and Delegates every year. Additional meetings can be scheduled as needed.
process $\rightarrow$
members will attend and make a presentation at the monthly Chapter Planning Committee Meeting and at the Chapter Meeting.
$\rightarrow$ Invite the Chapter Manager to attend the CLUPC meetings.
$\rightarrow$ Include Chapter Officials, Delegates and the Chapter Manager in CLUPC education sessions.
6. Involve Chinle's businesses,
$\rightarrow$ The school Superintendent and HS Principal are invited to attend the CLUPC meetings.
7. organizations, churches and youth in the planning process.
$\rightarrow$ Encourage conducting a youth involvement event.
Involve grazing permittees in the $\rightarrow$ CLUPC Members will meet with the grazing permit holders land use planning process. several times a year to disseminate information and collect ideas.
8. Increase CLUPC Members visibility $\rightarrow$ CLUPC members will go out and meet with the residents on a in the community in their role as periodic basis.
community land use planners.
$\rightarrow$ Schedule community organization meetings for CLUPC Members to attend and give brief presentations on the land use planning process.
9. Conduct at least two (2) public hearings for each policy or project decision.

Public Hearings can be conducted before or during Chapter Meetings or at a separate time. All Public Hearings will have public notices and will be open to public participation.

## F. Chinle Comprehensive Plan’s Vision Statement

The Vision Statement sets out the ideal situation or condition that the Chinle community aspires to implement a planning process that is directed by community needs and encourages participation from all sectors of the community. The goal of this process is to create and implement a community land use planning that:
$\rightarrow$ Inspires the imagination and creativity of the Chinle community.
$\rightarrow$ Respects the values of the community and the cultural preservation of T'áa Dinéji.
$\rightarrow$ Results in good community and good home life for Residents, Businesses and Tourists.
$\rightarrow$ Overall is wholistic in approach and provides for all sectors and all areas of the Chinle Chapter Government in a way that is equitable and fair.
$\rightarrow$ That maximizes the thoughtful use of Resources and Generates new resources that are then invested in the community.
$\rightarrow$ Respects, protects and regenerates the land and the environment of the Chinle Chapter Government.

## APPENDIX B:

## CLUPC's Purpose and Roles \& Responsibilities

## A. PURPOSE:

The purpose of the Community Land Use Planning Committee (CLUPC) shall be to develop local zoning and ordinance to regulate the use of land within the Chapter Planning Area. The zoning and ordinances shall be in consistent with 26 N.N.C. Section 103 (E)(4), and Chinle Chapter Community Comprehensive Based Land Use Plans, Plan of Operation for all authorities assumed regarding land use by the Chapter.

## B. COMMUNITY LAND USE PLANNING COMMITTEE (CLUPC) RESPONSIBILITIES, DUTIES AND AUTHORIES:

The CLUPC will serve as the advisory committee to the Chapter Officials and the Chapter on land use and development project issues. The CLUPC' will act in good faith and the best of their ability to perform the following role and responsibilities:

1. The CLUPC shall have all the powers necessary and appropriate as delegated through the Navajo Nation Council Legislative enactment of the Local Governance Act, 26 N.N. C. Section 2004 and Section 102 (B) and (C).
2. The enumerated powers of the CLUPC are:
a) To abide by the rules, regulations, policies, and resolutions which are consistent with this Plan of Operation as necessary for the accomplishment of its purpose, authority, functions, and responsibilities.
b) Amend the Land Use Plan to meet the changing needs of the Community.
c) Develop, amend and recommend the land use plan and local zoning ordinances governing various types of land use consistent with the Chapter's Community based Land Use Plan.
d) Develop, amend and recommend the land use plan and management plan.
e) Recommend potential land site for Economic Development Plans and other plans as needed.
f) CLUPC members are encouraged to attend Chinle Chapter meetings. (Planning, Regular and Special as well as those meeting that pertain to land issues)
3. To inform community members of CLUPC activities and decisions through public education and participation efforts.
4. To establish a comprehensive land use plan including planning for land use, community infrastructure (utilities, roads and transportation), open space and recreation, community facilities, and public safety.
5. Review and revise this plan every five (5) years and obtain Navajo Nation's Resource and Development Committee's approval and re-certification for the plan.
6. To use the comprehensive land use plan as the guide and resource for the CLUPC to review and make recommendations to the Chapter on proposed development projects, land withdrawals, home site lease, business site lease, church site lease applications, utility line extensions and community facilities.
7. To assist the Chapter in strategic planning for the community including the development of goals and objectives, community priorities and action plans.
8. To develop a growth management master plan, zoning ordinances and other land development standards and guidelines that will ensure that new growth and projects within the Chapter area are built in a manner that protects the health, welfare and safety of residents and visitors.
9. To identify needs, develop plans and implementation programs for community utility and infrastructure needs.
10. To develop plans and surveys for streets, traffic and community transportation needs.
11. To develop plans for cultural and civic centers and other community facilities.
12. To ensure that the Chapter's land use and land development planning activities are consistent with Navajo Nation and Federal guidelines, and
13. To guide growth and development in a way that enhances the quality of life for Chapter members.
14. To work with the Chapter Officials to review the state of the Chapter on an annual basis and to determine concerns which need planning policy development or review; this task would include an annual review of the Chapter's goals and objectives.
15. To develop administrative procedures for the review and approval of proposed development projects, land withdrawals, home site lease, business site lease, church site lease applications, utility line extensions and community facilities.

## APPENDIX C:

## Process and Public/Community Involvement

The public participation phase is crucial for ensuring that the planning process proceeds toward goals that are shared and agreed upon by individuals, groups, institutions and other stakeholders within the community. Public participation is particularly important for historically disempowered groups, for whom "culturally sensitive, respectful and appropriate research" must be conducted.

Community education is also an integral piece of self-determination. It is the first step in the development of a community needs assessment, as it enables the community to begin the process itself. By empowering the [Chinle] community with knowledge about the planning process and the role and designation of public meetings, a more active participatory program can be established and a stronger consensus can be built, as well as improved implementation strategies (Creighton, 2005, p. 151).

The benefits include enhancing capacity of citizens to cultivate a stronger sense of commitment, increasing user satisfaction, creating realistic expectations of outcomes, and building trust (Al-Kodmany, 1999), improving the quality of decisions, minimizing cost and delay, consensus building, increasing ease of implementation, avoiding worst-case confrontations, maintaining credibility and legitimacy, anticipating public concerns and attitudes, and developing civil society (Creighton, 2005, p. 153)

## Recommendations for Updating Chapter Plans

Community participation also serves as a tool to build trust between the CLUPC and the community, which is important for all planning endeavors; the community can rely on the CLUPC to be the agent for proposed changes that affect it. Community participation entails a range of techniques; these should be thoughtfully combined and employed over a period of time in order to improve validity of findings from community participation. (Gardner, Pijawka \& Trevan, 2014, p, 15)

A public hearing may be a formal meeting for receiving testimony from the public at large on a local issue, or proposed government action. Testimony from both sides of an issue is usually recorded for public record, and a report summarizing the key points is generated. All levels of government hold public hearings - from city on up to the national level. Sometimes, formal public hearings are mandated by law (on the environmental impact of a proposed highway project, for example). In other cases, government officials use them to gather information that will help them in making decisions or drafting legislation.

## PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT

The objective of this section of the plan is to inform the members of the Chinle Chapter Government (Chapter) and the general public about land use planning events and activities and to encourage Chapter member involvement in the land use planning decisions. Several strategies are provided to address these objectives and are described below.

Objective: Increase public awareness of land use planning efforts and events

1. The Chapter Staff and CLUPC members will:
a) Arrange for public service announcements on local radio stations and in the Gallup Independent and the Navajo Times for the Land Use Planning Committee meetings and the Public Hearings. The meetings and hearings will be listed in the Chapter's Schedule of Meetings and Activities and post on its website and hosted on the marquee sign.
b) Disseminate flyers for the Land Use Planning Public Hearings.

Strategy 1: Invite public input and comments during the CLUPC meetings, Public Hearings and Chapter Meeting agenda items related to land use planning, projects and community planning.

1. All Chapter residents are invited to attend the Land Use Planning Committee meetings. Comments from the audience will be requested during the meetings and the CLUPC Secretary will take notes of these comments for inclusion in the planning process.
2. The CLUPC will hold special public education sessions for the community when there are important policy decisions or projects which need to be discussed.
3. At least two (2) Public Hearings will be held related to projects and land use planning policy. The first Public Hearing can be conducted by the CLUPC. The second Public Hearing must be held prior to or during a regularly scheduled Chapter Meeting. All directly affected parties will be provided an opportunity to present their support or objections to the project. Adequate time will be provided during the Public Hearings to take comments and questions from the audience. The CLUPC and the Chapter Officials will also discuss their responses, questions and concerns and take any official action before the audience.

## COMMUNITY EDUCATION

It is critical in any democratic system that the members of the community have opportunities to become educated in the issues facing the community. Land use policy and individual development projects can have impacts on the community which are complex. It is important to provide community education to help Chapter Members and residents understand how land use planning decisions will affect their lives.

Strategy 2: Increase community and CLUPC knowledge of planning principles and project findings, analysis and results.

Community education in planning can take several forms:
$\checkmark$ Have the CLUPC, project sponsor(s), consultant(s) and other experts provide educational presentations at CLUPC meetings.
$\checkmark$ Have the CLUPC organize and conduct community education sessions on planning issues and specific projects.
$\checkmark$ Invite the administration and staff members from various departments of the Navajo Nation to make presentations during CLUPC and Chapter Meetings.
$\checkmark$ Have the CLUPC or a project's sponsor make a longer educational presentation at the beginning of a Public Hearing to inform chapter members as to 1) The proposed project or policy, 2) The CLUPC's recommendations, and 3) The Chapter's options or next steps.

## Strategy 3: Increase community member and CLUPC knowledge of Navajo Nation land use related laws.

It is important that members of the CLUPC, the Chapter Officials and the Chapter members learn more about land use laws in the Navajo Nation Code and the Federal Statutes. Some of these topics are listed below:
$\checkmark$ Land Use Withdrawal Process
$\checkmark$ Lease Arrangements: homesites, business, church lease (issues which CLUPC might consider - how applicant intends to build, ROW, water lines, utility lines)
$\checkmark$ Grazing Act
$\checkmark$ Zoning Ordinances
$\checkmark$ Land Use Variances
$\checkmark$ Eminent Domain Requirements
$\checkmark$ Water Quality and Navajo
Environmental Protection Act (EPA)

## Strategy 4: Encourage Chinle Chapter Government residents and public involvement in the land use planning process by providing presentations or focus sessions to community groups when needed.

The CLUPC public participation plan goals include an objective to conduct either focus groups or make presentations to groups within the Chapter area including: grazing permitees, businesses, community organizations, schools and churches.

The updating of the Chinle's 2006 Community Based Comprehensive Land Use Plan that evolved into the development of this Community Land Use Plan included local community involvement over a six-month time frame. The involvement by Chinle community members, chapter officials, chapter administration, and various committee members was of the utmost priority. Many different opportunities were provided throughout the process for local community members to voice their opinions and desires about the future Chinle's community direction. The process began with a community-wide "Comprehensive Land Use Plan" development workshop conducted by the Navajo Nation's Community Development Department \& Government Services to provide land use planning updates. Several other events held included working directly with the Chinle Land Use Planning Committee members to address and update the Plan including the housing, open space, economic development, infrastructure, and overall approval process for minor and major projects.

In addition to these meetings, a comprehensive community survey was developed in the Spring \& Summer of 2015 and we have obtained an inputted approximately 388 community
surveys. Chinle Chapter Government also got community response from tribal programs, local businesses/enterprises, and missionary programs. The results of the survey were used to assist in developing Community Land Use Plan's Elements, goals and strategies; and are located in the Element sections.

# CHINLE CHAPTER GOVERNMENT 

## Comprehensive Land Use Plan (CLUP) Community Survey

## Constant Contact Survey Results

Survey Name: Copy of Chinle Chapter Govemments Community Survey
Response Status: Partial \& Completed
Filter: None
12/2/2015 4:47 PM MST

Please rank the COMMUNITY statement below on a scale of 1 to 5 regarding the importance of the Chinle Community to you. ( $1=$ Not Important to $5=$ Most Important)
1 = Not Important, 2 = Somewhat Unimportant, 3 = Indifferent, 4 = Somewhat Important, 5 = Most Important


## as it is?

*The Rating Score is the weighted average calculated by dividing the sum of all weighted ratings by the number of total responses.

Please rank the QUALITY OF LIFE statement below on a scale of 1 to 5 regarding the importance of the Chinle's Quality of Life to you. ( $1=$ Not Important to $5=$ Most Important)
1 = Not Important, 2 = Somewhat Unimportant, 3 = Indifferent, 4 = Somewhat Important, 5 = Most Important

*The Rating Score is the weighted average calculated by dividing the sum of all weighted ratings by the number of total responses.

Please rank the MOBILITY AND TRANSPORTATION statement below on a scale of 1 to 5 regarding the importance of the Chinle's Mobility and Transportation to you. (1 = Not Important to $5=$ Most Important) $1=$ Not Important, 2 = Somewhat Unimportant, 3 = Indifferent, 4 = Somewhat Important, 5 = Most Important


Please rank the ENVIRONMENT statement below on a scale of 1 to 5 regarding the importance of the
Chinle's Environment to you. ( $1=$ Not Important to $5=$ Most Important)
1 = Not Important, 2 =Somewhat Unimportant, $3=$ Indifferent, $4=$ Somewhat Important, $5=$ Most Important


Please rank the ECONOMY statement below on a scale of 1 to 5 regarding the importance of the Chinle's Economy to you. ( $1=$ Not Important to $5=$ Most Important)
1 = Not Important, 2 = Somewhat Unimportant, 3 = Indifferent, 4 = Somewhat Important, 5 = Most Important

| Answer | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | Number of Response(s) | Rating Score* |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Variety of local businesses? |  |  |  |  |  | 388 | 4.7 |
| Local employment opportunities? |  |  |  |  |  | 386 | 4.6 |
| Incorporating commercial development into appropriate community design? |  |  |  |  |  | 388 | 4.5 |
| Access to and use advances |  |  |  |  |  | 388 | 4.5 |

in technology?
*The Rating Score is the weighted average calculated by dividing the sum of all weighted ratings by the number of total responses

## TextBlock:

Community Values: What is the best way to accommodate future growth?

How long have you been a resident of Chinle and/or surrounding communities?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Less than 1 year |  |  | 9 | 2.3 \% |
| 1 to 5 years |  |  | 29 | 7.4 \% |
| 6 to 10 years |  |  | 75 | 19.3 \% |
| 11 to 15 years |  |  | 64 | 16.4 \% |
| 16 to 20 years |  |  | 46 | 11.8 \% |
| 21 to 25 years |  |  | 65 | 16.7 \% |
| More than 25 years |  |  | 117 | 30.1 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 388 | 100\% |

Are you a registered voter of Chinle Chapter Government?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Yes |  |  | 312 | 80.4 \% |
| No |  |  | 74 | 19.0 \% |
| No Response(s) |  |  | 2 | <1\% |
|  |  | Totals | 388 | 100\% |

What is your gender?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Male |  |  | 243 | 62.6 \% |
| Female |  |  | 144 | 37.1 \% |
| No Response(s) |  |  | 1 | <1\% |
|  |  | Totals | 388 | 100\% |

How many individuals in your household are in the following age ranges?
$1=1,2=2,3=3,4=4,5=5,6=6,7=7,8=8+$

| Answer | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | Number of Response(s) | Rating Score* |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 9 or younger |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 88 | 1.1 |
| 10 to 14 years of age |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 60 | 1.0 |
| 15 to 19 years of age |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 93 | 1.1 |
| 20 to 24 years of age |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 74 | 1.0 |
| 25 to 34 years of age |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 105 | 1.0 |
| 35 to 44 years of age |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 108 | 1.1 |
| 45 to 54 years of age |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 78 | 1.1 |
| 55 to 64 years of age |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 50 | 1.1 |
| More than 64 years of age |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 27 | 1.0 |

*The Rating Score is the weighted average calculated by dividing the sum of all weighted ratings by the number of total responses.

About how much was the gross income for your household in 2014 ? (Include all persons in the household for which a tax return was filed).

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Less than \$10,000 |  |  | 43 | 11.1 \% |
| \$10,000 to \$14,999 |  |  | 25 | 6.5 \% |
| \$15,000 to \$24,999 |  |  | 25 | 6.5 \% |
| \$25,000 to \$34,999 |  |  | 55 | 14.3 \% |
| \$35,000 to \$49,999 |  |  | 75 | 19.5 \% |
| \$50,000 to \$74,999 |  |  | 86 | 22.3 \% |
| \$75,000 to \$99,999 |  |  | 75 | 19.5 \% |
| \$100,000 to \$149,999 |  |  | 28 | 7.2 \% |
| \$150,000 to \$199,999 |  |  | 13 | 3.3 \% |
| \$200,000 or more |  |  | 6 | $1.5 \%$ |
| Not Applicable or Did Not File |  |  | 3 | $<1 \%$ |
|  |  | Totals | 384 | 100\% |

What is the highest level of education attainment among those in your household?

$$
1=1,2=2,3=3,4=4,5=5
$$

| Answer | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | Number of Response(s) | Rating Score |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Less than High School |  |  |  |  | 105 | 1.1 |
| Some College |  |  |  |  | 71 | 1.1 |
| College Degree |  |  |  |  | 165 | 1.1 |
| High School/GED |  |  |  |  | 58 | 1.0 |
| Associate or Technical Degree (2 Years) |  |  |  |  | 116 | 1.1 |
| Post Graduate Work or Degree |  |  |  |  | 69 | 1.0 |

Overall, how satisfied are you with Chinle/vicinity as a place to live?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Satisfied |  |  | 116 | 29.8 \% |
| Somewhat Satisfied |  |  | 141 | 36.3 \% |
| Somewhat Dissatisfied |  |  | 103 | 26.5 \% |
| Dissatisfied |  |  | 25 | 6.4 \% |
| No Response(s) |  |  | 3 | <1\% |
|  |  | Totals | 388 | 100\% |

## TextBlock:

Future population growth will result in an increase number of land-use decisions facing Chinle Chapter Government.

What type of economic or business development initiative do you think Chinle community needs?
1 = Agree, 2 = Allow but Not Encouraged, 3 = Disagree

| Answer | 1 | 2 | 3 | Number of Response(s) | Rating Score |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Convenience Store |  |  |  | 388 | 1.2 |
| Other Services (ie health, gasoline, restaurant, etc) |  |  |  | 388 | 1.2 |
| Shopping Centers or Other Retails |  |  |  | 388 | 1.2 |
| Office Parks |  |  |  | 388 | 1.4 |
| Other Office-Type Businesses |  |  |  | 388 | 1.3 |
| Agricultural-related Businesses |  |  |  | 388 | 1.2 |
| Recreational Facilities (ie youth centers or multipurpose buildings) |  |  |  | 388 | 1.2 |
| Family Farms |  |  |  | 388 | 1.2 |
| Community Farms |  |  |  | 387 | 1.3 |
| Large Corporate Livestock Farms |  |  |  | 387 | 1.3 |

Farms
*The Rating Score is the waighted average calculated by dividing the sum of all weighted ratings by the number of total responses.

What type of economic or business development initiative do you think Chinle community needs?
1 = Agree, 2 = Allow but Not Encouraged, 3 = Disagree



Continue: In planning for future development, to what degree should Chinle Chapter Government's Officials promote or discourage action in each of the following areas? (check one box per item) $1=$ Strongly Promote, $2=$ Promote, $3=$ Take No Action, 4 = Discourage, 5 = Strongly Discourage

| Answer | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | Number of Response(s) | Rating Score* |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Artisan Vendor/Training Programs |  |  |  |  |  | 384 | 1.5 |
| Small Business and/or Economic Development |  |  |  |  |  | 388 | 1.4 |
| Educational Institutional Development |  |  |  |  |  | 388 | 1.3 |
| Churches/Religion Purposes |  |  |  |  |  | 386 | 1.4 |
| Other(s) Comment Below: |  |  |  |  |  | 79 | 1.3 |

*The Rating Score is the weighted average calculated by dividing the sum of all weighted ratings by the number of total responses.

From the list below, please check the most important issues and or concerns that you feel currently face the Chnle Chapter Government/community. (check as many as possible)


Are you satisfied with the public services in the Chinle community? (The following list includes primary services provided to Chinle residents. Please check the best corresponds to your level of satisfaction with each service).


[^0]
## TextBlock:

Residential, Commercial and Industrial Land Use Issues: What Should Be Allowed and Where?

Where should new housing development be located in Chinle?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Existing Navajo Housing Authority (NHA) locations. |  |  | 140 | 36.0\% |
| Existing BIA locations. |  |  | 157 | 40.4 \% |
| Existing Indian Health Service (IHS) locations. |  |  | 132 | 34.0 \% |
| New mixed use town design (commercial, office, residential) |  |  | 80 | 20.6 \% |
| Homesite or Scattered Locations |  |  | 45 | 11.5 \% |
| None |  |  | 7 | 1.8 \% |
| No Opinion |  |  | 56 | 14.4 \% |
| Other |  |  | 5 | 1.2 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 388 | 100\% |

Should business development be concentrated in selected areas or dispersed throughout the community?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Locate in the proposed/approved Chinle's business corridor or location |  |  | 144 | 37.2 \% |
| Locate in current or expired business site lease locations. |  |  | 190 | 49.0\% |
| No Opinion |  |  | 91 | 23.5 \% |
| None |  |  | 18 | 4.6 \% |
| Other |  |  | 4 | $1.0 \%$ |
|  |  | Totals | 387 | 100\% |

Please indicate where you reside (please refer to the map). I live in Chinle Chapter Government, Area (A to E).

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A - Valley Store towards Many Farms |  |  | 124 | 32.1 \% |
| B - Airport to Pinon Junction |  |  | 50 | 12.9 \% |
| C- Downtown Chinle |  |  | 75 | 19.4 \% |
| D - Pork Chop Hills, CUSD Admin, Beverly Hills, BIA |  |  | 49 | 12.6 \% |
| E. T-Bird Area (Del Muerto, Spider Rock \& Canyon De Chelly) |  |  | 50 | 12.9 \% |
| I live in another Chapter but a member of Chinle Chapter Government (please identify your Chapter in Comment Section) |  |  | 5 | 1.2 \% |
| I live within another chapter, city, town or state. (please indicate location below) |  |  | 31 | 8.0 \% |
| Other |  |  | 5 | 1.2 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 386 | 100\% |

Are you employed?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Yes |  |  | 322 | 83.2 \% |
| No |  |  | 32 | 8.2 \% |
| Self Employed |  |  | 23 | 5.9 \% |
| Retired |  |  | 17 | 4.3 \% |
| Student |  |  | 3 | <1\% |
| Other |  |  | 0 | 0.0 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 387 | 100\% |

If employed, indicate where you work:

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Within Chinle |  |  | 296 | 82.4 \% |
| Outside Chinle but within 20 mile radius of the Chapter |  |  | 51 | 14.2 \% |
| Other Chapter, City or town/state (please indicate in Comment Section) |  |  | 15 | 4.1 \% |
| Not Applicable or Unemployed |  |  | 5 | 1.3 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 359 | 100\% |

Do you hold any land use leases or permits? Indicate which type and Areas (See Map, areas are lettered "A" though "E."

| Answer | 0\% 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Grazing Permit (Indicate Area in Comment Section Below) |  | 111 | 55.7 \% |
| Farming Permit (Indicate Area in Comment Section Below) |  | 50 | 25.1 \% |
| Housing Lease (Indicate Area in Comment Section Below) |  | 109 | 54.7 \% |
| Business Site Lease (Indicate Area in Comment Section Below) |  | 0 | 0.0 \% |
| Other |  | 0 | 0.0 \% |
|  | Totals | 199 | 100\% |

Please check the following selection with 1 being the most important to 5 least important. What is best about Chinle's land development purposes right now?.
1 = 1 - Very Important, 2 = 2 - Important, $3=3$ - Neutral, $4=4$ - Somewhat Important, $5=5$ - Least Important

*The Rating Score is the weighted average calculated by dividing the sum of all weighted ratings by the number of total responses.

Please rank, with (1) being the most important and (3) being the least important; the three most important improvements that could be made to the Chapter's land area:
1=1-Most Important, $2=2$ - Neutral, 3 = 3-Least Important


Please rank, with (1) being the most important and (3) being the least important; the following three most specific housing projects for the Chinle Chapter Government:
1 = 1 - Most Important, 2 = 2 - Neutral, 3 = 3 - Least Important

| Answer | 12 | 3 | Number of Response(s) | Rating Score* |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| New Subdivision (List preferred location in the Comment section) |  |  | 380 | 1.7 |
| Scattered Sites for Housing (List preferred location in the Comment section) |  |  | 379 | 1.8 |
| New Clustered Sites for <br> Housing (List preferred |  |  | 379 | 1.9 |

Housing (List preferred
location in the Comment
section)
*The Rating Score is the weighted average calculated by dividing the sum of all weighted ratings by the number of total responses.

Please rank, with (1) being the most important and (5) being the least important; the top five specific other projects for the Chinle Chapter Government:
1=1 - Most Important, 2 = 2 - Important, 3=3-Neutral, 4=4-Somewhat Important, 5=5-Least Important


Please rank, with (1) being the most important, the top three actions that Chapter Officials/Navajo Nation Programs can take to improve the Chinle community.
1 = 1 - Most Important, 2 =2 - Important, 3 = 3-Least Important

| Answer | 1 | 2 | 3 | Number of Response(s) | Rating Score* |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Develop Zoning Codes. |  |  |  | 388 | 1.8 |
| Establish Range Management Units. |  |  |  | 387 | 1.8 |
| Work with Grazing Permit holders for them to work with other Chapter needs. |  |  |  | 386 | 1.6 |
| Work with other Chapter on regional projects. |  |  |  | 387 | 1.7 |
| Other Actions (please list in |  |  |  | 78 | 1.5 |

Comment Section below)
*The Rating Score is the weighted average calculated by dividing the sum of all weighted ratings by the number of total responses.

Please rank, with (1) being the most important, the top three actions that individuals households and families can take to improve the Chinle community.
$1=1$ - Most Important, $2=2$ - Important, $3=3$ - Least Important


What relates to your opinion regarding development in the Chinle community? IN MY OPINION..... 1 = Yes, 2 = No, 3 = Do Not Know


Other general suggestions and/or opinions:
30 Response(s)


Constant Contact Survey Results

Survey Name: Chinle_Business Survey
Response Status: Partial \& Completed
Filter: None
12/2/2015 4:52 PM MST

## * Facility:

7 Response(s)

[^1]7 Response(s)

## Business/Enterprise:

Answers Number of Response(s)
First Name ..... 7
Last Name ..... 7
Job Title ..... 7
Company Name ..... 7
Work Phone ..... 7
Email Address ..... 4
Address 1 ..... 6
City ..... 7
State/Province<br / > (US/Canada) ..... 7
Postal Code ..... 7
Type of Service(s) and/or Product(s):
7 Response(s)
Number of Client(s):
7 Response(s)

## TextBlock:

## Description of Current Facility:

How many acres/square feet is the Administration?
4 Response(s)

What size is your conference room?
7 Response(s)

| Does your facility have handicapped accessibility? |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Answer | $\mathbf{0 \%}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 \%}$ | Number of <br> Response(s) |
| Yes: |  |  | Response <br> Ratio |
| No: |  |  | 1 | | $85.7 \%$ |
| ---: |

TextBlock:
Parking Lot(s):

Is your parking lot graveled?

| Answer | $0 \%$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 \%}$ | Number of <br> Response(s) | Response <br> Ratio |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Yes |  |  | 3 | $42.8 \%$ |
| No |  |  |  | 3 |


| Is your parking lot paved? |  | Number of | Response <br> Ratio |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Answer | $0 \%$ | $100 \%$ | Response(s) | 4 | $57.1 \%$ |
| Yes |  |  | 3 | $42.8 \%$ |  |
| No |  |  | 0 | $0.0 \%$ |  |
| Other |  |  | 0 | $0.0 \%$ |  |
| No Response(s) |  | Totals | 7 | $100 \%$ |  |

Is your parking lot unimproved?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Yes |  |  | 3 | 42.8 \% |
| No |  |  | 3 | 42.8 \% |
| Other |  |  | 0 | 0.0 \% |
| No Response(s) |  |  | 1 | 14.2 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 7 | 100\% |

Please provide a description of current staffing:
numbers of staff, organization chart, etc.
7 Response(s)

Are the
facility, staffing and programs adequate to meet current program's needs?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Yes |  |  | 6 | 85.7 \% |
| No (if no, provide comment below) |  |  | 1 | 14.2 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 7 | 100\% |

Do you expect the business to expand or
increase over the next five (5) years?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| No |  |  | 1 | 14.2 \% |
| Yes (if yes, provide comment below on whether its the program, facility, client base or organization) |  |  | 6 | 85.7 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 7 | 100\% |

Are there any plans for expanding services, program, and/or facilities?

| Answer 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| No |  | 3 | 42.8 \% |
| Yes (if yes, do you have a site for new and/or expanded facilities?) |  | 5 | 71.4 \% |
|  | Totals | 7 | 100\% |

Do you have business site lease?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Yes |  |  | 6 | 85.7 \% |
| No |  |  | 1 | 14.2 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 7 | 100\% |

Is your business...?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Homebased |  |  | 0 | 0.0 \% |
| Lease Office/Retail Space |  |  | 6 | 85.7 \% |
| Mobile |  |  | 1 | 14.2 \% |
| Other |  |  | 1 | 14.2 \% |
| Totals |  |  | 7 | 100\% |

# CHINLE CHAPTER GOVERNMEN ${ }^{-}$ Community Facilities Survey FoI TRIBAL PROGRAMS (Chapter Compound) 

Constant Contact Survey Results

Survey Name: Tribal Programs_Chinle
Response Status: Completed
Filter: None
12/2/2015 4:50 PM MST
*Facility:
3 Response(s)

## Organization:

Answers Number of Response(s)
First Name ..... 3
Last Name ..... 3
Job Title ..... 3
Company Name ..... 3
Work Phone ..... 3
Email Address ..... 1
Address 1 ..... 3
City ..... 3
State/Province<br /> (US/Canada) ..... 3
Postal Code ..... 3
Physical Location ..... 3
Website ..... 0

Type of Service(s):
3 Response(s)

Number of Client(s):
3 Response(s)

TextBlock:
Description of Current Facility:

How many acres/square feet is the Administration?
3 Response(s)

What size is your conference room?

Does your facility have handicapped accessibility?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Yes: |  |  | 3 | 100.0\% |
| No: |  |  | 0 | 0.0 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 3 | 100\% |

## TextBlock:

Parking Lot(s):

Is your parking lot graveled?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Yes |  |  | 0 | 0.0 \% |
| No |  |  | 3 | 100.0 \% |
| Other |  |  | 0 | 0.0 \% |
| No Response(s) |  |  | 0 | 0.0 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 3 | 100\% |

Is your parking lot paved?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Yes |  |  | 0 | 0.0 \% |
| No |  |  | 2 | 66.6 \% |
| Other |  |  | 1 | 33.3 \% |
| No Response(s) |  |  | 0 | 0.0 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 3 | 100\% |

Is your parking lot unimproved?

| Answer | $\mathbf{0 \%}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 \%}$ | Number of <br> Response(s) | Response <br> Ratio |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | ---: |
| Yes |  |  | 3 | $100.0 \%$ |
| No |  |  | 0 | $0.0 \%$ |
| Other |  |  | 0 | $0.0 \%$ |
| No Response(s) |  | Totals | 0 | $0.0 \%$ |
|  |  |  | $\mathbf{3}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 \%}$ |

Please provide a description of current staffing:
numbers of staff, organization chart, etc.
3 Response(s)

Are the
facility, staffing and programs adequate to meet current program's needs?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Yes |  |  | 2 | 66.6 \% |
| No (if no, provide comment below) |  |  | 1 | 33.3 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 3 | 100\% |

Do you expect the organization to expand or increase over the next five (5) years?

| Answer | 0\% | 100\% | Number of Response(s) | Response Ratio |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| No |  |  | 0 | 0.0 \% |
| Yes (if yes, provide comment below on whether its the program, facility, client base or organization) |  |  | 3 | 100.0 \% |
|  |  | Totals | 3 | 100\% |

Are there any plans for expanding services, program, and/or facilities?








## APPENDICES: Chapter Boundary (Supporting Documents)

I. Bureau of Indian Affairs, Federal-Aid Indian Road System, Navajo Area. Navajo Nation Chapter Boundaries Appended, Chapter Boundaries Reviewed and Adopted by the Navajo Nation Court of Appeals, Case No. A-CV-19-77, March 17, 1978 EXHIBIT - A
II. Court Case WR-RO-477-77, Frank Yazzie, et. al., Plaintiff vs. Ron Faich, Director Research \& Statistic Division, Navajo Nation, Defendant. A-CV-19-77, Navajo Nation ex. Rel. Ron Faich vs. Merwin Lynch, District Judge of the Navajo Nation. Certification of Findings and Opinion to the Court of Appeals of the Navajo Nation, March 17, 1978. JOHN, C., District Judge, Shiprock, New Mexico, sitting by designation and NESWOOD, M., District Judge, Crownpoint, New Mexico, sitting by designation ..... EXHIBIT - B
III. MAP - Chinle Service Area 2002: Chinle Chapter Service Area ..... EXHIBIT - C
IV. LSR Innovations Research and Planning. Excerpts from Chapter Images, Profiles of Navajo Nation Chapters. Division of Community Development, 2004 ..... EXHIBIT - E
V. MAP: Census 2010 ..... EXHIBIT - F

## EXHIBIT - A

## EXHIBIT - A
































































## EXHIBIT - B

IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF THE NAVAJO NATION WiNDOW ROCK, NAVAJO NATION (ARIZONA)
WR-RO-477~77Frank Yazzie, et. al. .
Plaintiff
vS.
Ron Faich, Director
Research \& Statistic Division
Navajo Nation.
Defendant
A-CV-19-77
Navajo Nation ex. rel. Ron Faich
vS.
Merwin Lynch, District Judge of the Navajo Nation
CERTIFICATIONOF FINDINGS AND OPINION TO THECOURT OF APPEALS OF THE NAVAJO NATION
March 17, 1978
JOHN, C., District Judge
Shiprock, New Mexico, sitting by designation

> and
NESWOOD, M. , District Judge
Crownpoint, New Mexico, sitting by designation.

Upon the order of the Court of Appeals of the Navajo Nation dated November 8, 1977, this District Court begar, conducting public hearings on December 30, 1977, and concluded them on January 27, 1978. The findings and opinion of this Court is herewith certified to the Court of Appeals.

The purpose of the public hearings was to give the Navajo People in chapters where "boundary line" disputes existed an opportunity to present evidence to the Court to determine those boundaries.

From the beginning, the intent and purpose of the Court of Appeals opinion was confused by innuendos and "off-the-cuff" speculations. Many people were_very concerned and upset over the Court's establishing and changing customary grazing areas or other land usage rights. This Court exhaustively explained that these lines would not and will not alter or affect customary grazing or other land usage rights. However, it is the opinion of this Court at the conclusion of the hearings that misunderstandings still exist.

It is important here to stress the valid fear and anxiety of the Navajo People that somehow these boundaries will someday be used as a mechanism by the Tribal Council to change certain criteria in customary grazing and other land usage rights throughout the Navajo Reservation.

It is equally important to recommend to the Court of Appeals to.
emphasize to and direct Dr. Ron Faich to transpose the boundary/census enumeration lines established by this Court to the orthoquad maps.

The establishment of these boundary/census enumeration lines will not alter the meaning and intent of 3 N.T.C. $\$ 305$ which states:
"The Commissioner of Indian Affairs has established and will retain the present land management districts within the Navajo Indian Reservation, based on the social and economic requirements of the Navajo Indians and the necessity of rehabilitating the grazing lands. District boundary changes may be made when deemed necessary and advisable by the District Grazing Committee, Central Grazing Committee and Tribal Council, with the approval of the Superintendent, Area Director, and the Commissioner of Indian Affairs.
(emphasis added)

One other area of great concern about which this Court ought to comment is the biased and unsubstantiated allegations purportedly originating from the Executive Branch that the District Judge conducting the hearings and the Judicial Branch instigated the public hearings. At least one chapter has passed a resolution calling for the removal of a District Judge from the bench for conducting these hearings and, ironically, it is the chapter which the present Navajo Tribal Council Chairman claims as his domicile and voting precinct - the Teec Nos Pos Chapter.

It is undoubtedly clear from correspondences between Chairman Peter MacDonald and the Bureau of the Census, United States Department
of Commerce that as early as September 26, 1975, the establishment of chapter boundaries for enumeration districts was being planned between Mr. MacDonald and Jacob Silver, Chief, Geography Division of the Bureau of the Census.

Further, it is revealed in a letter from the Director of the Bureau of the Census, Vincent P. Barabba, dated September 26, 1977, that the Executive Branch agreed the enumeration districts for the 1980 census should correspond "...as nearly as possible, to the chapter boundaries."

The other cry of hysteria generated by the Executive Branch is "a promise" of a suit by the Department of Justice if the Navajo Tribal Council did not approve and implement a reapportionment plan by Februaxy 1, 1978. This is far from the facts. A letter from Joan F. Hartman, Office of Indian Rights, United States Department of Justice to Ms. Katherine Ott of Vlassis, Ruzow and Crowder, General Counsel to the Navajo Tribal Council, contained specific language that a suit would not be filed as long as the Tribe indicated by some formal assurances that the redistricting was in progress in time to "...educate the electorate about the changes, prior to the August, 1978 nomination process." The "formal assurances" which the Department of Justice wanted were being complied with through these public hearings. Only if the Council had not approved and adopted a reapportionment plan by the end of October. 1978 would the

Department of Justice file suit.

Neither the District Judge nor the Judicial Branch instigated the establishment of these chapter boundaries/census enumeration lines. If any branch of the government is to receive that "credit" , it properly belongs to the Executive Branch.

The order in which this Court will decide the chapter boundary/ census enumeration lines is as follows:

1. The undisputed lines.
2. Mutual settlements between chapters.
3. Disputed claims.

Fortunately, not all chapters were in dispute as to these boundaries. Many chapters either failed to submit claims or to proceed with submitted claims. Others did not dispute the proposed lines.

UNDISPUTED CHAPTER BOUNDARIES/ CENSUS ENUMERATION LINES

Any chapter which did not dispute the lines or any chapter that failed to proceed with its claim based on the proposed boundary lines as outlined on the orthophoto quadrants reflecting land management districts as established by the Commissioner of Indian Affairs will have those lines established as their chapter boundaries/census enumeration lines.
reflected on District Court Reference Map 2, 1937 Land Management District established by the Bureau of Indian Affairs. This line will be approved by this Court.

## 5. Two Grey Hills Chapter vs. Sanostee Chapter

The proposed chapter boundary/census enumeration line disputed by these chapters was mutually settled in open court on January 11, 1978, at the Shiprock District Cart. The agreed to lines are shown on District Court Reference Map 4 and are approved by this Court.
6. Mexican Water - Red Mesa vs. Sweetwater Chapter .

The chapter boundary/census enumeration line dispute between these chapters was resolved by mutual agreement in the Shiprock District Court on January 11, 1978.

The mutual settlement between the chapters is reflected on District Court Reference Map 5 and is approved by this Court.

## DISPUTED CLAIMS

1. Klagetoh-Wide Ruins vs. Greasewood, Cornfields, and Ganado

According to testimony presented, the southwestern boundary of Wide Ruins is not populated on a continuous basis. In fact, the testimony presented only seasonal grazing usage in the disputed area. The area this Court is referring to is the area just north of the Fifth Standard Parallel

North, from the point just east of where the 345 KV power transmission crosses the Fifth Standard Parallel Line and south of the Parker Wells area.

It has been ruled by this Court that customary usage, grazing rights, and other land usage rights will not be affected by these boundary/census enumeration lines. Since this area is very sparsely populated, it would have very little impact on either chapter.

If the boundary lines were drawn as requested by the Wide Ruins Chapter - from Parker Wells slightly southeast to the reservation lineit would create an island, the boundary will be the County Line running straight north from the Fifth Standard Parallel North to the point connecting the line drawn by Klagetoh.

From that point, the boundary line as established by this Court will reflect the lines as drawn on District Court Reference Map 1 as to the Klagetoh-Wide Ruins dispute with Lower Greasewood, Cornfields, and Ganado. The eastern boundary will reflect the District 18 boundary line as established by the Bureau of Indian Affairs Land Management District.

The most controversial dispute centered on the southern boundary line of Ganado and the northern boundary line claimed by Klagetoh. The boundary/census enumeration line approved by the Court will be based upon
the most natural identifiable point - "Sagebrush Creek" - as reflected on District Court Reference Map 1(c). The area west of the Klagetoh-Ganado road claimed by Klagetoh was not disputed, and the Court therefore approves the claim.

This Court, upon much consideration, and after reviewing the lengthy testimony, feels that the decision reached above is the most equitable.
2. Beclabito vs. Teec Nos Pos -.

There seems to have been "rumors" of this dispute. However, the matter was not presented or pursued during the hearings held in Shiprock on January 11, 12, and 13. In fact, the Court had the entire day of January 13 free as those chapters scheduled to present their claims had mutually settled but no one from Teec Nos Pos presented that chapter's case.

The two chapters did submit duly enacted and approved resolutions stating their positions, and the Court in carefully reviewing these resolutions concludes there is no evidence of a dispute. Both resolutions take the position that the present boundaries established as Land Management districts by the Bureau of Indian Affairs should remain as the boundaries separating Beclabito and Teec Nos Pos.

This Court, in fairness to both chapters, will approve and establish
as the boundary/census enumeration district line the lines established by the Bureau of Indian Affairs as Land Management Districts specifically separating the Beclabito and Teec Nos Pos Chapters.
3. Burnhams, Nenahnezad and Upper Fruitland

This matter was scheduled to be heard on January 13, 1978, but the chapters failed to appear and therefore did not pursue their claims.

The District 13 Council, which represents the chapters, submitted their opposition to the boundary/census enumeration lines reflected on the orthophoto quads, and submitted their preference which they had previously approved on August 7, 1976.

Upon reviewing the position of the above chapters, this Court establishes the boundary lines to be consistent with the lines duly approved on August 7, 1976.
4. Houck, Lupton and St. Michaels vs. Oaksprings

The dispute in this particular area smacks of an attempt at increasing land usage base, which was not the purpose of these hearings.

Again, for the purpose of establishing chapter boundariés/census enumeration districts, grazing rights as well as other land usage rights will
not be altered.

Based upon the testimony presented and a review of the 1937 maps as created for Land Management Districts, the original lines lie south of the claims made by the Houck and Lupton Chapters. Therefore, it seems only equitable that the boundary lines between the above chapters ought to be. as reflected by District Court Reference Maps 6(c) and 6(b).
5. District 18 vs. Districts 14, 17 and 10 -

This area had the potential for a lengthy dispute as it involved chapters within the above districts. However, it came to the Court's attention that most of the "potential dispute" arose out of misunderstandings of the purpose in establishing the boundary/census enumeration lines and the role of this Court in establishing these lines.

Based upon the recommendation of the attorneys involved in this matter and with the consent of the parties, the presently existing Land Management Districts established in 1937 by the Bureau of Indian Affairs as recognized by these districts will be established as the boundary lines.

If, at some future date, these district lines are to be altered, the administrative procedures mandated by 3 N. T. C. $\$ 305$ ought to be controlling.

## 5. District 4 vs. District 10

The disputed area is the southwestern edge of the Rough Rock Chapter boundary and the northeastern boundary of the Forest Lake Chapter.

The testmony of both chapters revealed seasonal grazing usage by Rough Rock people in the area claimed by Forest Lake. According to the 1937 Land Management District Maps, the district line is marked by (a) on the District Court Reference Map 7. However, Rough Rock claims the line should be farther south.

Since this is a district line, the Court has previously held that there exists administrative procedures under $3 \mathrm{~N} . \mathrm{T} . \mathrm{C} . \$ 305$ to alter these lines. The testimony also revealed inter-district grazing trespasses by holders of grazing permits in District 10 grazing livestock in District 4, but the Court will not decide the merits of those complaints.

The Court establishes the line marked " $A$ " on the District Court Reference Map 7 as the boundary line. This line corresponds with the present district lines established by the Bureau of Indian Affairs in 1937 as a Land Management District.
6. Chinle vs. Many Farms

This dispute was mutually settled in open court and said settlement
is marked by " $D$ " on the District Court Reference Map 7.

## 7. Many Farms Chee Family vs. Round Rock

The Chee family in this case proceeded with an individual grazing rights claim, but since the Court was not convened for the purposes of deciding the merits of grazing rights claims, it will dismiss this claim and advise the Chee family to proceed administratively.

As to the dispute between Many Farms and Rouna Rock, this Court, after hearing testimony from both parties, established the boundary/ census enumeration line to be the one corresponding with the letter " $B$ " on District Court Reference Map 7.

## 8. Many Farms vs. Wheatfields-Tsaile

Again, this dispute is an attempt to alter Land Management District lines as established by the Bureau of Indian Affairs in 1937. It will suffice to say here that the boundary line will be marked by the letter " C " on District Court Reference Map 7:

## 9. Round Rock vs. Lukachukai

After hearing and considering testimony from both parties, Round Rock proceeded to establish a proposed chapter boundary.

That line is established by this Court as marked by the letter " $D$ ".
on District Court Reference Map 7.
10. Sanostee vs. Shiprock

The hearing on this dispute centered on three different boundary
lines. Sanostee claimed a boundary line far north of the boundary claimed by the Shiprock Chapter. The Shiprock Chapter claimed the line was that marked by the letters " $A$ " and " $B$ " on District Court Reference Map 8. Included in this dispute, apparently, was an attempt by the Joe Ben family for recognition of a grazing usage area which is marked by the letter " $D$ " on District Court Reference Map 8.

This Court cannot, in good conscience, accept the arguments raised by the Joe Ben family. Grazing disputes or claims advocated by individual families are to be resolved through administrative remedies. This is explicitly mandated by present grazing regulations enforced by the Navajo Nation. This Court would, by recognizing the Ben claim, be depriving other interested and lawful grazing right holders of their lawful use rights without due process of law. Therefore, the Court rejects this claim without further comment.

The dispute between the two chapters will be settled by establishing the boundary/census enumeration line as follows: From the point marked "C" on District Court Reference Map 8, Big Gap Reservoir, on a straight
line parallel to the southern edge of Table Mesa; then east passing north of Barber's Peak to the point marked ". C " on District Court Reference Map 8; then following the original line claimed by Shiprock to a point connecting with Chaco Wash.
11. Teec Nos Pos vs. Sweetwater and Red Mesa

In this dispute, Sweetwater advocates a northeastern boundary which Teec Nos Pos claims should be farther west and south. Teec Nos Pos claims that the line with Red Mesa runs along the mesa itself with the original boundary being along "Lone Mountain Creek".

All these neighboring chapters are adamant and stubborr in their claims making negotiated settlements virtually impossible.

The decision of this Court establishing chapter/census enumeration lines between Teec Nos Pos and Sweetwater will be reflected on District Court Reference Map 5 marked with the letter " $B$ ". The boundary/census enumeration lines between Red Mesa and Teec Nos Pos will be reflected by the lines marked " $C$ " on the same reference map.

## TUBA CITY HEARINGS

As a result of many disputes, and the request for venue changes from many chapters which desired public hearings within their agencies, this

Court enlisted the assistance of the Honorable Marie Neswood. Judge Neswood conducted hearings in Tuba City on January 9, 10, 26 and 27, concerning disputes in Districts 1, 2, 3 and 8. The decisions which foll ow are those of the Honorable Marie Neswood.

## STIPULATED AGREEMENTS

## 1. Coppermine vs. LeChee

The chapters were able to compromise and motioned the Court to dismiss their request for a public hearing. The boundary line between the two chapters is indicated by a red line.

## 2. Navajo Mountain vs. Inscription House

The agreement between the chapters with further clarification by the Court is indicated on the larger map by a yellow line over a blue line.

## 3. Chilchinbeto vs. Kayenta

The representatives from both areas have informed the Court that a settlement was reached. However, a written settlement was not submitted to this Court.

The boundary/census enumeration line will be: Beginning at Bé ek' id biy tajóózh jée' le' west along the road to the rim leading to Facịing Red Points; then southwest along that rim's most prominent physical feature
until it intersects with Black Mesa Rim.

## 4. Cameron and Bodaway vs. Tuba City

Attorneys for the chapters orally motioned the Court that a settlement had been reached. The boundary lines are as follows: Between Tuba City and Bodaway: The southwestern boundary is along Echo Cliffs, then east along the Moenkopi Wash.

Between Bodaway and Coalmine, the boundary is along the Moenkopi Wash to the south until it intersects the Little Colorado River.

Between Bodaway and Cameron, the boundary is along the Little Colorado River.

DISPUTED CLAIMS

## 1. Kaibeto vs. LeChee

This dispute was heard on January 9, 1978, and was settled by the LeChee Chapter agreeing to cede the land area on which the Kaibeto Schools, Mutual Help Housing and private residences are located. The area is three miles northwest of the original chapter boundary drawn by the Bureau of Land Management, commencing at the Kaibeto residential area, then southwesterly for about five miles ending at or about Mormon Ridge.
2. Red Lake vs. Kaibeto

This case was heard on January 10, 1978. The testimony was presented for the greater part of that day, and in accordance with that the following decision is entered.

Because a large area of land is set aside for a ram pasture to be used by four chapters but is now in the possession of the Kaibeto Chapter alone, the traditional line testified to by the people of Red Lake will be the boundary line of the two chapters. That line is: Commencing at Navajo Route 6260 where it meets the Navajo Reservation and Joint Use Area boundaries westerly across Navajo Route 20 and continuing along the public road indicated by the colored pencil markings on the map to the top of Preston Mesa.
3. Navajo Mountain vs. Shonto

This case was heard on January 27, 1978. The dispute centered on an area around Tall Mountain north into the Utah portion of the Navajo Reservation to the end of the Reservation. The decision of the boundaries between these two chapters is reflected on the map. The line will start at Tall Mountain Road, into Piute Canyon and use the canyon as a boundary up to the Utah State Line; then along the State Line to the District 2 and 8 boundary line.

## STIPULATED AGREEMENTS

## 1. Lower Greasewood vs. Cornfields Chapter

This Court has accepted the stipulated agreement of the above chapters by resolution dated December 21,1977 , as to the southwestern boundary of the Cornfields Chapter and the Northeastern boundary of the Lower Greasewood Chapter as reflected on District Court Reference Map I(a).
2. Cornfields Chapter vs. Ganado Chapter -

The dispute between these chapters as to the proposed boundary lines was resolved by mutual agreement of the two chapters and that agreement is approved by this Court as reflected on District Court Reference Map 1(b).

## 3. White Cone Chapter vs. Teesto Chapter

The dispute concerning this area was not heard in court, but based upon the resolution of the White Cone Chapter and the language contained therein, a mutual settlement was apparently reached. On that premise, the boundary line, as reflected on District Court Reference Map 2, 1937 Land Management District established by the Bureau of Indian Affairs, will be approved.

## 4. Sanostee vs. Red Rock Chapter

On December 18, 1977, the Red Rock Chapter passed a resolution agreeing to the proposed chapter boundary/census enumeration line as

The Navajo Mountain Chapter will now include a large portion of that which was previously the Shonto Chapter-that is, the Utah portion of the Navajo Reservation to the end of the Reservation.
4. Navajo Mountain vs. Oljato and Oljato vs. Navajo Mountain

Each chapter had a claim along either side of the District 2 and 8 boundary lines. The Court's decision is that the original District 2 and 8 boundaries ending at the Utah and Arizona State Lines shall continue to be the chapter boundaries.

## 5. Chilchinbeto vs. Dennehotso

This dispute was heard on January 10 and 26, 1978. Due to the fact that neither of these two parties had a suit against each other, a motion to that effect was requested by the Court. A written agreement was entered, leaving a section for the Court to complete.

The parties agreed to the boundary line as follows: From Tse' zhin to Hogan Chxóói to Bé ekưid bit hojóózh jée乞e to Whiterocks. The line from Tse' at' $a^{\prime} i^{\prime}$ to Tse'bitaá dzigai on to the Tuba City Agency boundary line was completed by the Court.

Dated this 14 day of March . 1978.

## EXHIBIT - C

# Chinl Chapter Gove.iment <br> The navajo Nation 

Andy R. Ayze

## Myron McLaughlin

VICE PRESIDENT

Leonard Pete<br>council delegate

Eugene Tso<br>GRAZLNG COMMITTEE MEMBER

## RESOLUTION OF THE CHINLE CHAPTER GOVERNMENT NAVAJO NATION <br> CHIN-APR-16-030


#### Abstract

REQUESTING THE RESOURCES AND DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE AND THE NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL TO APPROVE THE CHINLE CHAPTER BOUNDARY, IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE ENCOMPASSING OF TWO (2) MAPS APPROVED BY THE NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL IN 1977 (EXHIBIT "A") AND THE CENSUS 2010 BOUNDARY MAP (EXHIBIT "B") WHEN COMBINED WILL REPRESENT THE CURRENT CHINLE CHAPTER BOUNDARY AND IS REFLECTED THROUGH THE CURRENT CENSUS 2010 BOUNDARY MAP.


## WHEREAS:

1. Chinle Chapter, a recognized certified local government of the Navajo Nation, vested with the power and authority to advocate on behalf of its constituents for the improvement of health, education, safety and general welfare; and
2. Chinle Chapter Government is a lecal government established as a Chapter under the Navajo Nation on February 14, 1956 and it is the $32^{\text {nd }}$ Navajo Nation Chapter to become LGA Certified out of 110 Chapters; and
3. The Chinle Chapter Boundary once formally approved will set the current boundary limits for the chapter as well as for neighboring chapters, as current Chinle Chapter registered voters can be seen in the indicated areas; and
4. The attached Exhibit " C ", Certification of Findings and Opinion to the Court of Appeals of the Navajo Nation, A-CV-19-77, dated March 17, 1978 identifies undisputed chapter boundaries will have lines established as their chapter boundaries/census enumeration lines. Other findings reference Chinle Chapter in the same document on \#5 and \#6; and
5. Exhibit " $A$ " and Exhibit "B" are very similar. Exhibit A as previously mentioned was does not include an area East of Spider Rock namely Bat Trail and another side canyon where Chinle Chapter serves these residents; and
6. Chinle Chapter definitely recognizes and included the Bat Trail Area as an area that needs to be encompassed within the Chinle Chaptet boundaries and should be included; and
7. Chinle Chapter is in the process of finalizing and updating the Chapter Land Use Plan, within the final product we are proposing to include the Chapter boundary area as identified and it shall be utilized for the purposes of existing and/or future development, collection of taxes and other amenities within the Chapter.

## NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT:

1. Chinle Chapter is requesting the Resources and Development Committee and the Navajo Nation Council to Approve the Chinle Chapter Boundary, in Accordance with the Encompassing of Two (2) Maps Approved by the Navajo Nation Council iin 1977 (Exhibit "A") and the Census 2010 Boundary Map (Exhibit "B"), when Combined will Represent the Current Chinle Chapter Boundary and is Reflected Through the Current Census 2010 Boundary Map.


#### Abstract

Page Two: CHIN-APR-16-: REQUESTING THE RESOURCES AND DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE AND THE NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL TO APPROVE THE CHINLE CHAPTER BOUNDARY, IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE ENCOMPASSING OF TWO (2) MAPS APPROVED BY THE NAVAJO NATION COUNCIL IN 1977 (EXHIBIT "A") AND THE CENSUS 2010 BOUNDARY MAP (EXHIBIT "B"), WHEN COMBINED WILL REPRESENT THE CURRENT CHINLE CHAPTER BOUNDARY AND IS REFLECTED THROUGH THE CURRENT CENSUS 2010 BOUNDARY MAP.


## CERTIFICATION

We, hereby certify that the foregoing chapter resolution was duly considered by the Chine Chapter at a duly called meeting in Chine, Navajo Nation (Arizona) at which a quorum was present and that the same was passed by a vote of 21 in favor, $\varnothing$ opposed, and 4 abstained, this $17^{\text {th }}$ day of April 2016.

Motioned by:

TIMOTHY BEGAY

Andy R. Ayze, President

Second by:


## CHIN-APR-16-030 (Attachment A)

NOTE: This map was compiled from pages 27, 28, 34 \& 35 from the Bureau of Indian Affairs Federal - Aid Road System, Navajo Area, 1974; Navajo Nation Council Approved 1977



## EXHIBIT - D

## CHINLE SERVICE

AREA 2002

## EXHIBIT - D



## EXHIBIT - E




Compiled, Edited, and Prepared by:


LSR Innovations
Research and Planning

April 2004

DIVISION OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
The Navajo Nation
PO Box 1896
Window Rock, Navajo Nation (AZ) 86515
928.871.6810

## 2004

## CONTRIBUTORS

## Community Service Coordinators and/or <br> Office Specialists at each Navajo Nation Chapter

(See individual credit at the end of each chapter profile; contributors from previous editions are maintained)

## Central operations contributors:

Gloria Dennison Lolita Spencer DeAnn Toadlena Edison Blatchford Joe Hausner Beth Casscaddan Marlene Price Laverne Wyaco Lucinda Damon Leslie Sandoval

Navajo Election Administration
Department of Head Start
Navajo Transit System Tribal Property
Navajo Communications Company; Frontier Ft Defiance Housing Corporation Navajo Housing Authority Navajo Area on Aging Records Management Information Cooridnator/DCD

## Document Preparation:

LSR Innovations, LLC

Larry Rodgers<br>Vera J. Tso<br>Jasper Rodgers

Editor

Research Assistant
GIS Specialist

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

2004 Contributors
Table of Contents
Preface
Editorialiii
viiDate of Chapter Certification
Common or Official Names of Navajo Nation Chapters ..... $\times$
Use of Census 2000 Disclaimer ..... xi
Table 1: Estimated Total Chapter Population: 2004 ..... 13
Page
Table 2: Total Chapter Resident Population: 2000
Table 3: Ranking of Chapters by Resident Population: 1990 \& 200014
Table 4: Indian Resident Population by Chapter over Three Decades ..... 16
Table 5: Profile of General Demographic Characteristics ..... 17
Table 6: Profile of Selected Social Characteristics ..... 19
Table 7: Profile of Selected Economic Characteristics ..... 21
Table 8: Profile of Selected Housing Characteristics ..... 23
Table 9: Number of NHA Housing Units by Management Office ..... 25
Table 10: Current Chapter Indian Population Estimates, Voting, and Housing ..... 26
Table 11: Navajo Nation and Chapter Government Properties ..... 28
Population, Housing, and Voting ..... 42
Page
Public Facilities
Educational Facilities ..... 44
Communication Services ..... 45
Transportation: Airstrips and Bus Service ..... 46
Recreational Facitities ..... 47
Natural Resources ..... 48
DS Page05 Birdsprings 49
08 Kayenta ..... age
84
03 Bodaway/Gap ..... 53
01 Lechee ..... 89
03 Cameron ..... 57
08 Chilchinbeto ..... 61
03 Coalmine Canyon ..... 64
01 Copper Mine ..... 68
08 Dennehotso ..... 72
02 inscription House ..... 76
01 Kaibeto ..... 80
05 Leupp ..... 93
02 Navajo Mountain ..... 97
08 Oljato ..... 101
02 Shonto ..... 105
05 Tolani Lake ..... 109
01 Tonalea ..... 113
03 Tuba City ..... 117

## CHiNLE

Population, Housing, and Voting

## 122

Public Facilities
123Educational Facilities
Communication Services ..... 125
Transportation: Airstrips and Bus Service ..... 126
Recreational Facitities ..... 127
Natural Resources ..... 128
DS Page DS ..... Page
04 Black Mesa 12904 Pinon ..... 157
10 Chinle ..... 133
10 Rough Rock ..... 161
04 Forest Lake 11 Round Rock ..... 164
04 Hard Rock ..... 141
04 Tachee/Blue Gap ..... 168
11 Lukachukai ..... 145
10 Many Farms ..... 149
10 Nazlini ..... 153
10 Tselani/Cottonwood ..... 171
11 Wheatfields/Tsaile ..... 175
04 Whippoorwill Spring ..... 179
FORT DEFIANCE ..... PagePopulation, Housing, and Voting
Public Facilities ..... 185
Educational Facilities ..... 186
Communication Services ..... 187
Transportation: Airstrips and Bus Service ..... 188
Recreational Facitities ..... 189
Natural Resources ..... 190
DS Page ..... 191
14 Coyote Canyon ..... 195
18 Crystal ..... 199
07 Dilkon ..... 203
18 Fort Defiance ..... 207
17 Ganado ..... 212
17 Greasewood Springs ..... 216
18 Houck ..... 220
07 Indian Wells ..... 224
07 Jeddito ..... 228
17 Kinlichee ..... 232
17 Klagetoh ..... 236
07 Low Mountain ..... 240
18 Lupton ..... 244
14 Mexican Springs ..... 248
18 Nahata Dziil ..... 252
14 Naschitti ..... 257
18 Oak/Pine Springs ..... 261
18 Red Lake ..... 265
18 Saint Michaels ..... 269
18 Sawmill ..... 273
17 Steamboat ..... 277
07 Teestoh ..... 281
14 Tohatchi ..... 285
14 Twin Lakes ..... 290
07 White Cone ..... 294
17 Wide Ruins ..... 298


| $C T] N$ S CHAPTER |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Navajo name: Ch'inili |  |  |
| Interpretation: Flowing out (inference to stream from mouth of canyon) |  |  |
| Indian Population: |  | 4,893 |
|  |  | 7,000 |
|  |  | 8,294 |
| Estimated land size: | dize: $\quad 114,655.60$ | Acres |
| Land Management District : | ment District : | 10 |
| GOVERNMENT |  |  |
| Number of Chapter NNC delega | apter NNC delegate(s): | 3 |
| Number of police officers for wh | ice officers for whole dist.: | 44 |
| Other police personnel: | ersonnel: | 22 |
| Navajo Police district office cov Chinle District | district office covering Chapter: District |  |
| Tribal offices providing services in Chapter: |  |  |
| Dept of Head Start Veterans Administration |  |  |
| Women, Infants \& Children Land Administration |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| Division of Social Services Americorp Prog |  |  |
| Dept of Behavioral Health Youth Dev Srvs |  |  |
| Senior Citizens Center Head Start |  |  |
| Foster Grandparents Program New Dawn |  |  |
| Dept. of Employment and Training NTUA |  |  |
| Chinle Agency Chapter Support Services NHARegional Business Development Office |  |  |
|  |  |  |

## MEDICAL

Hospital(s) \& clinic(s) where most Chapter people go:

| Hospital | Town |
| :--- | :--- |
| Chinle Indian Hospital | Chinle, AZ |
| Sage Memorial Hospital | Ganado, AZ |
| Clinic | Town |
| Many Farms Heath Station | Many Farms, AZ |
| Tsaile Health Center | Tsaile, AZ |

Other Clinics in Chinle: Long-Term Health Care Allied Medical Supplies Dialysis Unit Total Renal Care Chiropractic Clinic

## EDUCATION

Total enrollment by school (Fall of 2003):

## School <br> Enrolled

Pre-School and Homebase 80
Kindergarten Center 230
Chinle Junior High School 580
Chinle High School $\quad 1,240$

COMMUNICATIONS
Regular TV reception; stations received.

| Call Letters | Town |
| :---: | :---: |
| KOAT | Albuquerque, NM |
| KOBF | Farmington, NM |
| KRQE | Albuquerque, NM |
| KASA | Santa Fe, NM |

Clear AM radio stations received.
Call Letters Iown
KTNN Window Rock, AZ

KGAK Gallup, NM
KNDN Farmington, NM
KHAC Tse Bonito, NM
Clear FM radio stations received:
Call Letters Town
KISZ Cortez, CO
KVNA Flagstaff, AZ
KRZE Farmington, NM
KKOR Gallup, NM
KFXR (KGLX) Chinle, AZ (Gallup, NM)
Newspaper received within the Chapter :
Name of Paper Iown
The Independent Gallup, NM
Navajo Times Window Rock, AZ
Arizona Republic Phoenix, AZ

## civic

Churches:

| Name of Church | Est'dMembership <br> Catholic Church |
| :--- | ---: |
| Presbyterian Church | 200 |
| Church of Latter Day Saints | 60 |
| Seventh Day Adventist | 800 |
| Potter's House | 50 |
|  | 45 |

Indigenous:
Traditional Navajo Religion
Native American Church 200
Active community organizations:
Canyon De Cheily Artists Association

## COMMERCIAL

Available establishments in the Chapter:

Restaurants, regular ..... 3
Fast Food Restaurants ..... 6
Motels; with 400 total rooms ..... 3
Gas Stations ..... 4
Convenient Stores ..... 4
Super Markets ..... 2
General Store ..... 1
Arts and Crafts Store ..... 2
Video Shops ..... 4
Laundromats ..... 3
Horseback Riding Stables ..... 1
Insurance ..... 1

CHINLE CHAPTER (Continued)
Gift Shops ..... 4
Bank ..... 1
Tire Sales and Repair ..... 1
Septic Services ..... 1
Cellular Phone Services ..... 1
TRANSPORTATIONPaved roads through the chapter area:
US Route 191
Navajo Route 64
Navajo Route 7
TRANSPORTATION (Continued)
Distances to:
Agency: Chinle 0 miles
Window Rock (Via Ganado) 68 miles(Via Tsaile) 76 miles
Gallup, NM91 miles
MAJOR EMPLOYERS
No. of
Name of Employer ..... Employees
Park Services ..... 29
Bureau of Indian Affairs ..... 150
Public Schools ..... 527
Navajo Nation ..... 600
NTUA ..... 44
Navajo Communications Co ..... 9
Apache County (St.) ..... 20
Matels (3) ..... 120
IHS ..... 409
Tsegi Shopping Center ..... 155

## LOCAL NATURAL RESOURCES

Canyon De Chelly and other nearby scenic areas; water run-off.

## COMMUNITY/COOPERATIVE FARMING

$\begin{array}{lr}\text { Name of farm project. } & \text { Chinle Valley Project } \\ \text { Year farm was established: } & 1964 \\ \text { Approximate size of farm: } & \text { 1,000 Acres }\end{array}$
The farm project is currently active and it has a farm board.
Estimated number of family farms: 50

## BRIEF OVERVIEW OF CHAPTER

In 1864, the infamous Kit Carson crusade assured the Navajo stronghold communities of Chinle and Tsegi were destroyed. Resisting groups of Navajos were massacred. Livestock were slaughtered. Hogans, orchards and fields were burned. Using these brutal methods, Carson and the U. S. Cavalry had Navajos succumb to the devastation and surrendering. After four years of captivity at Fort Sumner, New Mexico, the Navajo
people were allowed to return back to a confined part of the original Navajo land.

One of the first trading posts in Chinle was established in 1882 by a Spanish American, named Nakai Yazhi by the local Navajos.

Chinle was noted for agriculture and grazing in the late 1800s and early 1900s; these trades are still practiced by the local Navajo farmers, influencing nearby areas such as Many Farms and the Chinle Valley. A bill authorizing the establishment of Canyon de Chelly as a National Monument was signed by President Herbert Hoover on February 14, 1931. The Tsegi (canyon) has several Anasazi ruins, notably the White House, Mummy, and Massacre Cave ruins. These and other ruins are protected by the National Park Service. Spider Rock is an attraction within the canyon. Most of the park area is within the boundaries of the Chinle Chapter, but is operated by the National Park Service.

The Chinle Health Care Facility was opened in August of 1983. Other facilities include the Navajo Land Nursing Home for adults and Chinle Valley School for exceptional children. The Chinle community hosts numerous Tribal, Federal, and State offices to operate programs and provide services. As a primary growth center, Chinle serves as a regional hub for government, health, social, and business services.

The 65,000 square-foot Tseyi' Shopping Center has expanded three times since it opened in 1981 and has the largest sales volume of any of the Navajo Nation shopping centers. This commercial complex is owned and operated by DCl Shopping Center, Inc., a subsidiary of Dineh Cooperatives, Inc. Further expansion of the center would provide for additional space for Navajo-owned businesses. Due to its unique master lease, DCl is able to process leases with tenants more quickly than is possible elsewhere within the Navajo Nation.

Chinle Chapter is now the second largest Navajo Nation population after Shiprock Chapter according to Census 2000.

This Chapter information was updated by.
Name Ielephone No. '92 \& '96 Timothy Begay, CSC 520/674-2054
'92 Jon Colvin. Pres./CEO of DCI

## CHINLE

Selected Characteristics from Census 2000


|  | Number | Percent |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| SCHOOL ENROLLMENT |  |  |
| Population 3 years \& over | 3746 | 100.0 |
| Nursery school, preschool | 196 | 5.2 |
| Kindergaten | 258 | 6.9 |
| Elem school (grades 1-8) | 1946 | 51.9 |
| High school (grades 9-12) | 821 | 21.9 |
| College or graduate school | 525 | 14.0 |
| EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT |  |  |
| Population 25 years \& over | 4.101 | 100.0 |
| Less than 9th grade | 831 | 20.3 |
| 9th to 12th grd, no diploma | 942 | 23.0 |
| High school grad (inc GED) | 868 | 21.2 |
| Some college, no degree | 710 | 17.3 |
| Associate degree | 259 | 6.3 |
| Bachelor's degree | 237 | 5.8 |
| Graduate/professional deg | 254 | 6.2 |
| Perc HS graduate/higher | 56.8 | (X) |
| Perc bachelor's deg/higher | 12 | (X) |


| EMPLOYMENT STATUS |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Population 16 years \& over | 5,386 | 100.0 |
| In labor force | 2736 | 50.8 |
| Civilian labor force | 2736 | 50.8 |
| Employed | 1872 | 34.8 |
| Unemployed | 864 | 16.0 |
| Percent Unemployed | 31.6 | (X) |
| Not in labor lorce | 2650 | 49.2 |
| COMMUTING TO WORK |  |  |
| Workers 16 years \& over | 1826 | 100.0 |
| Carmrucklvan(drove alone) | 1066 | 58.4 |
| Car/rucklvan -- carpooled | 414 | 22.7 |
| Public transportation | 14 | 0.8 |
| Walked | 257 | 14.1 |
| Other means | 54 | 3.0 |
| Worked at home | 21 | 1.2 |
| Travel time to work (minutes) | 23.5 | (X) |
| CLASS OF WORKER |  |  |
| Private wage/alalay workers | 826 | 44.1 |
| Government workers | 1007 | 53.8 |
| Sell-employed workers | 35 | 1.9 |
| Unpaid lamily workers | 4 | 0.2 |
| INCOME IN 1999 |  |  |
| No. of Households | 2210 | 100.0 |
| Median household incorne | \$24,282 | (X) |
| No. of Families | 1764 | 100.0 |
| Median family income | \$23.346 | (X) |
| Per capita income | \$7,997 | (X) |
| Median eamings: |  |  |
| Male full-time, year-round | \$25.064 | (X) |
| Fernale full-time, year-round | \$23.315 | (X) |
| POVERTY STATUS IN 1999 |  |  |
| No. \& (\%) of famites in poverty | 762 | 43.2 |
| No. \& (\%) of persons in poverty | 3.925 | 45.6 |


|  | Number | Percent |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Total housing unis | 2957 | 100.0 |
| UNITS IN STRUCTURE |  |  |
| 1 -unit. detached | 1481 | 50.1 |
| 1-unlt, attached | 353 | 11.9 |
| 2 units | 150 | 5.1 |
| 3 or 4 units | 142 | 4.8 |
| 5 to 9 units | 106 | 3.6 |
| 10 to 19 units | 5 | 0.2 |
| 20 or more units | 8 | 0.3 |
| Mobile home | 686 | 23.2 |
| YEAR STRUCTURE BUILT |  |  |
| 1998 to March 2000 | 55 | 1.9 |
| 1995 to 1998 | 364 | 12.3 |
| 1990 to 1994 | 224 | 7.6 |
| 1980 to 1989 | 837 | 28.3 |
| 1970 to 1979 | 848 | 28.7 |
| 1960 to 1969 | 379 | 12.8 |
| 1940 to 1959 | 188 | 6.3 |
| 1939 or earlier | 64 | 2.2 |
| ROOMS |  |  |
| Median (rooms) | 3.2 | (X) |
| VEhicles available |  |  |
| None | 443 | 20.1 |
| 1 | 937 | 42.6 |
| 2 | 518 | 23.5 |
| 3 or more | 303 | 13.8 |
| HOUSE HEATING FUEL |  |  |
| Utility gas | 456 | 20.7 |
| Bottled, tank, or LP gas | 323 | 14.7 |
| Electricity | 330 | 15.0 |
| Fuei oll, kerosene, etc. | 5 | 0.2 |
| Coal or coke | 8 | 0.4 |
| Wood | 1010 | 45.9 |
| Solar energy | 0 | 0.0 |
| Other fuel | 55 | 2.5 |
| No fuel used | 14 | 0.6 |
| PLUMBING \& TELEPHONE |  |  |
| Lacking complete plumbling | 584 | 26.5 |
| Lacking kitchen facilities | 446 | 20.3 |
| No telephone service | 1032 | 46.9 |
| OCCUPANTS PER ROOM |  |  |
| Occupied housing units | 2201 | 100.0 |
| 1.00 or lest | 1241 | 56.4 |
| 1.01 to 1.50 | 412 | 18.7 |
| 1.51 or more | 548 | 24.9 |
| MORTGAGE \& RENT |  |  |
| Owner-occupled units | 748 | 100.0 |
| VALUE in Median dollars | \$22,700 | (X) |
| With a mortgage | 35 | 4.7 |
| Median mortgage payments | \$593 | (X) |
| Renter-occupled units | 833 | 100.0 |
| No cash rent | 244 | 29.3 |
| Median rent payments | \$293 | (X) |

[^2]
## EXHIBIT - F



 EXHBL






## Community Based Land Use Plan Certification Certificate

Having reviewed the Chinle Chapter Community Based-Land Use Plan and having Met the requirements under 26 N.N.C. §102(C),

The Transportation \& Community Development Committee hereby certifies the Chinle Chapter's Community Based Land Use Plan. The Chapter is to exercise authorities pursuant to the rules and regulations as promulgated by the Resources Committee and the Economic Development Committee, 26 N.N.C. § 103 (D)(1).


## Chinle Chapter Govermment

Community Land Use Planning Committee

| President | Vice President | Secretary | Member | Member | Member | Member |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Stanley Robbins | Leo R. Begay | Corina Morales | Jocelyn <br> Billy-Upshaw | Anderson Jones | Eugene Tso | James Jones |

## RESOLUTION OF THE CHINLE LAND USE PLANNING COMMITTEE NAVAJO NATION <br> CLUPC-DEC-29-16-24

## RECOMMENDING TO THE CHINLE CHAPTER GOVERNMENT THE CHINLE CHAPTER LAND USE PLANNING COMMITTEE'S (CLUPC) FIVE YEAR LAND USE PLAN UPDATE

## WHEREAS:

1. Pursuant to Navajo Nation Council Resolution CAP-34-98, Title 26 NNC Local Governance Act Chinle Chapter established and certified Chinle Land Use Planning Committee (CLUPC) to advise and recommend Chinle Chapter Government regarding land use issues; AND
2. Chinle CLUPC is established to update, identify local land use, transportation, environmental, economic, social goals and policies as they relate to land use development and revitalization direction; AND
3. Chinle CLUPC provides every five (5) years an update on the Chinle Land Use Plan that provide guidance to the Community Land Use Planning activities for future development and projects; AND
4. Chinle CLUPC Five (5) year update is approved at a regular Chinle Chapter Meeting, which then comprises the activities in the Chinle Community.

## NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT:

1. The Chinle CLUPC is recommending to Chinle Chapter Government its five year Chinle Land Use Plan update.

## CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that the foregoing resolution was considered by the Chinle Land Use Planning committee of the Chinle Chapter at a duly called meeting at which a quorum was present and that the same was passed by a vote of 4 in favor _ 0 _opposed and ___ abstain, on this 29th day December, 2016.

Motion By: Eugene Tso
Second By: James Jones

# Chinle Chapter Government 

Andy R. Ayze

PRESIDENT

Myron McLaughlin

VICE PRESIDENT

Leonard Pete<br>COUNCIL DELEGATE

## RESOLUTION OF THE CHINLE CHAPTER NAVAJO NATION

CHIN-JAN-17-008

## APPROVING THE CHINLE CHAPTER LAND USE PLANNING COMMITTEES (CLUPC) FIVE YEAR LAND USE PLAN UPDATE

## WHEREAS:

1. The Chinle Chapter, a recognized certified local government of the Navajo Nation, vested with the power and authority to advocate on behalf of its constituents for the improvement of health, education, safety, and general welfare; and
2. Pursuant to the Navajo Nation Council Resolution CAP-34-98, Title 26 NNC Local Governance Act Chinle Chapter established and certified Chinle Land Use Planning Committee (CLUPC) to advise and recommend to Chinle Chapter Government regarding land use issues; and
3. Chinle CLUPC provides an update on the Chinle Land Use Plan every five (5) years to provide guidance to the community land use planning activities for future development and projects.

## NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT:

1. The Chinle Chapter hereby approves the Chinle Chapter Land Use Planning Committee's (CLUPC) Five Year Land Use Plan Update.

## CERTIFICATION

We, hereby certify that the foregoing chapter resolution was duty considered by the Chinle Chapter at a duly called meeting in Chine, Navajo Nation (Arizona) at which a quorum was present and that the same was passed by a vote of 23 in favor, $\varnothing$ opposed, and 2 abstained, this $9^{\text {th }}$ day of January 2017.
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

cynthia Hunter, Secretary/ Treasurer

# Chinle Chapter Government 

Myron McLaughlin
PRESIDENT

David Yazzie, Jr.
VICE PRESIDENT

Leonard H. Pete<br>COUNCIL DELEGATE

Eugene Ts<br>GRAZING COMMITTEE MEMBER

February 9, 2017

Alton Joe Shepherd, Chairperson
Resources \& Development Committee
$23^{\text {rd }}$ Navajo Nation Council
PO Box 3390
Window Rock, AZ 86515

RE: Submittal of Chinle Chapter's Land Use Plan for re-certification by RDC

Honorable Shepherd;

The Chine Chapter is submitting its updated Land Use Plan, which is titled, "Chine Chapter Government - Comprehensive Land Use Plan, December 2016," for consideration and action by the Resources \& Development Committee for re-certification. The submission of our document will begin the legislative process needed for this undertaking as well as having it undergo the 5 day public comment period.

Within our submission, we have also included reference material and background information in regards to the Chine Chapter Boundary, which the Chine Chapter formally approved April 17, 2016 through chapter resolution $C H$ IN APR -16-030 and additional Background information is attached.

Therefore through our submission of the packet, we respectfully request of Office of Legislation Counsel to draft the legislation asrequired and Delegate Leonard $H_{\star}$ Pete will be the primary sponsor. Thank you for your time and consideration; if any additional questions are needed please bring them forth to the Chine Chapter at 928-674-2052.

Signed,


Cc: CCG File; CCG Officials; CCG Administration; Leonard H. Pete, Chile Council Delegate; Shammie Begay, RDC Legislative Advisor


[^0]:    *The Rating Score is the weighted average calculated by dividing the sum of all weighted ratings by the number of total responses.

[^1]:    * ${ }^{\text {facility: }}$

[^2]:    Source: United Staies Census 2000; Extracted and formatted by LSR Innovations: November 2003

